URBAN LABORATORY 1996/97

EAST LIBERTY URBAN REBUILDING

VOLUME TWO: ARCHITECTURAL, ECONOMIC, AND PUBLIC POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS

Bachelor of Architecture Program and H. John Heinz III School of Public Policy, Carnegie Mellon University, Pittsburgh, PA - Spring Semester, 1996
This publication is Volume Two of the two volume report by students in the Department of Architecture and the H. John Heinz III School of Public Policy and Management.

Nineteen students combined to form a two semester urban laboratory. The focus of their study is the central area of East Liberty in the City of Pittsburgh.

Volume One was devoted to the analysis of existing issues, the development of an interdisciplinary program, and the formulation of comprehensive urban design and public policy recommendations.

Volume Two is devoted to ten detailed architectural, economic, and public policy recommendations covering the entire central areas of East Liberty.

As with Volume One, we are happy to offer our two reports to the City, the public agencies, and the citizens of East Liberty in the hope that some of our ideas, recommendations, and designs might be useful catalysts in the ongoing effort to revitalize this crucially important area of the City and the communities surrounding it.

Mark Wessel,
Associate Dean,
H. John Heinz III School of Public Policy and Management,
Carnegie Mellon University.

David Lewis
Distinguished Professor of Urban Studies,
Department of Architecture,
Carnegie Mellon University.

Michael Arnold,
Holly Egan,
Adrian Lebuffe
Editors
(L to R): Michael Arnold, Holly Egan, Jackson Tam, Choli Lightfoot, Nancy King, Snehal Avichal, Matthew Porta, Adrian Le Buffe, Marc Aragon, Jennifer Buck, Tamara Mhone

Not Pictured: Akoss Schuppius, Gail Reid, Hughlin Boyd, Harriet Muir, Nathan Hart, and Josh Wisch
TABLE OF CONTENTS

PROPOSALS

Community College............................................................................................................................................ 9
Community Center ........................................................................................................................................... 31
Residential Rebuilding .................................................................................................................................... 58
Environmentally Sustainable Housing and Industry ................................................................................. 91
A Consulate for San Salvador ................................................................................................................... 103
East Liberty’s Central Area ....................................................................................................................... 109
A Consulate for Switzerland .................................................................................................................. 149
A Transportation Center and Market ..................................................................................................... 165
A Commercial Center for East Liberty .................................................................................................. 181
A Consulate for Israel and a Residential Area .......................................................................................... 201
A branch campus for the Community College of Allegheny County is to be located in East Liberty on the Sears site. Except for one three story brick building, the entire site is to be raised and the college would be located in a campus of new buildings.

The site is an ideal location for a campus in East Liberty. It is centrally located within the community. Located halfway between two new residential developments and adjacent to other learning facilities, namely Peabody High School and the Theological Center. The site is within a five minute walk of the new transportation center. Making it easy for students living outside East Liberty to commute via the busway.

Currently the Sears site lies unoccupied in a sea of asphalt. This situation isn't unique to this site, it really defines the case in most of East Liberty. East Liberty is a community that has been disconnected from itself by impassible roads, substandard housing, and poor opportunities to make change. It is this last point the college directly addresses. East Liberty was once a healthy community, but today lies sick and malnourished. This is unfortunate considering that there are so
Design Proposals

Community College of Allegheny County:
East Liberty Branch Campus

Matthew Porta

many people that live in East Liberty that want to make changes, they just lack the means, financial and political, to get things started. It is in this vision, a vision of future and opportunity, that the community college has come about.

The college campus organization and the academic curriculum are organized to overcome many of the obstacles East Liberty faces. The campus plan addresses the need for public outdoor green space and reflects the importance trees play in a community. There is a quarter mile outdoor running trail and an informal amphitheater. The site is designed with the pedestrian and the car in mind. There is a 180 car parking garage located on the northeast corner of the site with access off of Sheridan street, which also serves as the service road for the campus. The design recognizes that the majority of students using the college would arrive to campus as pedestrians. Well lit and planted walkways bring students to the campus from all cardinal points of the compass. Street intersections are designed to make pedestrian passibility not only easy but a priority. Pedestrians have a turn at each of the stop lights. There are direct connections to Peabody High School and the Vintage Center.
The campus is divided programatically into five parts. 1) The technology center. 2) Sports and recreation. 3) Administrative and health and human services. 4) Education center: classrooms and laboratories. 5) The heart of the campus: the student center and main lecture hall.
The architecture of the college is one that recognizes the past and reflects the future. The first story along Highland Ave. pays adherence to the established East Liberty brick storefront, while the second story is a sign of the future. The use of the modern materials of concrete block and corrugated steel as cladding, and the cantilever of the floor over the walkway is an architectural design decision to mark the awakening of East Liberty and its entrance into the 21st century.
Community College of Allegheny County: East Liberty Campus

A full branch of the Community College of Allegheny College is to be located on the Sears site in East Liberty. The college will not only serve as an opportunity for high school graduates to pursue an associates degree, but will also serve as a job skill training center. It will act as a social hub for the East Liberty area. The college will provide the economic base that will spawn new commercial growth. A number of small retail spaces as well as restaurants and bars would be located within the campus master plan.

The college has an architectural program near 120,000 sq. ft. The estimated cost for the entire college is $23 million, this includes the purchase of the site and the demolition of the Sears building. The college will be built in phases. An existing building on the site will be renovated into classrooms and the college will open its doors before the entire campus construction is completed. The college includes facilities for education, administration, student activities, public and social services, vocation and technical training and the service spaces needed to maintain the school.

The campus is linked directly to many of the other project proposals for the East Liberty area. It is immediate adjacent to the community center, where are relationship will be established to allow students to use the indoor athletic facilities and the day care. The transportation center will serve as important link for commuter students and faculty. New housing developments will not only serve as the function of housing for students, but the school will serve the developments through construction science training. The CCAC - East Liberty is not only a place of higher education but an important economic and social anchor for the area.

CCAC - EAST LIBERTY 119,509 ft²

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education</th>
<th>27,837 ft²</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Class Room</td>
<td>11,542 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class Room Service</td>
<td>350 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class Laboratory</td>
<td>6,188 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class Laboratory Service</td>
<td>264 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special Class Laboratory Service</td>
<td>1,452 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special Class Laboratory Service</td>
<td>250 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual Study Lab</td>
<td>500 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual Study Lab Service</td>
<td>100 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non Class Laboratory</td>
<td>500 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non Class Laboratory Service</td>
<td>50 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstration</td>
<td>1,000 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstration Service</td>
<td>200 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assembly Auditorium</td>
<td>2,317 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assembly Auditorium Service</td>
<td>424 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer Cluster</td>
<td>2,400 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer Cluster Service</td>
<td>300 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Library</td>
<td>3,224 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.V. / Radio / TV</td>
<td>350 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.V. / Radio / TV Service</td>
<td>286 ft²</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Design Proposals
Community College of Allegheny County: East Liberty Branch Campus
Matthew Porta

### Administration

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Square Feet</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Faculty Office</td>
<td>1,098 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty Office Service</td>
<td>90 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrative Office</td>
<td>1,599 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrative Office Service</td>
<td>100 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clerical Office</td>
<td>1,738 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clerical Office Service</td>
<td>48 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conference Room</td>
<td>907 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conference Room Service</td>
<td>60 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Placement Office</td>
<td>1,600 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Placement Office Service</td>
<td>100 ft²</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Student Activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Square Feet</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Student Activities Office</td>
<td>2,000 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Activities Office Service</td>
<td>100 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lounge</td>
<td>2,317 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lounge Service</td>
<td>424 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recreation</td>
<td>2,000 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recreation Service</td>
<td>100 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meeting Room</td>
<td>300 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meeting Room Service</td>
<td>50 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locker Room</td>
<td>1,600 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapel</td>
<td>400 ft²</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Vocational - Technical Training

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Square Feet</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Wood Shop</td>
<td>2,500 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wood Shop Service</td>
<td>350 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welding Shop</td>
<td>2,400 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CADD Laboratory</td>
<td>800 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction Science</td>
<td>3,600 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Automotive Shop</td>
<td>3,300 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public and Social Services</td>
<td>16,896 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clinic (Non Health Profession)</td>
<td>600 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clinic Service</td>
<td>100 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Care Facilities:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patient Bedroom</td>
<td>314 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patient Bathroom</td>
<td>90 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nurse Station</td>
<td>314 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treatment</td>
<td>314 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supply</td>
<td>300 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Waiting</td>
<td>314 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Care Service</td>
<td>400 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Merchandising Facilities</td>
<td>2,000 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Merchandising Facilities Service</td>
<td>150 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commercial (Non CCAC)</td>
<td>12,000 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building Category</td>
<td>Area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Campus Service Storage</td>
<td>19,695 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Storage Service</td>
<td>1,278 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vehicle Storage Facility</td>
<td>100 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vehicle Storage Facility Service</td>
<td>1,200 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central Food Stores</td>
<td>200 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central Laundry</td>
<td>400 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Circulation Area</td>
<td>200 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Custodial Area</td>
<td>7,638 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mechanical Area</td>
<td>266 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structural Area</td>
<td>3,461 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4,952 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Athletic Facilities</strong></td>
<td>25,500 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gymnasium</td>
<td>11,000 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equipment Storage</td>
<td>1,000 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Racquetball Courts</td>
<td>3,000 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fitness Room</td>
<td>2,000 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weight Room</td>
<td>2,000 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cardiovascular Room</td>
<td>1,500 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exercise Room Service</td>
<td>500 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locker Room</td>
<td>4,000 ft²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locker Room Service</td>
<td>500 ft²</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Community College of Allegheny County: East Liberty Branch Campus
Matthew Porta
Work Force Development as An Economic Revitalization Tool: A Proposal to Establish the East Liberty Community College of Allegheny County

Submitted by Harriette Muir and S. Gail Reid
Introduction

East Liberty has been identified as one of Pittsburgh's more distressed neighborhoods. Once heralded as Pittsburgh's "Second Downtown", the neighborhood is now considered one of the city's most blighted urban eyesores. In the 1960s, Pittsburgh pursued an urban renewal strategy which targeted development of the commercial corridor, but it failed. It has become evident that a more holistic strategy for development is required. Work force and educational development is an important component of this revitalization strategy for East Liberty.

A combination of present demographics and current trends in the labor market inspired the concept of establishing a community education center in East Liberty. This is in direct response to the disproportionate number of East Liberty residents who are either unemployed or underemployed. We propose the development of a community educational center. Specifically, we propose the establishment of a CCAC full service campus in East Liberty. This campus will address the needs of the local community while simultaneously expanding the scope of services provided by the Community College of Allegheny County.

There are several factors which inspired the pursuit of this project. These issues are: changing trends in the economy, employer work force needs, welfare reform, and community demographics.

The Changing Economy

An examination of the national and regional economies revealed several trends which proffers the need for work force and educational development as an important revitalization strategy for East Liberty.

National Economy

America's transition from a mass production oriented economy to a high performance economy has dramatically impacted employer work force needs. Employers in the new economy are increasingly dependent upon laborers who possess a variety of skills. Additionally, technological innovation, in many instances, has decreased the overall number of laborers that employers are seeking.

Table 1: The Ten occupations with the largest job growth (000s)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th>Employment 2005</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Janitors and cleaners, including maids</td>
<td>4,374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salesperson and retail</td>
<td>3,602</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cashiers</td>
<td>3,567</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General managers and top executives</td>
<td>3,512</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Registered nurses</td>
<td>2,379</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waiters and waitresses</td>
<td>2,326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nursing aids, orderlies and attendants</td>
<td>1,625</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guards</td>
<td>1,282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Systems Analysts</td>
<td>928</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home Health Aides</td>
<td>848</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics

However, technology has had its impact on work force requirements. Thus, regardless of the industry, employers are seeking the same basic skills from the work force.

Table 2: The Ten fastest growing occupations (US) Employment 2005

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th>Employment 2005</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Systems Analysts</td>
<td>928</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home Health aides</td>
<td>848</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal and home care aides</td>
<td>391</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer engineers</td>
<td>372</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Services workers</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residential Counselors</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Therapists</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical and corrective therapy assistants</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electronic pagination systems workers</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupational Therapy assistance and aides</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS)

The Bureau of Labor Statistics 1994-2005 projections indicate that the service-producing industries will account for virtually all of the job growth (see Table 1). Only construction will add jobs in the goods-producing sector. Manufacturing is
expected to account for just less than one in every eight jobs in 2005. Health Services, business services, and social services are expected to account for almost one of every two jobs added to the economy during this period.

Approximately one out of every eight jobs created will not require a college degree while two-thirds will call for no more than a high school diploma. Although most of the jobs in these sectors will require less formal education, they will only provide low wages. The low-wage jobs of the new economy cannot pay the rent. Currently, a full time job at $7 an hour provides wages of $14,500 per year. With average rent and utilities consuming approximately 40% of income, there remains $8,000 to support the standard household. Therefore the nation trends, targeting low income jobs, would not enable families to support themselves.

In 1995, for example, the average wage in Pennsylvania for retail was $14,143 compared to $34,803 in manufacturing $34,945 in Transportation, communications and public utilities, $26,221 in Service industry, $31,536 in Government and $30,688 in construction. The wage rate of $14,143 for a household is still low-income, at the poverty line. Consequently programs should seek to train residents for industries that are targeted for growth and will pay moderate wages.

While employers are not necessarily seeking more laborers, the Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS) forecasts that the future supply of the labor force will increase by 16 million, from 131 million to 147 million over the 1994-2005 period. The demographic composition of the labor force is also expected to change as a result of overall changes in the population. The BLS anticipates that White non-Hispanic will account for two-thirds of the entrants into the work force. The Black and Hispanic labor forces are projected to become equal in size as more Hispanics than blacks will enter the labor force over the 1994-2005 period.

As the “baby-boom” generation changes, the labor force of 55 years of age and older will grow faster than the younger labor force. The labor force ages 25 to 34 years, is projected to decline by almost 4 million. In 1992 the size of the world’s labor force was close to 1.76 billion people. By 2025, if current trends stay the same it is anticipated to increase by 38 to 40 million new jobs.

These statistics suggests that there will be a gap in the prime labor force (ages 25 to 34). Additionally, training will be required to assist the aging work force (55 years and older) to acquire the job skills necessary for the new economy.

The Regional Economy

The City of Pittsburgh has been heavily impacted by the technological changes that have transformed the global market place. During the 1960s, the economic mix of Pittsburgh’s business industry possessed two distinctive features:

- an overspecialization in coal, iron and steel, heavy electrical machinery, glass, clay and stone products,
- a concentration of the labor force in the large plants required for those activities.

In 1960, the metal industries alone employed 125,000 workers in Pittsburgh. This represented two-fifths of manufactur-
turing output. US Steel, for example, now produces more steel and at a higher quality with fewer workers.

The decline in the steel industry and the pressure placed on remaining businesses forced Pittsburgh officials to assess the region and outline a plan for restructuring. Using a sectorial strategy of economic development, Pittsburgh is now building on its manufacturing industry. The city is supporting industries with a small regional presence and a demonstrated potential for significant growth. These areas, include manufacturing, high technology and six key industry clusters—metalworking; chemicals and plastics; biomedical; information and communication products and services; environmental products; and services.

The City of Pittsburgh now has a diverse employment market. Over the past ten years, high technology, health care and service sector employment have grown remarkably. Presently, the city’s work force numbers 314,757 and of that, 155,000 (50%) work in downtown Pittsburgh.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Industry Sector</th>
<th>Total Jobs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hospitals</td>
<td>37,311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Higher Education</td>
<td>32,560</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government</td>
<td>31,517</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial Institutions</td>
<td>18,535</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utilities and Transportation</td>
<td>10,800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restaurant, Caterers and Taverns</td>
<td>10,571</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>10,385</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Temporary Agency and Services</td>
<td>8,527</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health care and Services</td>
<td>8,426</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miscellaneous Business</td>
<td>8,226</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Department of Finance, City of Pittsburgh

One key component for the success of this revitalization strategy is human resources. It has been stated that while Pennsylvania’s work force is hard working, the work force lacks the basic skills and training to meet the needs of the high performance business climate.7 The City of Pittsburgh grapples with other issues. With the migration of the labor force during the restructuring of the steel industry, the current labor is not enough to support the transition.

These national and regional trends and statistics pinpoint the key issues that work force training programs in East Liberty should address.

Although trends indicate continued job growth in the economy, the bulk of these positions will provide low wages. Because of the prevailing low income status of most of East Liberty’s residents, this is of particular concern. Therefore, training in East Liberty should be targeted to providing skills for moderate wage jobs.

Currently East Liberty has one of the largest concentrations of minority laborers in the city of Pittsburgh. Both national and local trends suggest increased competition for jobs between minorities and non-minorities. The composition of the work force to be two thirds White Non-Hispanic by 2005, east liberty minority population—2/3 labor force white—more competitive in Pittsburgh. Some economic development agencies have even projected recruitment of "specialized professional and technical talent from outside the region."8

The East Liberty community has a large population of individual age 55 years and above. Overall, Pittsburgh has a gap compared to other top MSAs in terms of its young people between the ages of 20 and 34. From 1985 to 1992, this population of youth in the Pittsburgh MSA declined by 13 percent. For education trainers and employers this means providing transition training for East Liberty’s older work force in order to maintain work force standards and providing them with the job skills needed for success in the new economy.

**Employer Work Force Needs**

As the changes in technology become more entrenched in society, work force needs in the marketplace continue to expand. Information is transferred rapidly across the globe and as such resulted in a more competitive market. Labor quality is now a top priority among businesses when considering sites for relocation, while there is less interest in tax abatements, infrastructures and structural incentives. Consequently, work force training—providing a skilled work force by improving the delivery of education and training—is now of paramount importance.

To remain competitive, companies need a highly skilled and adaptable work force. As society strives to provide workers for the new economy, it is important to assess the needs of companies. The key issues for companies in the 1990s are the skills of the work force. The American Society For...
Training and Development and the US Department of Labor’s Employment and Training Administration indicate that workers will need less job-specific skills and more generic skills.9

**General Skills**

- **Problem-Solving** One of the most important skills required in the knowledge-based economy is problem solving or creative thinking. As workers conduct their duties they are required to find new ways to improve processes and work with little supervision. Thus the ability to identify and define problems, formulate and implement solutions as well as monitor and evaluate results are critical skills.

- **Learning to Learn** In a knowledge-based economy workers must have strong cognitive. Such skills include possessing the flexibility and ability to learn the job. It also requires the abilities to know, understand respond to feeling and behaviors.

- **Communication** As companies restructure the factory floors or seek to improve customers process, the employees will be required to communicate their suggestions through a combination of speaking and effective listening skills. The ability to clearly convey thoughts and ideas is crucial.

- **Writing** Topic selection, spelling, penmanship and proofreading are important skills.

- **Group efficacy** The new knowledge based economy has a flatter hierarchical structure. Many companies, in an effort to cross train and stimulate new thought among workers have moved toward project-oriented teams. Consequently, interpersonal skills and negotiation skills are increasingly important.

- **Leadership** The move toward a project-based work environment, team-based and self-management approach, constitutes that the knowledge-based work force requires developmental skills that include self-esteem, goal setting, motivation, and personal and career development. Employees must also demonstrate the ability to influence others to achieve organizational goals.

- **Reading** Communication skills are important in the new economy which requires basic skills such as reading, writing and computation, short term memory and information processing.

- **As technology and its applications become entrenched in today’s economy, as companies find new ways to be competitive, the current as well as the emerging work force must have skills to participate in Work Force 2000. The table below indicates the percentage of employers who are seeking specific skills.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Skill or attribute desired in entry-level workers</th>
<th>Percentage of employers seeking the skill, often with little success</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Specific occupational skill</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People skills</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Math</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reliability</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honesty</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work ethic</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school graduate</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appearance</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Welfare Reform**

The recent changes in Welfare laws are destined to have significant impact throughout the United States. Areas, primarily inner city neighborhoods, that contain high densities of individuals receiving public assistance are likely to be disproportionately affected. Temporary Assistance for Needy Families (TANF) is the new federal legislation which officially replaced Federal Aid to Families with Dependent Children. Under the new legislation, TANF recipients will now be limited to the amount of assistance they receive. The changes in welfare that resulted from TANF are a five-year lifetime limit on cash assistance benefits and mandatory work requirements. 10

Pennsylvania TANF policy requires recipients to actively pursue work related activities during the first 24 months on TANF. Work related activities can include: job search; job readiness/job preparation programs; subsidized employment; work experience, on-the-job training; workfare; community service; or any employment and training program funded or approved by the Department of Public Welfare. For a maximum of 12 months, a recipient can also
use general and vocational education, English-as-a-second language or job skills training to meet their work requirement. The impact of the welfare changes will have great repercussions for community job training and development.

**Community Demographics**

The study area for this initiative includes, East Liberty, Homewood-Brushton, Garfield, Friendship, Highland Park, Morning Side, Larimer, Lincoln-Lemington-Belmar and Point Breeze, spanning four zip codes. These are all neighborhoods in Pittsburgh’s East End.

Source: 1990 Census of Population

The 1990 Census data reveal several characteristics of the work force in this study area. There are 67,675 total residents in the study area. Of residents 18 years and over, 26% not have a high school diploma while only 32% have only a high school degree.

Transportation is also a key issue for residents in these communities approximately 11,672 of residents use public transportation in these areas therefore it is important that most services in this area be within walking distance or have adequate public transportation service.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>1990 %</th>
<th>1992 %</th>
<th>1993 %</th>
<th>Total  %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Industry</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction</td>
<td>49.6</td>
<td>49.8</td>
<td>49.7</td>
<td>49.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>6.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wholesale &amp; Retail Trades</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>2.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entertainment</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Services</td>
<td>18.0</td>
<td>18.2</td>
<td>18.2</td>
<td>18.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational Services</td>
<td>13.2</td>
<td>13.3</td>
<td>13.2</td>
<td>13.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other professional and services</td>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>11.2</td>
<td>11.2</td>
<td>11.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The key industries targeted for growth were employed industries targeted for growth. Only 55% the employable work force had growth occupations. However, as previously mentioned most of these industries and occupation provide low-wage jobs which provide a minimal standard of living for a typical household.

*Design Proposals*

*Workforce Development as An Economic Revitalization Tool: A Proposal to Establish the East Liberty Community College of Allegheny County*

Submitted by Harriette Muir and S. Gail Reid

Over forty-two percent of households in these communities earn wages less than $20,000 per year. Approximately thirty percent of households have no earnings and another 16% require public assistance. Residents of these neighborhoods spend more than 26% of gross household income on wages. Consequently, with more than 40% of the households in this area live on a net income of approximately $15,000 per year.

These statistics indicate the following:

There are significant numbers of residents in the study area whose education levels have not prepared them for the moderate wages jobs in the economy. This is an important factor when 26% of gross household income is used for rent.

There are not enough residents employed in the key industries or occupations. This accompanied by evidence of a aging work force is a treat to the East Liberty economy. Companies in the area might be forced to relocate or higher work force from other communities. The results of any one of these actions would be a decline in the disposable income in the area.

Establishing the East Liberty Community College of Allegheny County

The changing trends in the national and local economies, employer work force needs, welfare reform, and community demographics places increased importance on work force training and development. Therefore community colleges and community-based organizations must reexamine their role and become catalyst for work force development. This is especially important for low-income communities such as East Liberty that have proportionately higher numbers of public assistance recipients. These educational institutions must become more aggressive, directed and progressive in their approach to customized training and become responsive to business, industry, and community needs.

Of great concern to many policy analysts is that the void between the low-skill minority work force — who have historically been disenfranchised— and the general public will widen as city revitalization strategies are implemented. This could have great ramifications in the City of Pittsburgh. In a 1996 report by Ralph Bangs, a Professor at the University of Pittsburgh, compared the racial disparity for African Americans in Pittsburgh to 50 similar large cities and counties in the US, found that employment and income conditions for white and blacks and the racial disparities in conditions in the city of Pittsburgh and Allegheny county in 1990 were among the worst in the nation. As the City of Pittsburgh restructures itself to become a haven for high-technology firms, the issues of racial disparity and polarization must be addressed or they will no doubt worsen. The East End of the City of Pittsburgh has one of the largest concentrations of the black population in the city. Work force training and development is a particularly important aspect for this area.

Thus the role of community colleges in the inner city is even more important, as they deal with a population which has been systematically disenfranchised. Having dealt directly with their communities, they more than local government are able to identify the strengths and weaknesses of their population, a task which goes beyond demographic statistics. The Community College of Allegheny County has been successfully fulfilling this mission for many years. For this reason CCAC was the most logical partner for the development of a comprehensive vocational and academic program in East Liberty.

The Community College of Allegheny County

The Community College of Allegheny County (CCAC), opened in the Fall of 1966, has been helping students plan their futures for almost 30 years. The college serves a number of communities offering classes at the Allegheny Campus, located in Pittsburgh's North Side; Boyce Campus, Monroeville; North Campus, North Hills; and South Campus, in West Mifflin. In addition to the main campuses, CCAC offers classes at eight off-campus centers. These sites include, Airport West, Bethel Park, Braddock, Downtown, Homewood-Brushton, Mon Valley Center, Neville Island Technical Center and Turtle Creek.

The largest community college in Pennsylvania, CCAC enrolled around 90,000 students during the 1994-95 year. Approximate breakdowns show that slightly over 66,000 students enrolled in community service and continuing education courses—the remaining enrolled in academic programs. A comprehensive two-year college, CCAC offers programs that meet a wide range of needs. Over 200 academic programs lead to an Associate Degree in Arts, Associate Degree in Science, Associate
Degree in Applied Sciences, and numerous certificates. The associate degrees offered by CCAC can be grouped into seven areas: university parallel programs (for students who plan to transfer into baccalaureate degree programs at other colleges and universities), and career programs in business, health, social service, applied arts technologies, applied service and trade technologies, and engineering and science technologies. These programs train students for employment and enable them to transfer to four-year institutions. About 50% of CCAC graduates transfer on to four year institutions. Generally, an associate’s degree program requires two years of study; and a certificate program, one year or less.

Historically, CCAC has been responsive to market forces and the community residents it serves. The responsiveness is attributed to CCAC’s regular review of its programs to ensure that the school continues to deliver the highest quality education possible. This commitment is one of several primary characteristics of job training program success that CCAC possesses.

A 1992 study conducted by the McKnight Foundation found that successful programs should include but not be limited to the following:

- Linking training to the job market, primarily by predicting job growth and designing training accordingly, and by working with employers to shape training and create job opportunities. CCAC regularly examines its programs.
- Defining skills necessary for success in work. CCAC is very proud of the fact that the career services program has developed a number of workshops and programs that address the development of “soft skills”.
- Assessing participant interest and potential. From day one, CCAC assigns a counselor to each student to serve as guide throughout their tenure at CCAC.
- Selecting the appropriate educational strategy. This is also addressed by using the advisor system.
- Sustaining a long-term commitment to trainee success. This is addressed with the advisor. CCAC apparently has demonstrated success in this regard since approximately 80% of CCAC graduates obtain employment in their fields within a year after graduating.

The community college provides a unique style of service to the communities in which it serves. Historically, CCAC developed its programs based on the needs of individual communities or areas. The CCAC Vocational Improvement Program, another of the Center’s unique offerings, gives economically educationally disadvantaged adults a strong foundation of basic skills on which they can use to achieve their goals. The Center’s Adult Basic Education program gives those who lack the skills to enroll in GED preparation course an opportunity to study an individualized program geared to their specific needs.

Although the majority of its students once attended classes on a part-time basis in the evening 7 years ago, CCAC’s Homewood-Brushton Center has grown dramatically over the past several years. Annual attendance in the branches programs numbers approximately 1000. Now, 65 percent of the Center’s students carry a full class load and attend classes during the day. To meet
this growing community need as well as provide training to meet the National, Regional and local work force needs, the development of a East Liberty Community College of Allegheny County is being proposed.

Description of East Liberty Community College of Allegheny County

The East Liberty Community College of Allegheny County (ELCCAC), will be developed to meet the needs of the communities of the East-End of Pittsburgh. The campus would provide two-year associate degree programs, certificate programs and special training initiatives. In keeping with the currently identified needs of the community, the program is not intended to replace or replicate services, such as the CCAC Vocational Improvement Program, of the Homewood Brushton branch. Rather it is hoped that the establishment of an associate’s degree program will attract continuing students from the Homewood-Brushton and Turtle Creek programs who are looking to complete their degree requirements at a CCAC campus.

The curriculum development for these programs is an important aspect of the ELCCAC’s philosophy. Each program being proposed should be developed with input from practitioners in the various fields as well as the needs of community residents. An advisory board will be developed for each academic program. The role of the advisory board would include the following:

- Review current curriculum on a yearly basis to ensure that it continues to meet the needs in a fast changing market place.
- Provide assistance with gaining the tools necessary to training students, particularly in the technology areas.
- Provide assistance with fund-raising for the program.
- Provide assistance with defining skills necessary for the each job and working the faculty, how best to provide training in the identified skill areas.
- Provide assistance with provide on-the-job assignments.

Entrepreneurship Training Program

Entrepreneurship has been targeted as one of the important areas for the economic development for the City of Pittsburgh. The Greater Pittsburgh Region has established a goal of creating 100,000 new jobs by the year 2000. The development and support of the city’s entrepreneurial infrastructure is an important factor in achieving this goal. Organizations such as the Enterprise Foundation, the Minority Enterprise Corporation, Keystone Minority Investment Corporation, and the University of Pittsburgh Small Business Institute have done extensive work in this area in an effort to provide start-up and early developmental assistance to the areas potential entrepreneurs.

However, the following have been identified as some of the reasons for the individual failure of minority new businesses:

- inadequate managerial capability; operational neglect
- choice of unfavorable business location
- lack of relevant training and experience

The environmental-consequences include:

- random disturbances
- lack of access to capital
- lack of supportive networks
- lack of role models
- inadequate patronage
- racial discrimination
Design Proposals

Workforce Development as An Economic Revitalization Tool: A Proposal to Establish the East Liberty Community College of Allegheny County

Submitted by Harriette Muir and S. Gail Reid

As mentioned previously there are several organizations which provide initial assistance to start up entrepreneurs. However, they do not provide continuous support. In addition, the CCAC does not provide this kind of assistance in its current campus programs. While CCAC already offers some business classes (e.g. accounting, bookkeeping, clerical) at its other locations, the focus of the program at East Liberty should uniquely address the needs of local entrepreneurs. This in fact would be a niche program for the area, and has the potential to become a prime source of revenue.

The ELCCAC would provide the following assistance in this area:

1. The development of a relevant labor force.
2. Accessibility to supporting services such as Accounting/Bookkeeping basic technical assistance.
3. Supply of Training/Educational Fora Development of Networks

The ELCCAC Entrepreneur Training Program would provide a special curriculum which would meet the needs of current and aspiring entrepreneurs in the area. It is proposed that the curriculum be developed in conjunction with National Entrepreneurship Training. In an effort to be sensitive to the unique needs of entrepreneurs, it is also recommended that classes be held primarily in the evening and weekends and be structured in short six week modules. Some classes will be short-term two or three day programs.

Vocational Technical Center

The ELCCAC Vocational Technical Center would provide training in areas pertaining to the technology targeted growth areas in Pittsburgh. The ELCCAC program would training in Technology development, Automotive Science and Construction Science. ELCCAC would seek to build on the success of the Neville Technology CCAC site. Located north of Pittsburgh less than a mile off of Route 79 on Neville Island, CCAC’s Technology Center is well known for providing the most updated training in technological, trade, and automotive careers. Unfortunately, for residents of the East End, Neville Island is not the most easily accessible campus. The ELCCAC site could provide programs and customized classes to fit the unique needs of East End residents as well as the regional job force needs.

Health Programs

The health industry is not only a national growth area, but the city of Pittsburgh has a large number of hospitals and health related institutions such as nursing homes and daycare. The ELCCAC would provide training in emerging areas in the Health Services that provide moderate wages. The program would provide classes for Home Health Aids and a joint program in physical and corrective therapy assistants and aides. With a large elderly population in the area, training in this area would not only provide needed employees but also readily marketable skills. Program developers should also consider establishing a health care program that strengthens the skills necessary to becoming certified as a day care practitioner. As a large number of public assistance residents in the area prepare to go to work, the possibility of pursuing employment as a child caretaker might be a viable option for many. This program might even be structured in parallel with the Entrepreneurial Program.

Workplace literacy comes down to the set of skills necessary to perform one’s job adequately. At the low-end it might include the ability to read, write and perform basic mathematical computations at an eighth-grade level. It or could include other elements such as analytical and communication skills. Recognizing that basic illiteracy skills are the foundation for any other academic or job-training program, the ELCCAC program would also provide Adult Literacy program and pre-college programs.

ELCCAC development program would provide on-the-job literacy programs from companies in the Pittsburgh area with particular interest in companies located within the study area. This has become an increasingly important role for community colleges nationwide. Guilford Technical Community College (GTCC) in Jamestown, North Carolina is one of the leading institutions in this regard. GTCC has not only developed partnerships with local businesses and employers, but the college administration initiated a collaborative partnership with the local school system. While a number of institutions possess advisory
boards of career professionals, the lesson that GTCC teaches is to assemble boards that consist of the chief executive officers and not simply someone in human resources. It’s the CEOs who possess the decision making power that can benefit local institutions.

The development of partnerships with industries is thus intended to be a symbiotic relationship for ELCCAC and local employers. The U.S. Department of Labor estimates that illiteracy costs US business about $255 million a year in lost productivity. In 1995 survey of Fortune 1000 companies, three-quarters of the respondents acknowledged that illiteracy had an effect on their business. For ELCCAC, employers can gain an improved product for their constituents and better serve the needs of the region.

Other Programs and Services

ELCCAC will provide comprehensive student services on site (i.e. - career services, health services, etc.) the campus will also provide unique programs such as After-School training to assist youth while parents are attending classes as well as daycare services for students. Daycare services are a crucial factor for mothers who may be enrolling in programs.

Additionally, the facility has approximately 7,000 sq/ft of unprogrammed space (3500 sq/ft on two separate floors). It is recommended that the college lease this to local or regional entrepreneurs who can provide at least one of the following types of services: business services, food/catering, and/or dry-cleaning. Another alternative is to lease space to the Kingsley Center which will be displaced with the construction of the marketplace and transportation hub.

Overall Benefits of the Project

Below is a list of the primary benefits to the East End community and to Allegheny County that a East Liberty campus of Community College could provide.

East Liberty gains a small college campus that offers increased educational opportunities as well as open gathering spaces for community use. The abandoned Sear’s site will be put to use for the benefit of the community.

The city of Pittsburgh gains an entrepreneurial training program that addresses the multiple and ongoing needs of small entrepreneurs.

The 7000 sq/ft of space that can benefit the local community with business and food services.

CCAC expands its scope of services to the community by continuing to create innovative programs. Particularly, this is an opportunity for CCAC to allow businesses to become actively involved in the structuring of programs as opposed to simply advising on this matter.

Market Issues

As already outlined, the demographic data on the study area provides a clear need for solid work force development programs to service the residents of the target area. While there are presently several other programs (job training and a CCAC site) that provide services to the area, there remain key features of ELCCAC that address specific community needs or deficiencies.

Market Deficiencies

Closest degree granting programs are Downtown or Monroeville Absence of entrepreneurial programs in any of CCAC branches or sites.

No real entrepreneurial support for the business incubator in Homewood

Market Opportunities

An increasing number of 18-22 year-olds are choosing to begin their college education at CCAC. In the past five years, they have come to comprise 50% of CCAC enrollment.

A large number of East End residents who have been receiving public assistance must now pursue work-related activities which include education and training.

CCAC could generate revenue towards operations by leasing out space to independent supporting services.

The location allows for convenient access via busway, Penn Avenue, Highland Avenue and the Highland Park Bridge.

With Peabody High School across the street, ELCCAC could develop an integral partnership with Peabody and local employers through a type of early admission/apprenticeship program. Guilford Community Technical College in North Carolina could serve as a useful model in this regard.

The target area possesses a sizable and needy population to sustain the programs at that site.
Workforce Development as An Economic Revitalization Tool: A Proposal to Establish the East Liberty Community College of Allegheny County

Submitted by Harriette Muir and S. Gail Reid

Design Proposals

Financing

Financing and funding is a major hurdle to surpass in seeing this project implemented. With a total estimated development cost of $21,962,681, the commitment of public support to the project is crucial. Since this is a public entity, it is hoped that the state, county, and city will be convinced of the merit of this endeavor and commit UDAG, CDBG, Education, Public Welfare, and Labor funds towards the development of this project. This is both an economic development initiative as well as a work force development initiative. However, in recent years the city v. county debate has emerged in light of decreased fund availability. The city is hesitant to support a county program, while the county is reluctant to support the CCAC city branches. Since this project is also seeking to capitalize upon the need of employers to have a skilled labor force, it is also hoped that local corporations and businesses will contribute to both the development and operating budgets of this campus.

As ELCCAC structures it’s operational budget, there are several main sources of revenue that the program can tap into.

TANF, Department of Labor funding for Welfare-to-Work programs, and the Department of Education are the primary funding sources identified to provide operational funding. Of course, the partnering with corporate entities can be leveraged to attract additional outside support. Tuition can be expected to account for approximately a 1/3 of the operating budget.

DEVELOPMENT BUDGET

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Units needed</th>
<th>Cost Per Unit</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Land Costs</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acquisition</td>
<td></td>
<td>$675,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hard Costs</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building(s)</td>
<td>$130 Per Sq. Ft.</td>
<td>$16,560,050</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geotech/Environmental Tests</td>
<td>$120,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contingency</td>
<td>5% Hard costs</td>
<td>$834,003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL HARD COSTS</td>
<td></td>
<td>$17,514,053</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Soft Costs</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Architectural/Engineering</td>
<td>6% Hard Costs</td>
<td>$1,050,843</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brokerage Fee</td>
<td>$4 Per Sq. Ft.</td>
<td>$509,540</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developer’s Overhead</td>
<td>$10 Per Sq. Ft.</td>
<td>$1,273,850</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Fees</td>
<td></td>
<td>$30,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insurance</td>
<td></td>
<td>$5,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miscellaneous</td>
<td>1% Soft Costs</td>
<td>$28,692</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contingency</td>
<td>5% Hard Costs</td>
<td>$875,703</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL SOFT COSTS</td>
<td></td>
<td>$3,773,628</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL DEVELOPMENT COST</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>$21,962,681</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

One Component in the Overall Revitalization Strategy

It is important to note that this proposal to establish the ELCCAC is one of several proposals to revitalize the East Liberty neighborhood. Within the comprehensive strategy to revitalize the community, the development of the ELCCAC is an integral part. It is particularly linked to the following programs.

Transportation Hub - The successful implementation of the Transportation hub and marketplace will connect ELCCAC to communities beyond the immediate study area.

Embassies - The presence of international culture in the area would provide opportunities for special community programming. ELCCAC could also provide skilled construction workers.

Housing - The proposed housing changes will make East Liberty a more attractive residential community for students who may be from outside of the area.

Ellsworth Commercial development - The commercial development on the Southern corridor of East Liberty will provide a shopping and entertainment attraction for students of ELCCAC.

1 High performance is a term that has recently come to characterize the more knowledge-intensive environment of businesses and industry.


11 ibid pg.18

12 This information was obtained from the CCAC web-site located at http://www/ccac.edu

13 Jan Gray, CCAC staff - main office.

14 This figure was obtained from Mrs. Jean Snyder, Director of Academic Programs at the Homewood Brushton site. These numbers are the balance of enrollment during the fall and spring semesters. There are no classes offered in the summer because the branch hosts a summer program in connection for 200 local youth in science and technology.

15 Continuing students are basically those students who complete the pre college requirements at one of the branch programs and then continue to pursue a degree or certification program at one of the main campuses.

**Introduction**

The East Liberty Center for Community Services will serve many functions not only for the residents of East Liberty, but for the surrounding neighborhoods. The Center consists of three buildings: Elderly Housing with Shops, a Sports Center, and a Civic/Cultural Center. The Center occupies three of the four corners at the intersection of Penn Circle/ Fort Collins and Broad Street. The Public Square lies on the remaining corner.

**The Public Square**

The Public Square is the area of greatest interaction. Its situation at the end of the Penn Avenue shops, and directly adjacent to the bus station, the consulates, the civic and cultural center, the elderly housing, and the industrial park make it a strong focus in the community. With many people coming from the bus station, it will be a major route for pedestrians, either going to one of the surrounding buildings or to homes beyond. The square will also support various activities. Portions of it will be paved to facilitate an outdoor market and cultural festivals that relate to the Kingsley Cultural Center. The eastern part of the square will have a paved area for recreational activities like rollerblading or street hockey. This
paved area can then be converted into an ice skating rink in the winter months. The square will also have general open space to offer people places to relax or play frisbee.

**Elderly Housing and Shops**

The elderly housing will contain thirty-eight units. There is some variation in the layout of the units, including some units for single individual occupancy, and some units for couples. Parking for the facility is behind the building and contains twenty-nine spaces. It is assumed that not all occupants will have cars since there is reliable public transportation nearby. There are three entrances to the housing: one on Penn Circle East next to the dropoff, one on Broad Street, and one opening onto the parking lot. Also on Broad Street are the entrances to four shops which supply continuity for the remainder of Broad Street which is largely commercial.

The apartments themselves occupy the second and third floors of the building. Each floor has a communal room that looks onto the public square; laundry facilities; and a small exercise room. There is a large dining area on the ground floor that is connected with a pharmacy and convenience store so that the residents will not need to travel far for necessities.

---

Sports Center

The Sports Center’s first priority is to provide opportunities for the youth of the community, both recreational and educational. There is a basketball court for competition that can also be divided into two courts when the seating is retracted. There is a lap pool for competition, recreation and therapy or aerobics classes. There is also a warm water/wading pool for children and the elderly. There is a weight room and aerobics room on the upper floor as well as locker rooms below the court. Aside from having showers and bathrooms, the locker rooms also contain saunas, steam rooms, and therapy rooms. The therapy rooms can also be used for individual meditation, like yoga.

Also on the first floor is the daycare which has access to an outdoor playground, a health clinic, and a snack bar. The Sports Center will also serve an educational purpose. There are classrooms and offices for teachers and coaches on the second floor. Typical classes offered will be in health awareness and nutrition. When no classes are being conducted, the rooms may be used for group meetings by members of the community.

Other activities such as pool, ping pong, and playing video games take place in the game room located on the second floor of the Sports Center. The center will also serve as a community hub for various events and meetings.
the facility. There is also a lounge area for hanging out and relaxing that contains vending machines and a kitchenette. An equipment desk will handle the distribution of pool balls, basketballs, towels and such.

The Kingsley Civic and Cultural Center

In order to implement the program for East Liberty’s new bus station, the current Kingsley Cultural Center will have to be relocated. The recommendation is to combine it with the East Liberty Center for Community Services.

There are three parts to the Civic and Cultural Center. One wing of the building is devoted to the performing arts, another to a post office, restaurants, reception halls and office space. The last section is devoted to the visual arts; this area is where most of the Kingsley Center will be relocated. There is also temporary and permanent gallery space for the students, local residents and artisans. The studios are on the second floor and provide for painting, sculpture, and ceramics. There is also a children’s studio, a printmaking studio, a photo finish studio, and a darkroom. A library is on the ground floor of the facility off of Larimer Avenue.

The performing arts portion of the building consists of an auditorium with a
stage for lectures or theatrical performances, and an auditorium for the showing of films. There are dressing rooms and practice rooms for the performers and students. Also included in this program is a TV/ Radio/ Recording Studio. This could be useful to the local churches which are well known for their wonderful gospel music. There is a possibility of the studio being student run. Local businesses could advertise there.

The civic portion of the building will house a local post office, a restaurant and coffee house on the ground floor. Above will be office space for welfare, credit and legal counselling, social security and the like. Also on the second floor is a large social hall which can be divided into two smaller halls. This area can be used for meetings, small conventions, job or college fairs, and individual or group receptions.

**Relating to the surroundings**

The various buildings have distinct relationships to the neighborhood. For example, the Sports Center is located near the Community College which allows students to use the facility. Other youth are in close proximity as well; the high school is next to the Community College and there are residential areas nearby.

It is important for the elderly to be near shopping and transportation, hence its location behind Penn Avenue commercial, adjacent to Broad Street commercial and just up Penn Circle East from the Bus Station. It is important for the Cultural and Civic Center to be centrally located with convenient access for both pedestrians and automobiles. Therefore, it is located on Broad Street between Fort Collins and Larimer Avenue. It is visible from the Bus Station and traffic travelling along Penn Avenue across the Public Square.
Introduction

In the first phase of the East Liberty Revitalization systems project, team members identified several obstacles to East Liberty's development as a community and as an economic center. Among these were high unemployment among the residents; the lack of economic self-sufficiency of the community and the lack of economic growth; the physical blight of buildings and roads; and a fragmented sense of community. For each of these obstacles, project members discussed possible causes, and as a result of this analysis recommendations for intervention were proposed. In the second phase of the project, different strategies of intervention were selected to be developed in greater detail. The purpose of this paper is to develop further the recommendation to build a community center in East Liberty, in order to address the problem of East Liberty not being a "livable" and cohesive community.

The key stakeholders in the development and operation of a community center in East Liberty would clearly be the residents of East Liberty and the adjacent neighborhoods (within 10 minutes walking distance), such as Larimer, Highland Park and Shadyside; the public sector, such as the City Planning Department; and the various community organizations that already serve this area in a smaller, more fragmented capacity.

Why a community center in East Liberty?

The formal definition of a community center is understood to be a building, or group of buildings, designed for various recreational and educational needs of a community. In East Liberty, the development of the community center will not be limited to this definition, but will strive to meet the needs unique to the project area's population, such as the social fragmentation of its residents. The main questions that will be addressed in this section of the report are: "what are the unique needs in this project area, and what problems does building and operating a community center solve?"
The need for a community center in East Liberty was assessed at a preliminary level by first observing what, if any, similar programming exists in the area, and then by comparing the proposed community center to other centers with similar objectives and clientele. A secondary, more thorough investigation is required, which would survey relevant segments of the population.

Following are various perspectives of problems and needs in the East Liberty area, and the rationale behind how a community center might be an appropriate means of intervention in each case.

**The “no-sense-of-community” problem**

Through a telephone interview, Ms. Teresa Isadora, branch manager of the East Liberty branch of the Carnegie Library, viewed the lack of diverse recreation for the residents through arts and culture as being a critical problem in East Liberty and surrounding areas. In her opinion, arts and cultural programming is a key form of intervention for uniting a fragmented community and developing a more positive image of East Liberty. In informal interviews of store owners along Penn Avenue, a recurring comment was the lack of diverse social outlets for the residents in the community, such as quality restaurants or places to listen to live music. These are examples of a few of the things which attract people to a neighborhood, giving it a sense of “place” and community.

If this is the opinion of some who are stakeholders in the community, to what extent have these opinions generated intervention in the area of the arts and cultural activities?

The development of an arts/cultural program for the community of East Liberty consists of an outdoor program, East Liberty Alive!, which is organized by both the Carnegie Library, the East Liberty Presbyterian Church, and the East Liberty Chamber of Commerce. This is an annual arts festival held in July, with the purpose of unifying the community. The opening of the Regent Theater and the relocation of the Dance Alloys into the area are all boosts for East Liberty’s arts/cultural program potential.
The current programming, once the Dance Alloy and the Regent Theater begin to run programming on a regular basis, would probably be suitable for the existing population within a 10 minute walking distance. However the existing cultural cluster could be expanded to create a cultural district, which would be a regional destination rather than a local one. The benefits of the success of such a center would be: i) a changed image of East Liberty from an “unlivable” place, to a center for cultural activity; ii) the increased economic activity that is brought into the community directly and indirectly from cultural activities through ticket sales, or through theater-goers dining in East Liberty restaurants before watching a show, for example; and, iii) the improved quality of life of the residents in the East Liberty community as their social alternatives increase, and income is brought into the community through the economic activities of arts/cultural programs. A community center might act as the central location for this regional cultural center, providing enough exhibition and theater space to support a regional audience.

Certainly, residents' lives will not improve simply by the addition of a community center featuring cultural activities to the area, but only in conjunction with job training and employment opportunities. The community center as cultural center does have the potential to bring income into the community, create some new job opportunities, and offer East Liberty a new image and a reason for people to congregate there and create community.

The “youth-on-the-streets” problem

From community leaders to shop owners, residents to employers, concerned people in East Liberty expressed an interest in seeing the “problem” of youth on the streets addressed. Pastor Heidi from the East Liberty Presbyterian Church (ELPC) viewed the lack of recreational opportunities for youth as the critical problem in East Liberty. Many community leaders are involved in gang mediation and other outreach services to gang members, many of which claim their turf in the neighborhoods surrounding East Liberty, such as Homewood, Larimer and Garfield. Implied in this concern for the school-aged population, is the belief that increased community concern and attention for youth in disadvantaged neighborhoods can prevent youth, who are at risk of following a track of delinquency and crime that often plagues low-income communities, from pursuing it.
Various socioeconomic conditions alert a community group to target “at-risk” youth: families in poverty, residence in public housing, race (African-American youth fare poorly in many low-income urban areas), and single female-headed households. The East Liberty area has a history of at-risk youth. In fact, the 1990’s marked the first time that violence among school-aged girls increased at a faster rate than violence among boys. Murder and assault, and sexual and physical abuse are common occurrences for many youth in the East End neighborhoods.

This report assumes that after-school, recreational programming for youth can have a positive influence on their lives. In order to find justification for this assumption, a brief study of the research that has been conducted on youth in disadvantaged urban American communities and delinquency and crime was conducted.

Popular wisdom would argue that youth “problems” are solved by building more recreational facilities. Rather, research on this subject has shown that it is not an issue of not having enough resources, but the failure of the programs that exist to reach and influence the youth who are the most in need of such services. These are the children who would ordinarily not participate using traditional approaches to marketing to youth.

The practice of using recreational facilities to address the needs of the most disadvantaged youth is not a new one. Models have been developed which state the basic minimum requirements and objectives of such facilities if they are to be successful. The basic values and beliefs behind these models are outlined below:

1. A recreational facility and programming promotes the healthy personality development of all children, influencing both their mental and physical health.
2. Recreational programming in a community reaches potential delinquents before they get into trouble.
3. Recreational programs reduce recidivism of juvenile delinquents, lessening continuing illegal behavior.
Successful models for recreational programming in disadvantaged neighborhoods stress that the following should be included in the objectives in all cases:

- to provide socially acceptable leisure outlets, in order to observe and guide youth in less formal settings
- to provide a personal, even therapeutic, outlet for youth through artistic, athletic or technical hobbies
- to build rapport through personal relationships with adults in positions of authority (program leaders)
- to involve youth in program planning
- to use a “detached” worker system

The “detached” worker system is a model used in recreational programming and outreach to these “hard-to-reach” youth, that requires the program leaders to interact with the youth within the recreational facilities, as well as at their homes, on the streets, or in the park, according to their availability and access.

East Liberty and the neighborhoods adjacent to East Liberty, such as Larimer, Lemington, Belmar, Shadyside, and Highland Park, have approximately 15 to 20 elementary and high schools. This factor makes the area a prime target for recreational programming directed toward youth, and this has happened through such community groups as the ELPC, the East End Cooperative Ministries (EECM) which is an umbrella organization to which most of the churches on the area belong, the Kingsley Center, the East Liberty branch of the Carnegie Library, and other smaller grassroots organizations. These groups provide services to youth, ranging in age from infancy to high school, and typically offer programs that meet once or twice a week during the after-school time slot on weekdays.

The Presbyterian Church, for example, is equipped with basketball courts and a bowling alley, as well as religious and cultural programming for children from grade school to high school. Sunday school is offered for all ages on Sunday mornings. For children in middle school, there is a Wednesday after-school “drop-in” program and a youth fellowship on Sunday afternoon. Youth fellowship is also offered for high school students in Sunday
afternoon, in addition to Wednesday night basketball. All grade school children (Kindergarten through fifth grade) can participate in a bimonthly Saturday morning crafts program. Lastly, the family resource center provides a counseling program for children and parents twice a week for a ten-week period. Other programming includes campfire programs, African dance, and self-esteem workshops that meet biweekly.

EECM provides after-school activities, but still these organizations are flooded with phone calls from parents eager to place their children in after-school and weekend programs. Rosemary Duffy, Director of Teen Services at the YWCA, believes that there is not enough programming for children on a daily basis, and a lack of programming on the weekends. Information gathered from telephone interviews with employees in the Presbyterian Church, the East End Cooperative Ministries, and the Carnegie Library support Duffy’s claim that there are gaps in the area’s youth programming.

The typical school-aged child that participates in the majority of programs currently available in East Liberty and surrounding area, is considered to be an “at-risk” youth. This means that the organizations target children who are at risk of becoming involved in antisocial and even criminal behavior. They are from low-income families which are typically headed by a single mother. They are mostly African-American, and often they reside in public housing. The population of school-aged children that are not being reached are those that already exhibit antisocial behavior. Either they have been expelled from school, or have dropped out of school. These are the youth that are hardest to reach, yet very little of the current programming is targeted to them.

Moreover, a larger center for such programming that could offer activities every day of the week does not currently exist in East Liberty. After-school and athletic activities for youth that occur on a daily basis would require facilities that can cope with that volume of client use. From this point-of-view also, a multipurpose community center appears to be a feasible option.
It appears that the success of these efforts in East Liberty and the surrounding area depends on the ability of the center to reach the youth that fall "through the cracks" and are hardest to reach. It also depends on the dedication of the instructors and mentors and their ability to build rapport with the youth and connect them to other social service resources wherever necessary; and the sense of youth-ownership of the activities, where the young people have a voice in the decision-making processes of the programs. If the center is successful at keeping young people “off the streets” and out of criminal activity, then not only the perception of the neighborhood is changed, but so is the quality of life of the residents.

The “quality-of-life” problem for seniors

The neighborhoods of East Liberty, Larimer and Highland Park all have a high percentage of adults over 65 years, according to Census data. This market segment is attracted to both recreational and athletic programming and arts and cultural programming. Expanding the target population of the community center to include senior citizens has the potential to improve their quality of life, especially if programs can be offered at low cost, but it also increases the attendance of the arts/cultural performances and increases the use of the recreational facilities. Given that the community center will be made financially feasible through the use of public funds, the viability and the longevity of the community center may depend on the usage rates of the senior citizens, in addition to the youth activities and the arts/cultural programming.

A detailed survey of existing community centers serving low-income seniors in East Liberty and surrounding neighborhoods was conducted through telephone interviews with center employees. Results of the survey of existing senior centers are given below.

Vintage, East Liberty

Programs are targeted mostly to the frail elderly (usually 65 and older). There is an adult daycare, and an adult literacy center. There is information referral, to help clients with rent rebates or income taxes. Clients can also receive medical care from an in-house geriatrician, mental health care and personal counseling. Through the State Department of Aging, a noontime meal is provided for a donation of $1.00. There is also a café, and home-delivered
meals provided. There is some programming for the more active elderly, such as the 5 K Vintage Run, Mystery Theater Night, and a “Senior” Prom. Recreational programming includes Tai Chi, line dancing, ceramics, and photography. Clients can obtain a health membership (allowing them to enroll in several programs at one time), and may spend from $20 to $50 worth of programming for a ten-week period. Programs run from Monday to Friday only.

Homewood-Brushton Center, Homewood
This center is primarily an adult daycare and personal care home. Almost all of its clients are African-American. The recreational component of the center, therapeutic classes provided by Community College of Allegheny County (CCAC), is geared to the frail elderly. Clients pay no fee for the services. It operates from Monday to Friday only.

Bloomfield Senior Center, Bloomfield
Recreational programming is the focus of this center. This includes: bingo, card-playing, and day field trips. Programs are provided through CCAC, such as golfing, dance, crafts, aerobics and stationary “biking,” and chair exercises for the frail elderly. These services are offered Monday to Friday, and participants pay $2.00. Most of the seniors who attend the programs, the majority of whom are 70 to 80 years old, walk to the center.

Stephen Foster Center, Bloomfield-Lawrenceville
This center is an adult daycare that targets people 65 years and older with aging diseases. Lunch is provided, with a donation from $.50 to $1.00, as well as exercises organized by Mercy Hospital using stationary bicycles and treadmills for a fee of $26.00 per month. Twice a week “socials” and frequent field trips, to Pirates games, for example are included in the programming.

Lemington Multi-Purpose Center, Lincoln
At no charge to its clients, this center provides seated therapeutic exercises for the frail elderly, Tai Chi for more active clients, and counseling for legal problems and tax preparation, for example. Educational classes are provided by CCAC. A noontime meal is offered with a
The targeted population is the frail elderly 60 years and older. Clients reside in East Hills, Lincoln, and Larimer.

The gap in services was found to be programs targeted to the low-income, senior between the ages of 55 and 60 years (the “young elderly”). The young elderly are characterized by center employees as being healthy, active, holding a part-time job, but having and enjoying plenty of leisure time especially on the weekends. Their desire would be to enjoy this leisure time, outside of work, with people in their age group. More details of the types of programs that would attract this group are given in the section entitled “Program Description.”

**Program description**

Only the athletic and recreational component of the community center will be discussed from this point onward. This narrows the focus of the project considerably, allowing for greater detail in the discussion of the proceeding topics.

The recreational/athletic component of the proposed East Liberty community center will be located between Penn Circle East and Penn Circle North, and between Broad and Sheridan Streets. It will occupy a 56,000 square foot footprint, and a total of 110,000 square feet.

It has been strategically located with regard to other new development that has been proposed in this East Liberty Revitalization systems project. It is a 10 minute walk or less from the residential neighborhoods and from Peabody High School, from the commercial core at Penn Avenue, and from the transportation hub south of Penn Avenue. The proximity of the residential area and the school are advantageous in order to draw the local population of elderly, children, and the arts/cultural market. The proximity of the commercial core is particularly beneficial for the arts/cultural programming which benefits from a clustering of retail, especially food services and other complementary firms nearby. The transportation hub is the center’s connection to the rest of the city and region, having the potential to attract a wider market for the arts/cultural programming than the East Liberty area.
The following facilities will be offered in the athletic/recreational component of the community center. There will be general, public space, such as a lobby, and offices for the management personnel and instructors of the center. There will be recreational space containing a lounge with vending machines, a game room, and a snack bar. The athletic center will contain 2 basketball courts, a weight room with exercise machinery, and aerobics/dance room, a swimming pool, and an indoor running track. Accompanying facilities include locker rooms, showers, steam room and sauna. There will also be meeting rooms and classrooms for instruction.

Up to this point in the proposal, several uses for the East Liberty community center have been suggested, with various target populations: the elderly, youth, and the arts and entertainment market. Conflicts in operating a facility with a mixture of clients, can be avoided by staggering the time of use of the facility. According to the downtown YWCA model, seniors occupy athletic facilities in the morning, early afternoon and Saturday morning when senior programs are scheduled, while the youth are the predominant clients on the weekend. In East Liberty, youth programming would need to be focused during after-school hours, as well as in the daytime and on the weekends. At night, programming for older children, such as a youth-run theater, and the arts and cultural programming would be appropriate. In this way, multiple needs can be met through one center. Additional youth programming for the summer months is also necessary.

Recreational programming for youth

With the “detached” worker system, which is designed to reach “hard-to-reach” youth, the responsibilities of the youth program extend beyond the confines of the physical plant. In fact, many of the initial contacts with the youth are on the street or in parks and other public “hangouts,” while the physical plant of the recreational programming acts as the “home base.” Only after initial attempts have been made to learn as much as possible about the youth in the community through other recreational program leaders, school personnel, and police and probation officers wherever necessary, the format of the program is tailored to meet the needs of the particular children involved.
This system requires regular follow-up and evaluation so that it is continuously meeting the needs of those who are participating. It also requires that program leaders are well-trained in personal counseling and crisis intervention, and that they provide referral service to vocational and job placement agencies, social casework services, gang prevention centers, and mental health and chemical dependency services. Lastly, this holistic approach to youth recreational programming requires very irregular hours from its staff, based on whenever the participants are active and available; and is most effective when the program leaders can be on 24 hour call by using a beeper, for example.

In sum, previous attempts to develop a successful recreational center for “problem” youth have revealed the following pitfalls to avoid:

1. There should not be a heavy dependence on sports in youth programming, since this eliminates those children without the skill to participate.

2. There should not only be a focus on the “traditional” youth participant, but special effort should be made to reach the youth that are hardest to reach (who are probably the ones who need the programs the most).

3. No program planning should occur without youth participation.

4. Programs should not be skewed toward male activities, but should include opportunities for girls to be equally involved.

5. Program evaluation must be factored into the operating costs of the center, so that funding is available for regular assessments.

Potential programming for athletics includes, basketball, flag football, softball, gymnastics, volleyball, swimming and indoor soccer leagues, as well as street hockey. There should also be opportunities for a youth-run drama club, art and music classes, and computer classes. The extent to which these activities will meet the needs of the “hard-to-reach” youth in the East Liberty area depends on program leaders ability to build relationships with youth on the streets, organize activities outside the facility in public “hangouts,” and complement these activities with personal counseling and referral to other social services wherever necessary.
Existing youth programs should be encouraged to use the center’s facilities free of charge for smaller, grassroots groups, or for a fee for larger organizations. Little League programs in the city offer teams of boys from various neighborhoods to compete in football and baseball games during the summer. The East Liberty community center could offer its facilities as a site for these competitions. With the development proposed in East Liberty in this group project, the Kingsley Center is being displaced. The Kingsley Center’s programming includes youth in arts, crafts, sports and other activities, such as chess tournaments. It should be encouraged to consider relocating its main offices, and holding its programs in the community center.

This holistic approach to youth programming should involve the parents of the youth wherever possible and appropriate, especially in cases where the youth’s home environment may be abusive or harmful in any other ways.

Recreational programming for seniors

Based on the survey of comparable centers in the East Liberty area outlined in the previous section, programming for low-income seniors is currently targeted to the frail elderly, usually 65 and over, and typically offers no programming on the weekends or evenings. Recreational activities are offered in conjunction with a meal program, and in most cases, participants must give a small donation for the meal while they receive the other recreational programs free of charge.

The gap in services is for programs which target the young elderly (ages 55 to 60 years) who, despite their low income, typically have some disposable income from part-time employment. Also, because of their employment, they would prefer activities in the late afternoon to early evenings on weekdays and on the Saturday and Sunday. Since they are typically healthier and in better condition physically than older seniors, they are attracted to a more varied and active exercise program, such as: Tai Chi, tennis, or swimming, aerobics, yoga, nutrition and weight loss classes, bridge, ballroom dancing, line dancing, art classes, seminars and lecture series on culture, art, or health and beauty, antiques, finances, and gardening.6 Community College of Allegheny County might provide these classes to seniors.
in the East Liberty community center.

The facility houses a kitchen which would allow meal programs to be organized for seniors, possibly in a cafeteria setting. Also, a facility of this size would be able to support daily programming (seven days a week), which would be new for East Liberty and surrounding areas.

Registration for clients to receive transportation from ACCESS, a government-funded transportation service for seniors (65 years and older), can be provided at the facility. This is an added attraction, especially for seniors who are live 25 or 20 minutes away by foot.

Lastly, a volunteer program should be developed to match capable seniors to youth programs, as well as any other ways in which seniors can become more involved in the lives of the youth in their neighborhoods. In this way, positive interactions can be encouraged between seniors and youth within the same community.

Financing athletics and recreation

In order to finance the athletics and recreational component of the community center, several assumptions have been made. The target populations for this component of the center are the elderly and youth (elementary, middle and high school). The community center will be driven by public funds. Also, the center will rely on part-time and volunteer employees to provide for the various services.

Currently, in existing youth programs through the Presbyterian Church, for example, youth attend free of charge. The population of East Liberty and surrounding areas is poor: 25% of the families are in poverty (compared to 18% in Pittsburgh and 7% in Allegheny County), with 35% of the households earning income below $10,000 annually. Therefore, the athletics and recreation component of the center will only be feasible through public support, since the
Revenue generated from rental space would not cover the costs of constructing and operating the athletics and recreational component of the center.

Based on membership and program fees for comparable centers with clients with similar socioeconomic status, younger seniors are willing to pay up to $26.00 a month for monthly seminars or exercise classes. In order for the programming to be successful in reaching hard-to-reach youth, no fees should be imposed. This would immediately exclude the most disadvantaged of children, the ones most in need of these services.

In order to alleviate some of the financial burden on the public sector, several income-generating activities can be developed and linked to the community center, such as allocating rental space for special events and meetings for community and social service organizations; renting space to accommodate a daycare (linking the center to the offices and retail in the commercial core as well as to the transportation hub); and, allocating rental space to health and beauty-related retail, such as nail and hair salons and health and beauty products store.

Below is a table of the estimated construction expenses of the community center. The athletic and recreational facilities occupy 110,000 square feet total.

### Estimated Construction Expenses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HARD COSTS</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Building Construction Cost</td>
<td>$13,200,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-development Fees</td>
<td>$120,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hard Cost Contingency</td>
<td>$666,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL HARD COSTS</td>
<td>$13,986,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SOFT COSTS

Legal Fees $30,000
Architecture & Engineering $839,160
Development Fees $1,100,000
Brokerage Fees $440,000
Miscellaneous Soft Costs $24,092
TOTAL SOFT COSTS $2,433,252

Total Estimated Expenses for Construction $16,419,252

Assumptions
1. The East Liberty Community Center, which is in the commercial core of East Liberty, is assumed to be more similar to an office development than a housing development. Therefore, estimates for construction expenses are based on average costs for office development.
2. Land Acquisition costs are omitted, as they were not yet available at the time of the report.
3. Hard Cost Assumptions
   Building Costs = $120 per s.f.
   Hard Cost Contingency = 5% of total hard costs
4. Parking costs are excluded from this cost table, since it is assumed that the clients will come from a 10 minute walking radius.
5. Soft cost assumptions
   Architecture & Engineering = 6% of total hard costs
   Development Fees = $10 per s.f.
   Brokerage Fees = $4 per s.f.
   Miscellaneous Soft Costs = 1% of total soft costs

The following table shows estimates based on major initial operating costs of athletics/recreational facilities of comparable scale, the YMCA of Pittsburgh and the Jewish Community Center. It is assumed that operating costs will fluctuate over subsequent years, as the
rate at which new equipment is purchased slows down, but salaries increase with rising inflation.

**Estimated Yearly Operating Expenses**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Swimming pool maintenance</td>
<td>$30,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>(25 meters/6 lanes)</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exercise equipment costs</td>
<td>$300,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleaning and maintenance crew</td>
<td>$12,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrative staff salaries*</td>
<td>$300,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintenance/Replacement of equipment</td>
<td>$200,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupancy costs <em>(heat, light, gas, water, etc.)</em></td>
<td>$100,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office costs <em>(telephone, copier, fax, computers, etc.)</em></td>
<td>$20,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program evaluation</td>
<td>$30,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total estimated operating expenses</td>
<td>$992,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Staff includes the director and/or executive director of the facility, as well as youth program leaders (detached workers), part-time facility staff and fitness/sports instructors. Estimated part-time staff= 60-75 people @ $10-15/hr.

The financing of the operating expenses of the athletic/recreational component of the community center will be a combination of public funding and revenue generated from activities within the facilities. A typical financing strategy for the construction and operation of a community center consists of grants from foundations, funds from the Community Block Grant Program which is applicable in East Liberty, and funds from State grants. Loans from banks and other sources are avoided. Creative financing strategies can include rental space for office or housing development on the site. In the East Liberty Community Center, a 2,000 square-foot space has been allocated for rent to a daycare. John Rah'aim from the City Planning Department estimates that revenue can be generated from the daycare at a rate of...
$10 per square foot. On the following page is a list of possible funding sources and revenue for the center.

**List of Possible Sources of Funding and Revenue**

**GRANTS**
RK Mellon Foundation: Supports human services, civic and cultural organizations that are also nonprofit organizations.

Grable Foundation: Supports nonprofit organizations oriented towards family and community.

Jewish Healthcare Foundation: Has recently supported antiviolence initiatives for youth

United Way: Provides financial support for hundreds of community agencies

Community Development Block Grant: Supports community projects (up to $100,000).

**REVENUE**
Daycare (2,000 s.f.): Assume $10 per s.f. rental rate. Total revenue from daycare = $20,000

**Conclusion**

In this paper, the development of a community center in East Liberty was proposed and a brief analysis of need and financial feasibility was provided for the athletic and recreational component of the center. The target populations for this component were determined to be youth (elementary through high school-aged children) and senior citizens. These two groups would occupy the center at different peak times: the youth programming would be scheduled during after school hours, in the early evenings and during the weekends, while senior
programming would be concentrated during the mornings, early afternoons (during school hours) and Saturday mornings. According to Census data, the target population is low-income, and would not be willing to pay for most services. This report showed that an athletics and recreational facility in East Liberty targeted to this population would need public funding to be financially feasible.

Policy justification was provided in order to justify the use of public moneys to provide these services to youth and seniors in East Liberty. First of all, a preliminary community consensus (derived through telephone interviews with community organizers and informal interviews with store owners) is that East Liberty youth need a more coherent, visible recreational programming. The assumption here is that such programs deter youth from engaging in criminal activity on the streets. Secondly, the senior market is an accessible market in East Liberty, where the average age of the residents is 35 years and a large percentage of residents are over 65 years in age. In order to ensure maximum use of the facility, programs for seniors will also be offered, giving the added benefit of improving the quality of life for seniors in East Liberty.

Lastly, to solve the problem of East Liberty being a disconnected and fragmented community, an arts and cultural component of the community center will be developed. This component will target a regional market, bringing in economic activity to East Liberty and providing the neighborhood with a more attractive public image.

The development of the community center is intended to have the greatest success when it occurs in conjunction with community development strategies that deal more directly with the fundamental problems of East Liberty’s neighborhood, some of which are unemployment, crime, and lack of business development. If a holistic approach is taken to the revitalization of East Liberty, it has the potential to become, once again, a major center in the region.
**Book references**


**Personal interviews**

End Notes

1 The project area is the East Liberty neighborhood in addition to the area which falls within a 10 minute radius walking distance from the community center site. This area includes the neighborhoods of Shadyside, Larimer, and Highland Park.

2 Information given in telephone interview with Rosemary Duffy, Director of Teen Services for the YWCA.


4 Amos and Wellford (pp. 159-162)


6 Program ideas offered by Vintage employee during a telephone interview.

7 See survey of existing senior center programming on pages 14-15.

8 Information about operating costs was gathered through telephone interviews with the Executive Director of the Jewish Community Center, and the Facilities Manager of the YMCA.
**Project Context**

The motivation for this residential rebuilding is the current housing situation in East Liberty, dating back to the last round of redevelopment in the 1950’s and 60’s. The thought at this time was to provide immense apartment towers on large plots of open land. In the past twenty years, however, these buildings have become increasingly vacant and rundown, and the surrounding open space is unkempt and unfriendly.

For this project, two large sites, each currently occupied by a series of large apartment towers were chosen. Generally speaking, the goal of this project is to replace these buildings and the surrounding “parks” with a residential fabric much more suitable to the residents as well as the city of Pittsburgh. The map to the right, taken from a masterplan conceived during the first half of this urban design project and presented in Volume One of this book, shows the two sites and the general idea of this redevelopment. A more detailed presentation of the proposed residential rebuilding follows.
The Larimer Site

The larger of the two sites for this residential project is located between East Liberty and Larimer. Currently located on the site are a number of large apartment towers as well as a group of smaller apartment buildings managed by the Housing Authority of the City of Pittsburgh. The site is surrounded by Broad Street, East Liberty Boulevard, and what is currently Penn Circle East, or Collins Street.

The Proposal

The initial stages of this proposal focus on reestablishing the residential street grid typical in other Pittsburgh neighborhoods. Larimer Avenue, currently broken by the housing projects is reconnected, providing a vital link between East Liberty and neighboring Larimer. Rural Avenue, which runs parallel to Penn Ave. in the downtown section of East Liberty, is extended through the residential site. A series of secondary roads then fills in the site, providing a neighborhood layout very familiar to the City of Pittsburgh.
The Houses

A series of house designs is proposed to infill the new neighborhood developments and is outlined on the next several pages. These serve simply as base designs from which an infinite number of house designs can be reached. Options like different porch designs, roof lines, and optional third floors enable customization of house designs.

The Importance of the Corner Lot

The houses that occur on the corner lots of residential roads are clearly critical. For this reason, the design for the corner house was important. The design is a two unit house, intended to be owner-occupied. The value of avoiding absentee landlords is clear. Each unit in this design is a two-story space, with the owners’ unit fronting on the main street while the rental unit fronts on the side street. Larger side setbacks are employed both to take advantage of the side street as well as to provide the rental unit with some “front yard”.

Each unit has similar amenities. The first floor provides a living room, dining room, kitchen, half bath, and laundry facilities. The second floor provides 3 bedrooms and a full bath. In the case of the owner-occupied unit, there is an extra half bath located on the second floor as well.

The corner unit house contains a third floor attic space. Furnishing of this floor into extra bedrooms in an option.
Residential Rebuilding
Michael A. Arnold
Typical Row Houses

Also provided are designs for typical row houses located along the residential streets. The designs for these houses are adapted from vernacular studies of the surrounding residential community of Larimer as well as the rest of the City of Pittsburgh. Two designs, based on differing family sizes are presented here.

24' x 36' Row House

Based on a larger family size, a row house with a floor plate measuring 24' wide and 36' long was designed. The amenities provided are suitable for a family size of 4 to 6. The living room, dining room, kitchen, and a half bath are provided on the first floor. The second floor has three bedrooms, including a master bedroom with full bath. An additional full bath is provided for the other two bedrooms.

As with the corner house, the third floor attic space could potentially be furnished to provide additional bedroom space.

Even though there is ample on-street parking, a garage located on the back alley provides two parking spaces.

- square footage (gross): 1,728 square feet
- bedrooms: 3 (or 4 with use of attic space)
- bathrooms: 2-1/2
18' x 28' Row House

Based on a family size of 2 to 4, a row house measuring 18' wide by 28' long was designed. A living room, dining room, and kitchen are located on the first floor. The second floor houses two bedrooms, a full bath, and laundry facilities.

Again, the third floor provides space for extra bedrooms.

Even though there is ample on-street parking, a garage located on the back alley provides two parking spaces.

*square footage* (gross): 1,008 square feet
*bedrooms*: 2 (or 3 with use of attic space)
*bathrooms*: 1
Design Proposals
Residential Rebuilding
Michael A. Arnold

Friendship Site Plan
Scale 1" = 100'
0' 50' 100' 150' 200' 250'

The Friendship Site

The smaller of the two sites for this residential project is located between East Liberty and Friendship. Currently located on the site are a group of smaller apartment buildings called the Pennley Apartments. The site is surrounded by Penn Avenue, South Negley Avenue, and what is currently Penn Circle West.

The Proposal

The initial stages of this proposal focus on reestablishing the residential street grid typical in other Pittsburgh neighborhoods. The old street grid, destroyed when the current apartment buildings were constructed, is to be reestablished.

The Houses

A series of house designs is proposed to infill the new neighborhood developments and is outlined on the next several pages. These serve simply as base designs from which an infinite number of house designs can be reached. Options like different porch designs, roof lines, and optional third floors enable customization of house designs.

The character of the houses for the Friendship development is much different than that of the Larimer section presented earlier. Historically, the buildings in the area around Friendship have been mansions occupied at one time by some of the city’s most powerful leaders. This character is still very evident in Friendship today. The proposed housing design reflect this.
Friendship Single-Family House

This house design is a single-family house fitting in with the historic precedents of the neighborhood. The large size of the house makes it suitable for families of sizes anywhere from 4 or 5 up to 8. This also enables alternative living situations, for example, if an older relative were to return home. Located on the first floor is the living room, study, dining room, and kitchen. On the second floor, there are 5 bedrooms (one of which could be used as a home office for example). There are 2 full bathrooms located on the second floor. There is also a full basement.

Even though there is ample on-street parking, a garage located on the back alley provides two parking spaces.

square footage (gross): 2,048 square feet
bedrooms: 5
bathrooms: 2

**Friendship Duplex House**

This house design is a duplex house also fitting in with the historic precedents of the neighborhood. Each unit is suitable for a family of between 2 and 4 people. This also enables alternative living situations, for example, if an older relative were to return home. Located on the first floor is the living room, dining room, and kitchen. On the second floor, there are 2 bedrooms, a full bath, and laundry facilities. The two units would share the full basement.

Even though there is ample on-street parking, a garage located on the back alley provides two parking spaces.

- **square footage** (gross): 994 square feet
- **bedrooms**: 2
- **bathrooms**: 1
Copula
Mixed Financing Proposal

Prepared By: Hughlin R. Boyd III, JD, MS.
Mixed Financing Proposal:

Introduction
Project Description
Relationship of Participating Parties
Financing Plan
Operating Subsidy (PFS)
Development Description
Zoning and Environmental Approval
Relocation
Market Analysis
Development Construction Cost Elimination
Development Method
Management
HOPE VI
Proforma
Introduction

The East Liberty Resident Association (ELRA), The Housing Authority of the City of Pittsburgh (HACP), The US Department of Housing and Urban Development, and Copula are pleased to submit this Mixed Finance Proposal for Phase I of East Liberty. As described in this proposal, the size of this transaction requires that the financing, relocation, construction and rehousing occur in phases. Therefore, a mixed financing proposal will be submitted for each phase, and each phase will have a separate closing.

This Mixed Financing Proposal is prepared in accordance with 24 CFR parts 941 and 970-Public/Private Partnerships for the Mixed Finance Development of Public Housing Units, Final Rule, dated May 2nd, 1996.

Project Description

A. Existing Conditions

The community is diversely populated, and there are currently four major apartment buildings which sit as monoliths, representing the concentration of poverty and blight. Discrimination in housing choice continues as a major obstacle in the City of Pittsburgh. Clear smoking gun evidence of discrimination is difficult to establish, but highly segregated residential patterns make it plain that African Americans do not enjoy the same range of housing choices that the rest of the community does. The impediments of Fair Housing study completed for the City of Pittsburgh and several regional jurisdictions, in 1992, states unequivocally that discrimination on the basis of race, disability, and family size remains widespread, resulting in unequal access to education and employment and consequently deepening the cycle of poverty.

There are 18,297 housing units located in the East Liberty community: 6,558 of the house-
holds are occupied by one person; 4,814 occupied by two persons and approximately 6,900
are occupied by three or more persons. There are also eight HUD assisted housing complexes
located in the area, all of which are under-utilized. Further research indicates that 6,961 of
units are owner occupied, while 9,395 are renter occupied. Interviews of the community resi­
dents indicate the need for multifamily dwelling in the community. Collectively, these statis­
tics illustrate the need for housing in the East Liberty community.

B. Project Overview

The redevelopment plan for the East Liberty community creates an economically balanced,
mixed income community, while providing for the housing needs of existing low income
households. The plan recognizes that growth does not occur simply because new buildings
are constructed or renovated, growth occurs because tools are made available to enable the
residents to create economic value, earn income and reinvest in their community.

The existing site will be completely transformed from a housing project into more of a
traditional looking Pittsburgh neighborhood. Most of the existing buildings will be demol­
ished. The existing streets will be completely refurbished and landscaped and the existing
street network will be expanded reconnected to the surrounding neighborhood streets. New
bicycle and pedestrian pathways and landscaping will be added to the existing roadways at
Penn Avenue to create a promenade which connects all of the major areas of the site. A variety
of small scale tree lined streets and sidewalks will be added leading from the Friendship to the
East Liberty area.

The site will be divided into series of small “villages” each with its own individual charac­
ter and identity. The village will join together to form a self sustaining community including
entertainment facilities nearby, convenience stores, day care centers, youth center and numer­
ous resident services.

The center piece to the housing development will be the urban mall. This architectural
marvel will serve a gateway between East Liberty and surrounding neighborhoods. It will be
a key link between the corridors of East Liberty, Larimer and Shadyside.
Parking will be provided in the ratio of .75 parking spaces per unit including both on and off street locations. Parking spaces will take the form of parallel parking along the residential streets, landscaped parking streets with cars oriented perpendicular to the direction of travel.

The Eight HUD assisted housing complexes located in the area will be replaced with a mix of 1000 townhouses and garden apartments in a variety of styles and types. The town houses will be placed along small tree lined streets and each will be provided with an individual front and rear yard. Each townhouse will have a front porch and private entry and will be provided with individual heating and central air conditioning and washer/dryer amenities. The garden apartments will occur in modestly sized buildings with elevators and will be provided with such amenities as individual balconies, common laundries, lobbies and community rooms. Each of the unit types will be designed to appeal to a particular category of user, singles, couples, families, elderly in both the market rate and subsidized segments of the population and to take advantage of special features- topography, view etc. of the site. One hundred of the total number of the townhouse units will be made available for home ownership.

In total, phase I will include the development of 700 units of which 35 will be for sale to home owners. The development will proceed into Phases 1 and 2.

The goals of the redevelopment will be:

To provide a variety of housing opportunities, services, and amenities attractive to both the current residents and a variety of new market rate residents;

To connect the existing site with neighboring communities and job opportunities in East Liberty and Downtown Pittsburgh.

To create a new economically balanced and stable residential community within the City of Pittsburgh.
Phase 1: Physical Design

The first portion of the site to be developed will be the Friendship East Liberty corridor. The portion of the project will consist of 700 units: 100 (studio), 200 (1 bed), 270 (2 bed), 120 (3 bed), and 40 (4 bed). The townhouses are grouped together in rows of five to six with small open spaces between them. These spaces provide views and opportunities for quiet outdoor activities.

The apartment building adjoining Friendship is geared towards older residents and offer such amenities as emergency pulls in each apartment, grab bars in bathrooms, a sunny common room and outdoor patio for gathering and socializing. All of the ground floor apartments have individual entries in addition to the corridor entries. This helps to give each unit an individual identity, enliven the base of the building, and bring a higher level of activity to the street.

The next apartment building from the seniors will consist of studio and one bedroom units that will have tenant mix comprised of market-rate and subsidized households. Based on the numbers of senior households who desire to be rehoused at the new development, the tenant selection criteria will place a high priority on rehousing seniors.

Phase 1a: Resident and Economic Development

Socially and economically, the redevelopment plan for East Liberty includes a coordinated and comprehensive approach that has four thematic components: education and training, employment, neighborhood network/Campus learners and supportive services. The employment and training residents of East Liberty are the keys to the success of the revitalization of this community. Our goal is to maximize the number of residents employed throughout the revitalization in construction and property management as well as on going job development and placement efforts within the broader community. During the past few years, an intensive program of school and community computer networking has begun to develop in Pittsburgh and Allegheny County. Large-scale efforts include those which focus on the Pittsburgh Public Schools and the electronic information network, which will provide Internet connections with all li-
braries in Allegheny county. The goal of our program is to establish a system capable of serving East Liberty residents and to provide the means for all residents to use this system conveniently and inexpensively. The resident services program is designed to facilitate individual and community progress toward economic self sufficiency. A resident outreach and employment office will be established. This office will serve as the clearinghouse and coordinating entity for all employment and training opportunities, educational information and other supportive and community services.

**Relationship of Participating Parties**

A revitalization strategy in East Liberty with the residents, the city and the HUD brought about the need for a revitalization plan. The HACP undertook a public solicitation for the selection of a development partner for East Liberty. In January of 1996, the ELRA issued a Request for Proposals (RFP) for a developer. The HACP received several responses to the solicitation. The HACP conducted an extensive evaluation process based on an objective rating system which incorporated factors such as previous experience, ability to work in partnership with the residents, ability to complete, and management experience. Interviews of the development teams were conducted by a selection committee composed of representatives from HACP, the ELRA and the city. In December of 1996, the parties selected the development team led by Copula.

The HACP, ELRA and the Copula have entered into a contract for planning and program management activities. The agreement is dated Dec 25, 1996, details the scope of services to be provided by Copula during pre-development period. Copula has lead responsibility for all development-related design activities, including but not limited to obtaining zoning and environmental approvals and financing, as well as relocation and resident services.

However, the HACP will continue to play an active supporting role in all activities related to the redevelopment effort.
A. Relationship to the East Liberty Association

As set forth in the RFP, HACP will transfer the East Liberty Limited Partnership, a Pennsylvania limited partnership, the "Owner", will have two general partners and an investor limited partner. One general partner will be controlled by Copula and the second general partner will be controlled by ELRA. Since the site will be developed in stages, there is likely to be series of owner entities. Each ownership will have same general partner, but may have different limited partner investors.

Copula has extensive experience in Co-ownership with resident councils and strongly believes this high level resident involvement creates a sense of responsibility that is essential to changing community behavior. In this arrangement, Copula will desire to retain sole decision making responsibility for a limited number of business issues, such as financing and refinancing plans.

The discussions have also assumed that Copula will be the management agent. Under the terms of the management contract, Copula will have responsibility for and decision making authority with respect to day-to-day management including rent increases, management staff hiring, on site security and operating budgets.

The proposed operating mechanisms for the partnership is a governing board with an equal number of members appointed by each general partner. This group will make all day-to-day decisions, and will report and consult with their respective boards as required. During a three year period, beginning from the date of the initial closing, the HACP will have a non voting seat on the governing board. The partnership and the governing board mechanisms will remain in place throughout the life of the development.

B. Relationship to HACP

The legal and financial relationship between HACP and the owner will involve several components. In essence, the HACP will fulfill three different roles: land seller/leasor, lender and subsidy provider.
Land Seller/Leaser

As land seller/leaser, the HACP will execute a land transfer document with the owner which will specify the terms of the transfer to the owner.

2. Lender of HOPE VI and other funds

In order that the HOPE VI and other funds being provided by the HACP can be included in the tax credit basis, these funds will be structured as loans to the owner. The loans will be documented by a construction loan agreement, promissory note, mortgage, and other ancillary documents.

3. Subsidy Provider

The HACP will provide operating subsidies to the owner under the performance funding systems. These funds will be provided only for the public housing units. It is anticipated the HACP and the Owner will enter into regulatory and operating agreement. HACP will ensure that the owner operates the units receiving operating subsidy in accordance with public housing rules and regulations.

**Financing Plan**

Phase I financing is sufficient to support the development of 700 units. The 700 units will be located on the Friendship/East Liberty border. Of the 700 units, 35 will be available for home ownership.

The total projected permanent cost for phase I for the East Liberty redevelopment project is approximately $105,655,278.00. These costs will be financed through a mix of HOPE VI, other HACP funds and purchase money mortgage, City of Pittsburgh funds, equity raised through the syndication of Low Income Housing Tax Credits (4% and 9%), take out loans for home ownership units, and long term tax-exempt bonds-funded loans and taxable bond-funded loans.
Overall, Phase I will maintain a 65/35 public housing eligible to moderate income mix. With the exception of studio apartments, all units will be marketed to both income categories. Based on current Housing Authority information, public housing residents have demonstrated a weak preference for studio apartments. There is a very strong demand for studio units, especially among graduate students and medical students.

The $420/month rent estimated for the public housing units is simply the operating expense, plus a reserve for replacement of $250/units, divided by 12 months.

The funding approach for phase I is based upon the use of tax-exempt debt for construction financing and permanent debt. Using tax-exempt debt allows phase to qualify for an automatic allocation of low income housing tax credits.

Operating Subsidy (PFS)

A. Method for Allocating PFS

Rent for the public housing units will be set in accordance with standard public housing rules. The difference between the rents collected from the public housing residents and the operating expenses of the development (including a reasonable replacement reserve) will be provided by the HACP from the operation subsidy received from HUD. To successfully manage the development and attract private tax credit capital, the owner will need relative certainty that the necessary operating subsidy will be available for public housing units and that these units will be maintained only if the HACP is able to provide the necessary operating subsidy. The procedure for calculating HACP's percentage of operating expenses will be negotiated and detailed in the operating and regulatory agreements. The formula will be based on either the highest of a bedroom test, unit test or net rentable square foot test. Certain expenses that do not relate to the public housing units, such as marketing expenses for the market rate units, will be excluded from the PFS calculation.

B Establishment of PFS Operating Reserve.
As a result of the uncertainty surrounding the continual funding of the PFS system, the financial markets will require a viable plan as to how the development would survive if PFS were terminated. While Copula believes Congress most likely would provide residents with vouchers and that a redeveloped site would have difficulty in retaining existing residents and obtaining replacement residents, the financial market will require a reserve that will assist in transition if Congress fails to provide vouchers or for other problems or funding gaps that may develop in the transition.

Zoning and Environmental Approvals

A Zoning

East Liberty has a variable mix of Zoning. Although the current allows residential use, rezoning of the property to planned residential is needed in order to provide the flexibility to create a mixed-use development, which includes rental, home ownership and retail/commercial uses.

Copula has instituted an inclusive community-wide process which provides a vehicle for disseminating information on the status of the development as well as providing a mechanism for obtaining input and feedback on the design from neighborhood residents.

B Environmental Approvals

A phase I environmental assessment was performed by Angels, Ltd. on the phase I portion of the site. The report indicated no environmental problems and indicated that no additional testing was warranted. The site is not located in a flood plain hazard area as defined by the Federal Emergency Management Agency.

Relocation

A successful relocation program is critical to achieving our goal of creating a stable and sus-
tainable mixed-income community. Further, ensuring that relocation, construction proceeds on schedule with minimal disruption is critically important. To achieve our goals, Copula, ELRA, and HACP have been working to establish a fair and equitable process which minimizes the disruption to residents and provides residents with maximum opportunities for exercising choice in their housing. In an effort to maintain stability, every effort will be made to relocate residents directly from their existing units to new homes. Due to unforeseen circumstances, (e.g. construction phasing) however, some residents may need to be relocated temporarily before they are permanently established in new housing.

Housing Opportunities Unlimited (HOU), a member of the Copula team, is responsible for developing the relocation plan and performing all relocation work. All affected East Liberty residents will be relocated in accordance with the policies and procedures set forth in the Uniform Relocation Assistance and Real Property Acquisition Policies Act of 1970 and 24 CFR 968-108 HUD handbook 1378, as amended, Tenant Assistance Relocation and Real Property Handbook. Any households that is a legal tenant at the HUD housing projects in East Liberty as of the date of approval of the demolition will be entitled to receive relocation benefits as described under the Uniform Relocation Act.

A relocation Committee has been established to finalize all the policies and procedures related to relocation. This committee will ensure that the laws are complied with and the residents preference is adhered to by Copula.

The first step in the relocation process was a survey of residents needs and preferences for temporary and permanent relocation and identification of specific relocation resources. The result of the survey is as follows for the 1,100 HUD residents.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Remain at East Liberty</td>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permanently Relocate Using Sect. 8</td>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permanently Relocate to other HACP sites</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (home ownership)</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The housing needs of those who preferred to remain at East Liberty are as follows:

- One bedroom: 200
- Two bedroom: 175
- Three bedroom: 95
- Four bedroom: 30
- Total: 500

Each resident that is relocated will be provided a Relocation Agreement describing the relocation policies and procedures, whether the household has elected permanent or temporary relocation, relocation benefits (such as payment of moving costs and costs of telephone and utility hookups), rehousing criteria and the process that will be followed for rehousing eligible residents.

It was agreed by all involved, ELRA, HACP, and Copula that there will be certain rules that residents will have to follow to remain in the new resident. This is not exhaustive, however.

- Selling/trafficking of illegal substances, criminal activity, family rejection of social service assistance, non-payment of rent, continued bad housekeeping, etc., nine months prior to moving to new community is ground for prohibiting occupancy for resident.
- Existing residents are not required to reapply.
- First preference to present residents.
- To live in community resident must show proof of work.
- Resident adults do not have to be married to live together.

Market Analysis

A market analysis of the proposed development was prepared by Copula in the summer of 1996. The study investigated the rental market in the Hill District, Oakland, Squirrel Hill and...
Shadyside neighborhoods, including an investigation of the graduate and medical student housing demand from nearby universities and medical center.

Our study indicated a strong demand for the market rate rental units, with most of the potential competition showing 96-100% occupancy levels. The Pittsburgh market is lacking modern, well managed rental housing at competitive rates. For the most part the choice in the rental housing consists of either high rents in the professionally managed high rise apartment buildings or substandard housing for lower rents. The market analysis supports our belief that convenience and quality of the new East Liberty will attract young professional, graduate students and elders. The projected market rents and the unit and site design, coupled with the proposed amenities package will make East Liberty highly competitive in the local market. A major asset for East Liberty is its proximity to downtown, the universities and the commercial corridor of Penn Avenue and Baum Blvd.

The student market is perhaps the largest and most promising market rate units. The University of Pittsburgh has minimal on and off campus housing for students, but does own 600 apartments units around the school, most of them for undergraduate housing. There is no on campus housing for graduate medical students who can try to get housing in university-owned apartments. In October of 1995, the university published a comprehensive Housing strategy, which, identified the need for housing for 2,500 students within ten years with fifty percent of that need being met in the first five years. The success of nearby developments such as Crawford Square demonstrates the strength of the young professional market in Pittsburgh. The situation is not dissimilar with Carnegie Mellon and Duquesne Universities. Both townhouse units and mid-rise units serve this market.

Based upon our preliminary market analysis we are projecting trended market rents of $525 for studio unit, $625 for one bedroom unit, $885 for a two bedroom unit, and $975 for a three bedroom unit. We believe these rents strike a reasonable balance between a relatively healthy rental market, the quality development we will be offering. To develop this economically diverse community, an aggressive marketing plan will be initiated and updated by the management company on a regular basis. Economic diversification will heighten the stability of East Liberty.
as well as the surrounding communities creating greater growth opportunities. The marketing strategy will focus on location, quality of the units and on-site amenities. Given the proximity of the development to downtown, several universities, and the University of Pittsburgh Medical Center, Copula anticipates that the market-rate units will be very attractive to middle-income families who wish to return to the community, to affiliates of the universities and the Medical Center. The marketing and leasing strategy for East Liberty will include:

Provision of directional, office and informational signage to increase awareness and the visibility of East Liberty.

An appropriate marketing entrance will be identified in order to create a positive first impression for those coming into the property. The entrance will convey that the community is well designed and maintained.

Open a Leasing Center

The Leasing Center will contain an office for rental personnel.

The location of the model units. In order to introduce potential renters to the development a display model and collateral materials will be created. The display will include the site plan, property logo and information, and apartment features and amenities.

In order to effectively and professionally rent the units, recommended staffing will include leasing agents who have experience renting in the urban mixed-income market. A receptionist will be necessary to answer the telephone and great visitors. This person could be a resident who would receive on-the-job training in renting apartments and conducting market surveys.

Direct outreach will be conducted to major employers in East Liberty area, as well as the surrounding universities, colleges and graduate schools.

Advertising and concentrate on print media outlets that cater to our target market. There will be a community promotions to bring awareness to the transformation of East Liberty. This activity will adhere to a carefully outlined timetable of milestones to reach, such as the actual groundbreaking and first residents move in. Generating positive stories in the media will help in educating public as well as the media about the transformation.

Advertise and send out press releases in the local media.

Develop community information packages, brochures and other marketing materials.
Development Construction Cost Estimate

Attached is a development budget based on the outline specifications and schematic drawings. Copula will begin road and site work, under a least agreement with HACP on Phase 1 on the Friendship side. This work will be financed through the used of CDBG float loan which will be repaid through the City of Pittsburgh Capital Funds and City Water and Sewer Authority Funds.

Description of Development Method

We intend to use a modified construction manager approach for construction of the development. Brothers Construction, Inc. as construction manager will be responsible for the general conditions.

Management

Copula will be the manager of East Liberty redevelopment. We assume that Copula will take over management in September of 1998.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase 1</th>
<th>Studio</th>
<th>1 Bed</th>
<th>2 Bed</th>
<th>3 Bed</th>
<th>4 Bed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Market</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rental35</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sale</td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>700</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sources: Permanent</td>
<td>Amount</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1st Mortgage: Taxable</td>
<td>$3,203,244.90</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1st Mortgage: Tax Exempt</td>
<td>$4,304,030.40</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIHTC Equity</td>
<td>$26,642,056.50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hope VI</td>
<td>$27,495,000.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Cap. Loan</td>
<td>$1,800,000.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comp. Grant Loan</td>
<td>$13,905,000.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MROP Loan</td>
<td>$9,900,000.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDBG Loan</td>
<td>$2,549,745.90</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water &amp; Sewer Loan</td>
<td>$1,350,000.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PMM: MROP Units</td>
<td>$6,300,000.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home Ownership Loans</td>
<td>$2,542,500.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HACP Const. P.I Loan</td>
<td>$1,163,700.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>$4,500,000.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td><strong>$105,654,278.00</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## 15 YEAR OPERATING PROFORMA

### Proportion of Unit Type

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PFS funded Public Housing Units</td>
<td>64.70%</td>
<td>64.70%</td>
<td>64.70%</td>
<td>64.70%</td>
<td>64.70%</td>
<td>64.70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low Income Tax Credit &lt;= 60%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderate Units &lt;= 80%</td>
<td>35.30%</td>
<td>35.30%</td>
<td>35.30%</td>
<td>35.30%</td>
<td>35.30%</td>
<td>35.30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Trending Assumptions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PFS funded Public Housing Units</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low Income Tax Credit &lt;= 60%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderate Units &lt;= 80%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### RENTAL INCOME

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1998</th>
<th>1999</th>
<th>2000</th>
<th>2001</th>
<th>2002</th>
<th>2003</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PFS funded Public Housing Units</td>
<td>450,675</td>
<td>464,196</td>
<td>478,122</td>
<td>492,463</td>
<td>507,240</td>
<td>522,454</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low Income Tax Credit &lt;= 60%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderate Units &lt;= 80%</td>
<td>409,320</td>
<td>421,600</td>
<td>434,248</td>
<td>447,273</td>
<td>460,603</td>
<td>474,515</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### GROSS POTENTIAL RENTAL INCOME

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1998</th>
<th>1999</th>
<th>2000</th>
<th>2001</th>
<th>2002</th>
<th>2003</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>VACANCY-PFS Funded Units</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>15,521</td>
<td>15,526</td>
<td>14,544</td>
<td>14,774</td>
<td>15,218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VACANCY-LIHTC Units &lt;= 60%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VACANCY-Mod Units &lt;= 80%</td>
<td>7.00%</td>
<td>28,653</td>
<td>29,512</td>
<td>30,598</td>
<td>31,310</td>
<td>32,249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VACANCY-Other Units</td>
<td>5.00%</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### NET RESIDENTIAL INCOME

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1998</th>
<th>1999</th>
<th>2000</th>
<th>2001</th>
<th>2002</th>
<th>2003</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>OPERATING SUBSIDY: PV @ 5.00%</td>
<td>12,840</td>
<td>8,802</td>
<td>4,912</td>
<td>1,419</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### GROSS TOTAL INCOME

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1998</th>
<th>1999</th>
<th>2000</th>
<th>2001</th>
<th>2002</th>
<th>2003</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>817,821</td>
<td>830,660</td>
<td>872,540</td>
<td>895,073</td>
<td>920,078</td>
<td>948,078</td>
<td>948,078</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>2005</td>
<td>2006</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td>2008</td>
<td>2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>64.70%</td>
<td>64.70%</td>
<td>64.70%</td>
<td>64.70%</td>
<td>64.70%</td>
<td>64.70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>35.30%</td>
<td>35.30%</td>
<td>35.30%</td>
<td>35.30%</td>
<td>35.30%</td>
<td>35.30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2004</th>
<th>2005</th>
<th>2006</th>
<th>2007</th>
<th>2008</th>
<th>2009</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>538,130</td>
<td>554,274</td>
<td>570,902</td>
<td>588,029</td>
<td>605,670</td>
<td>623,840</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>488,750</td>
<td>503,413</td>
<td>518,515</td>
<td>534,070</td>
<td>550,092</td>
<td>586,595</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>1,026,880</td>
<td>1,057,687</td>
<td>1,089,417</td>
<td>1,122,099</td>
<td>1,155,762</td>
<td>1,210,435</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>16,145</td>
<td>16,629</td>
<td>17,127</td>
<td>17,641</td>
<td>18,171</td>
<td>18,716</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>34,213</td>
<td>35,239</td>
<td>36,297</td>
<td>37,386</td>
<td>38,507</td>
<td>39,662</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>976,522</td>
<td>1,005,819</td>
<td>1,035,993</td>
<td>1,067,072</td>
<td>1,099,084</td>
<td>1,152,057</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>976,522</td>
<td>1,005,819</td>
<td>1,035,993</td>
<td>1,067,072</td>
<td>1,099,084</td>
<td>1,152,057</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>64.70%</td>
<td>64.70%</td>
<td>64.70%</td>
<td>64.70%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35.30%</td>
<td>35.30%</td>
<td>35.30%</td>
<td>35.30%</td>
<td>35.30%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td>3.00%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>642,555</td>
<td>661,823</td>
<td>681,687</td>
<td>902,138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>583,593</td>
<td>601,101</td>
<td>619,134</td>
<td>637,708</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>1,226,148</td>
<td>1,262,924</td>
<td>1,300,821</td>
<td>1,539,846</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>19,278</td>
<td>19,855</td>
<td>20,451</td>
<td>21,065</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>40,852</td>
<td>42,077</td>
<td>43,340</td>
<td>44,640</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>1,166,018</td>
<td>1,200,992</td>
<td>1,237,030</td>
<td>1,474,141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>1,166,018</td>
<td>1,200,992</td>
<td>1,237,030</td>
<td>1,474,141</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Operating Expenses:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Management Fee</td>
<td>37,476</td>
<td>40,942</td>
<td>32,028</td>
<td>35,620</td>
<td>35,238</td>
<td>36,885</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utilities</td>
<td>141,695</td>
<td>145,945</td>
<td>150,324</td>
<td>154,835</td>
<td>159,478</td>
<td>164,262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water &amp; Sewer</td>
<td>75,183</td>
<td>77,440</td>
<td>79,763</td>
<td>82,156</td>
<td>84,621</td>
<td>87,159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taxes</td>
<td>18,434</td>
<td>18,987</td>
<td>19,557</td>
<td>20,143</td>
<td>20,748</td>
<td>21,370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All Other Operating Expenses</td>
<td>389,286</td>
<td>400,964</td>
<td>412,993</td>
<td>425,383</td>
<td>438,145</td>
<td>451,128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Replacement Reserve</td>
<td>34,425</td>
<td>35,459</td>
<td>36,522</td>
<td>37,618</td>
<td>38,746</td>
<td>39,908</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Expenses &amp; Reserves</strong></td>
<td>696,501</td>
<td>729,537</td>
<td>731,217</td>
<td>773,753</td>
<td>796,966</td>
<td>820,709</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Net Operating Income

- 2015: 121,325
- 2016: 121,325
- 2017: 121,325
- 2018: 121,325
- 2019: 123,504
- 2020: 127,209

### Debt Service

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Taxable Bond 30 years</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tax-Ex. Bond 30 years</td>
<td>110,295</td>
<td>110,295</td>
<td>110,295</td>
<td>110,295</td>
<td>110,295</td>
<td>110,295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Debt Service Subsidy</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Debt Service Net Subsidy</strong></td>
<td>110,295</td>
<td>110,295</td>
<td>110,295</td>
<td>110,295</td>
<td>110,295</td>
<td>110,295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Debt Service Coverage/Cash Flow</strong></td>
<td>11,029</td>
<td>11,029</td>
<td>11,029</td>
<td>11,029</td>
<td>15,208</td>
<td>16,930</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coverage</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>1.12</td>
<td>1.15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Page 88. East Liberty Urban Rebuilding: Architectural Recommendations. COPULA Spring, 1997.**
<p>| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>58,592</td>
<td>60,350</td>
<td>62,160</td>
<td>64,025</td>
<td>65,945</td>
<td>67,924</td>
<td>69,962</td>
<td>72,061</td>
<td>74,223</td>
<td>76,449</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>169,191</td>
<td>174,266</td>
<td>179,494</td>
<td>184,878</td>
<td>190,425</td>
<td>196,138</td>
<td>202,022</td>
<td>208,082</td>
<td>214,326</td>
<td>220,755</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>89,775</td>
<td>92,467</td>
<td>95,241</td>
<td>98,099</td>
<td>101,042</td>
<td>104,073</td>
<td>107,195</td>
<td>110,411</td>
<td>113,724</td>
<td>117,135</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22,012</td>
<td>22,671</td>
<td>23,352</td>
<td>24,082</td>
<td>24,774</td>
<td>25,517</td>
<td>26,282</td>
<td>27,072</td>
<td>27,883</td>
<td>28,719</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>464,826</td>
<td>478,773</td>
<td>493,316</td>
<td>507,930</td>
<td>523,168</td>
<td>538,863</td>
<td>555,029</td>
<td>571,680</td>
<td>588,829</td>
<td>606,494</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41,106</td>
<td>42,359</td>
<td>43,609</td>
<td>44,918</td>
<td>46,265</td>
<td>47,653</td>
<td>49,062</td>
<td>50,334</td>
<td>52,072</td>
<td>53,633</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>245,924</td>
<td>870,966</td>
<td>896,092</td>
<td>923,902</td>
<td>951,619</td>
<td>980,168</td>
<td>1,009,572</td>
<td>1,039,860</td>
<td>1,071,057</td>
<td>1,103,185</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>131,025</td>
<td>133,955</td>
<td>139,003</td>
<td>143,174</td>
<td>147,470</td>
<td>151,893</td>
<td>156,450</td>
<td>161,144</td>
<td>165,978</td>
<td>170,958</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Page 89. East Liberty Urban Rebuilding: Architectural Recommendations. COPULA Spring, 1997.**
**Introduction**

Eco-industrial parks are a new concept in manufacturing. The theory behind an Eco-Industrial Park (EIP) is to create and ecosystem of manufactures. To accomplish this goal each manufacturer is thought of in terms of what their raw materials are, what products they produce, and what waste product (by-products) they produce. The success of an Eco-Industrial Park is determined primarily by how well the waste/by-products of the facilities are utilized as raw material for other facilities on site.

The first Eco-Industrial Park (in Kalundborg, Denmark) is a combination of an electric power plant, an oil refinery, a biotechnical production plant, a plasterboard factory, a sulfuric acid producer, a cement producer, a local agriculture facility, and a district heating facility. This unlikely combination of industrial functions combined over a 15 year period into the first EIP. The driving force behind this EIP (and behind most current EIPs) was economics. Normally these saleable waste products would be landfilled, put into the sewage treatment system, or disposed of in a hazardous waste facility. Disposal of these wastes have led to many cases of groundwater contamination, soil contamination, as well as air pollution. If there is a market for the waste products the disposal of these wastes is no longer necessary. This can, by itself, greatly reduce the environmental risks associated with manufacturing facilities.

Waste utilization is only scratches the surface of the potential of Eco-Industrial parks. Along with this waste utilization plan. Each manufacturing facility can be required to have an environmental management plan which will force the company to address the issues of raw material access, transportation, and recycling of their product. This management plan can call for continual improvement to, over time, diminish the companies impact on the environment.

Manufacturing processes that create no harmful wastes that will be released into the environment (because those wastes have value and should not be wasted) have a greater potential for location in a residential neighborhood. If industry is located close to workers and housing the need for transportation is reduced. Especially if the facility can locate within walking distance of a residential neighborhood. This reduces air pollution and gas consumption. The waste heat for the manufacturing processes can also then be used to heat houses. These are simply a sample of the potential of Eco-Industrial parks. The possibilities are only limited by the imagination of the designers.

**Implications for East Liberty**

The adopted master plan for East Liberty calls for a redevelopment of the area to create a greater sense of place, the need for a neighborhood atmosphere and community action. With this master plan we have realized the potential of the neighborhood. It has a strong cultural identity which can become a regional attraction. However, this cultural identity is mainly a commercial and social endeavor. We can bolster the commercial core and a few of the residents with this economic stimulant, but the majority of the residents are left unemployed and lacking the job skills necessary to change this status. This proposal hopes to alleviate much of that unemployment and lack of education by locating a manufacturing area in East Liberty. This manufacturing area, need not be the steel mills of old spewing smoke and filth over the community. The city of Pittsburgh is trying to market itself as an environmentally friendly city for both residents and businesses. The site in East Liberty is ideal due to the close proximity of the rail lines, the busway and a large currently unemployed work force.

To this end I propose to create an Eco-Industrial park on the site. This site will serve as a test site for the feasibility of small scale Eco-Industrial Parks in an urban environment. The environmental standards for locating in close proximity to a residential area are quite stringent, which can be quite expensive. However, since the original Eco-Industrial park was formed for economic reasons (an additional source of income) as well as the fact that this system produces less wastes that need to be landfilled, I believe that possible economic problems will actually be less of a factor than they would be for a traditional industrial park. I feel that if we are to stop destroying the undisturbed natural world, which is the basis for continued life on this planet, we need to come up with ways of manufacturing in urban areas with relatively...
Design Proposals

E. Liberty Eco-Industrial Park
Choli Lightfoot

little or no pollution or negative externalities. To create a truly green environment with little to no pollution the site would need to incorporate a multitude of functions. Firstly the manufacturing area. To use the waste heat and by products a residential area, or series of apartments, would be best located in close proximity to the manufacturing processes. A garden and or wetlands area will also be necessary to purify the waste water and air from the manufacturing plant. These functions will then need to be incorporated with what the needs of the community are to create an unobtrusive scheme that will create little or no chemical pollutants as well as minimize noise and sight pollution.

The major concerns of the surround neighborhood will necessarily determine the constraints of the site. On one side of the site is a residential neighborhood that will need to have relatively quite nights, will want to have access across the site, will want the manufacturing plants to provide education and jobs for the community (in association with a local community college and an onsite training program) and will want the site to act as a buffer between the residential neighborhood and the existing manufacturing area. The residents of the community (and especially of the site) deserve access to the public gardens and wetlands that need to be developed in conjunction with this project (to remediate waste waster and use waste bio-solids.). That leads to various elements of the public realm that will make the area safe and attractive including sidewalks through the site, good lighting, public benches, garden paths, and other public areas. The other side of the site faces a small section of the commercial district. The main commercial district is located on the same street however, but there is a break in the flow due to a public square. The project needs to maintain the continuity of the commercial street, without drawing the shoppers away for the center of the commercial core. The public will be walking on these streets to get to the remainder of the commercial areas, therefore the frontages on to this street must be carefully considered. The street should have shop fronts and be detailed much like the commercial core to preserve continuity. A manufacturing plant claims the other side of the site which provides access to the rail line and potential truck access. This manufacturing area will help in establishing the critical mass necessary to keep a manufacturing area vital.

East Liberty Plan

The Eco-industrial park is located in close proximity to both the busway and a residential neighborhood. These will provide regional and local workers respectively. The proximity of the rail line makes this an ideal location for manufacturing due the ease of exporting the products.
What is an ECO-Industrial Park?

"An Eco-Industrial Park is a community of manufacturing and service businesses seeking to enhance environmental and economic performance through collaboration in managing environmental and resource issues including energy, water, and materials. By working together, the community of businesses seeks a collective benefit that is greater than the sum of the individual benefits each company would realize if it optimized its individual performance only."

-Environmental Protection Agency

Design Guidelines for an EIP

Experts and Developers

1. Minimize impact on the ecosystem
1. Conserve Energy
3. Exchange Waste products
3. Target companies based on waste recycling needs
3. Sell waste products
3. Reduce wastes
3. Reduce toxic materials use
8. Restore Ecology
8. Stress reuse and recycling
8. Creating a continual monitoring and adjustment system
8. Co-locate facilities
8. Reduce governmental red tape (for the industries)
8. Provide incentives for locating there
8. Conserve materials
8. Reduce natural resource consumption
8. Reduce pollution
17. Collaboration
17. Community involvement
17. Reduction of construction impact on the natural world
17. Development on brownfields
17. Green buildings
17. Redundancy of suppliers/users
17. Water recycling and conservation system
17. Design using community input
Economics

“If there is to be an increase in responsible environmental performance, it will occur by demonstrating convincingly that environmentally sound practice is sound business practice.”

*Fairfield Ecological Industrial Base Line Study, June 1995*

“From a business standpoint pollution is a waste of resources and is therefore economically inefficient”

Silverstien, M.; “Green Economics”; 1992

Economic examples:

**Kalundborg Denmark**
Total investment: $60 million
Total average annual revenues: $10 million
Average Payback on investment: 5 years (varies most 3-4 years some 7 years)
Accumulated assets as of 1994: $120 million

**Brownsville, TX**
Scenario 5: pollution prevention, industrial symbiosis and collocation
Net Economic Benefit: $8,221,214
ROI: 55
Payback: 1.68 years
Reductions in pollutants:
- Plastics: 131,277 lbs
- Asphalt: 730,831 lbs
- Gypsum: 121,545 lbs

Why are we not doing this more often

Making Industrial Parks Sustainable
http://www.sustainable.doe.gov/articles/mak/

- American Companies typically function as if resources and repositories are infinite
- Myth that any effort to protect the environment harms business
- Fear of disclosing trade secrets
- Fear of losing autonomy
- Fear of being locked into limited number of suppliers
- Legal obstacles
  (If one company sells it wastes to another company and they are subsequently mishandled who is liable)
Manufacturing Site Plan

The site incorporates six buildings for large scale manufacturing, a parking garage, a wetlands and a public garden. This area in conjunction with a prototype for manufacturing/residential blocks comprise the bulk of the project.

The manufacturers included on this site would be an Integrated Circuit manufacturer (building plans included later), a Glass Etcher, a Food Packaging Plant, a Brewery, and a Compact Disc Manufacturer.

The Manufacturing sites involved with the integrated residential and manufacturing site would primarily be light manufacturing, including a glass grinder (relocated for the core), a hydroponics facility, artists studios, and clothing manufacturing.
This building is accessible though a typical commercial street facade. This helps the manufacturing facility better integrate into the community.

However, when rounding the corner into the public park entrance you see the elevation to the right, which tries to celebrate the process of manufacturing.
First Floor Plan

This plan shows the lay out for the first floor of the manufacturing facility. The primary manufacturing takers place in clean rooms which are light and particulate matter. Since the workers will be under artificial lights for the majority of the work day, the hallways of the clean room area have skylights to provide daylighting while still in the clean room garb.
**Second Floor Plan**

The second floor houses the break areas, offices and dining facilities. This area opens onto a garden patio which serves as an area for breaks in nice weather as well as for treatment of grey water and plant root air filtration.
Integrated Block Prototype

This is a prototypical block design for integrated manufacturing and residential neighborhoods. The block has apartments with first story commercial (such as small grocers and dentist offices), second story offices, and third and fourth story apartments on the primary street frontages. On the secondary street frontages there are town houses. Inside this ring of residential and commercial functions is a set of manufacturing spaces. The manufacturing spaces are located primarily on the first floor and basement levels. The roofs of these manufacturing facilities are roof gardens that are used to remediate the plants waste water and bio-solids, while providing the residents a second story backyard area.
**Integrated Commercial and manufacturing**

These are prototype buildings which show the potential for having manufacturing buildings in the interior of the blocks. In these buildings there would be ground floor commercial, second floor offices, and third and fourth floor apartments. These apartment open into a backyard that is on the roof of the manufacturing building behind.
Integrated Town Houses and Manufacturing

These are prototype buildings which show the potential for having manufacturing buildings in the interior of the blocks. In these buildings there would be ground floor Living rooms or offices, a second floor main floor, and third floor bedrooms. These apartment open into a backyard that is on the roof of the manufacturing building behind.
The request for a Salvadoran consulate in East Liberty, Pittsburgh, is an opportunity to reestablish an eroded urban fabric and promote the interests of a foreign country. At present, a comprehensive urban design exists to rebuild the core of East Liberty. It involves significant development in such areas as commercial ventures, civic projects, and public housing. This region of the city also possesses the asset of being situated at major existing and proposed infrastructure avenues.

The site is located on the corner of Larimer Avenue and Broad Street. The west edge is a critical border to a planned public square. It is bordered on the north by a planned development of townhouses, the south by a submerged busway and train tracks, and the east by a public garden.

This project establishes an identity for El Salvador in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. It reaches to be an establishment for local cultural events such as plays, movies, exhibitions, and festivals. Its task is to reveal the culture of the Salvadoran people to Pittsburgh. The public spaces of the building are presented to the open square across the street. This allows for the building to welcome the city. This building and its facilities will not only serve as a physical anchor, but will programmatically serve the economic and social inertia of East Liberty.
**Design Proposals**

Salvadoran Consulate
Joseph Calabrese

**Competition**

This project is a response to the Benedictus award competition sponsored by the DuPont Corporation. The program specified a consulate in an urban context, utilizing the advantages of Butacite, a laminated glass product capable of withstanding significant impacts.

Embassy and consulate design involves high security measures. Recent terrorist activity has forced a reconsideration of safe designs. The strategies for resolving these problems are many. Barrier walls, composite materials, and strategic positioning are effective solutions. They all compose a building which will maintain its urban responsibility and national obligation to promote culture and relations.

**Urban Context**

The challenge encountered in this project was to fit a consulate and consul residence into the context of East Liberty. The project developed around a public square, surrounded by a core of civic buildings, collectively seeking to reestablish a center for a deprived neighborhood. Among projects developed in the studio were a train/bus station with a market annex, a community/youth/senior citizen center, and a Swiss consulate.

On the urban scale, the success of these projects is evident in their response to a public realm; common spaces, paths, and objects connecting the individual projects. More specifically, the public square on which these projects are situated demands the attention of the buildings at its perimeter.

**Culture**

El Salvador is a country whose recent history has been plagued by civil war. It is apparent that this situation has produced an image of a country which is known only for its problems. It is important to realize that these politics do not define the culture of a people. The struggle in this country is to sustain a sense of identity. The people, their customs, traditions, food, and natural surroundings are what existed before this period of war. Looking to these blessings in life provides hope and is what makes change and understanding possible.

The cultural response of this consulate is projected to the community by a series of internal spaces, bordering the public facades. These public spaces consist of a restaurant, atrium, theatre, and gallery. Their adjacency to the outside allows the building to project its influence into the surrounding community.
The consulate is composed of layered spaces. A buffered space occurs between the private office spaces and public open spaces. The exhibition area, restaurant, theatre, and public offices are positioned towards the street. While presenting themselves to the public, they also offer protection to the private sector of the building.

The building is of steel construction with a butacite glass panel wall on the west and north facades. This shield allows for the passage of natural light into the building, yet is able to absorb energy from potential explosions.
Elevation East

Elevation North

Public Realm

Design Proposals
Salvadoran Consulate
Joseph Calabrese

This project represents a joint effort on the part of Akoss Schuppius, a graduate student of the H. John Heinz III School of Public Policy and Management, and Nancy King, a student of the School of Architecture, Carnegie Mellon University.

Ms. Schuppius proposed a hotel development plan. She approached this proposal from an economic perspective, exploring elements of feasibility both through the desirability of a hotel in East Liberty from a marketing point of view as well as the viability of the commercial district within which it would be located.

Ms. King’s project is a response to the former. Her approach is an architectural one exploring the refurbishment and re-use of existing buildings within East Liberty’s commercial core. In addition, aspects of the public realm were explored in order to establish the street as a vital component of the commercial core. The construction of new buildings with prescribed purposes are suggested as an additional means to revitalize the commercial core and assure the feasibility of a hotel in East Liberty. The goal becomes to make something that might be construed as a negative component of Pittsburgh into a jewel.
Introduction - Site Design-Master Plan-Urban Design

The Master Plan for East Liberty called for the resurgence of the commercial district as one of the vital components necessary for the community’s survival. The Master Plan also recognized the existence of several large buildings of historical significance capable of recalling a more prosperous time.

East Liberty could be thought of as a type of “satellite” town center for Pittsburgh. It therefore becomes important to assess any form of intervention to East Liberty in terms of its projected effect on that community as well as to the region as a whole. It is not the intention of this project to detract from Pittsburgh’s urban center. East Liberty needs to discover its own center, unique and distinct from that of Pittsburgh’s Golden Triangle.

Visions for East Liberty’s commercial area include it becoming a service and retail center for its residents as well as for those living in the surrounding communities. Cultural experiences offered through the Jazz Hall of Fame and other venues gives the district the potential to acquire a regional draw with the attractions being distinct from those offered by the Cultural District in downtown Pittsburgh. The streets of East Liberty can become a place to gather socially, with entertainment form the different venues and restaurants spilling out onto the sidewalk.

Unique ethnic offerings through the retail, services, art, and restaurants available within the core become a unique draw. Educational opportunities through the community center, the Jazz Hall of Fame, the Community College extension, and that offered privately add further enrichment to the area.

All of these components together provide the opportunity for an enriched, prosperous whole. The commercial center becomes a place where people want to be. East Liberty regains its reason to be.

The street is a place where people can meet face to face. This project equates a strong retail street with a healthy street life.

The project area becomes the basic commercial district of East Liberty. The center of the proposed commercial core is determined to be the intersection of Penn Avenue and Highland Avenue. This determination was made through observation and the location of several key buildings. Interventions of the public realm emanate from this point.
Pittsburgh's Golden Triangle is a metropolitan core surrounded by satellite town centers of which East Liberty is one.

**The Problem Statement**

The problem statement is the revitalization of the commercial core of East Liberty. Such intervention can be justified due to the potential service such an intervention would provide to the residents of East Liberty and the surrounding communities. The community becomes those people interested in revitalizing their commercial core and using the amenities the core would provide to acquire a sustainable lifestyle. Sustainability requires an access to needed services within a ten minute walking distance to the resident. Using that notion intervention would emanate from the determined center of the core (Penn Ave. and Highland Ave.) and radiate outward to the residential areas. Intervention not only includes the physical (buildings and infrastructure), but includes social and economic considerations as well.

**Site Design Issues:**

- The resolution of Penn Circle and the traffic flow along Penn Ave. will need to be confirmed.

- The public realm will be studied and designed to encourage the pedestrian to explore, socialize, and recreate, as well as utilize the commercial concerns that serve as its boundaries. A safe active street is key to the success of any commercial concern along its edge.

- Commercial buildings within the core will be assessed as to whether they will become part of the redesign of the core. Reasons for keeping a building include historical significance, size, and location. Buildings of special interest include the Liberty Building and the Highland Building. Reasons for recommending the razing of a building might be its poor condition, its lack of utility, or an inability to fit into the program for the revitalization of the commercial core and its public realm.
A similar assessment is necessary for the current uses of the buildings within the commercial core. Additional commercial concerns may be necessary and prescribed.

- Second story usage and high vacancy rates are important considerations and will need to be addressed in order to assure the success of the project.

- Access to the core needs to be addressed not only in terms of the pedestrian usage, but also in terms of the automobile, parking, and bus service.

- Parking will be studied and focus will be on correcting the problem of parking lot wastelands.

- Economic issues include the determination of real estate values and their impact on the rental possibilities within the core.

- The concept of sustainability of a community from a marketing point of view needs to be considered.

The site plan indicates the current land use including parking lots, traffic patterns, a pedestrian radius, and the current bus access.
This project proposes to refurbish two of the buildings in East Liberty's commercial core, namely the Highland building and the Liberty building. These buildings will be physically up-dated and improved and adapted to new use. The public realm that surrounds these buildings will be redesigned.

Several buildings within the core will be proposed as prescribed through the Master Plan, specifically a cinema, a retail concern, and a restaurant/conference facility attached to the Highland building.

The project intends to address the vacant store fronts as well as the empty streets. Facades may be redesigned.

One could argue that there are too few people using the streets within the commercial core. Parking lots create "wastelands" for pedestrians to transverse. Parking along Penn Ave. increases the difficulty of its crossing. The traffic patterns are designed in favor of the automobile rather than the pedestrian. These tactics have created an alienation of the commercial core from the surrounding neighborhoods.

These stated conditions have resulted in the discontinuation of investment (both social and economic) within the core and beyond. The goal becomes to provide incentives to draw people into the core allowing it to become a positive, friendly place to meet, eradicating feelings of intimidation and insecurity.

Definition and design of the street becomes imperative.

Components to be addressed include:
- corners
- doorways
- places to sit
- plazas
- sidewalks
- niches (micro-climates)
- parking
- traffic patterns
- store fronts, windows
- signage
- second story usage
- drinking fountains
- trash containers
- public rest rooms
- landscaping
- open store fronts
- effects of the sun
- time of day
- seasonal changes

These components are used to describe and design the public realm. What is the public realm?...
Where people come face to face.
The commercial core of East Liberty acts as a connector for the surrounding communities. Other interventions proposed for the community should have a symbiotic relationship with the improvements that occur in the core. This should occur through the addressing the physical access of these projects to the core as well as through economic and social issues.

The goal becomes to attract a high number of people into the area and make the streets come alive. Community centers, community colleges, consulates, bus stations, improved housing, and market places all support this goal.

Both the Liberty Building and the Highland Building are proposed as possible sites for a CHOICE Hotel. A hotel in East Liberty is in accordance with the approved Master Plan. The plans of the two buildings as well as the possible amenities of the buildings and their sites will be explored in order to determine the feasibility of such a use. Determinants for feasibility will include both physical and economic factors. Facades and interiors will be restored and/or redesigned in accordance to the prescribed use.
Flow Chart

Product

**Site Design**
- Recognize the issues
- Gather additional data concerning the refurbishment of older buildings to modern usages, the redesign of struggling commercial areas, and the designing of the street

**Urban Design**
- Study the precedent material gathered.
- Apply this data to the issues presented.
- Create alternatives for the described interventions in the commercial core.

**Present Alternatives**
- Select preferred alternative
- Revise chosen alternative
- Design the architecture
- Design the public realm

**The Product**

The product becomes the graphic materials and any other form of representation that is deemed necessary to portray the prescribed intervention for East Liberty's commercial core. This will include but is not limited to:

- Plans, elevations, and sectional drawings of the buildings targeted for refurbishment
- Perspective(s) showing interiors
- Drawings of the streetscape shown through section, perspective, and elevation
- Elevations of the storefronts along Penn Avenue

Prepare the product
- Present final product
- Implementation

Building usages were explored in order to determine what has been successful within the community and what business concerns are struggling. This study is used to determine where the vacancies are and what might be proposed for the vacant space.

The demolition of buildings may be recommended for those structures in a gross state of disrepair, unable to be adapted to a prescribed use, to enable the development and design of a healthy public realm, and to restore a "reason for being" for East Liberty.

Diagrams aid in determining the approach a project might take. The site plan begins to acknowledge the needs for amenities and services East Liberty might have. The plan also indicates the location within the commercial core where these amenities might be located.

The overall condition of the core is assessed in terms of rental vacancies and the physical condition of the buildings.
The Historical Context
Offers a visual connection with the past
Houses memories of events of a more prosperous time
Gives cultural clues of what once was
Asks the question - What could be?
Gives an identity to the community
Offers a sense of continuity

Boundaries define the commercial core of East Liberty. They may become a physical barrier especially for the pedestrian, i.e. the busway.

Sustainability
The radius indicates a ten minute walking distance from the core.
These radii begin to answer the questions: Who will use the commercial core? Who can walk there?
The concept of sustainability is tied to the issues of economic viability and security.
A pedestrian walkway is proposed within the core connecting the neighborhoods with the community college, the commercial core and the bus station.

Visual Landmarks allow for a visual orientation for the pedestrian, driver, and passenger.
Access to and from Pittsburgh is gained through Penn and Centre Aves.

The busway offers a direct connection to downtown Pittsburgh.

Penn and Highland Ave. intersect in the center of the commercial core.

The parking and service areas are located behind the retail areas and in two proposed parking garages. Access is gained through the side streets.

Curb parking is available throughout the commercial area except on Penn.

Penn circle is returned to two way traffic patterns.

 Portions of the original grid are re-established and roads are re-connected.
Site Plan and Axonometric of East Liberty showing proposed buildings and landscaping
The Highland Building

The Highland Building as a hotel can offer 143 rooms. An underground parking lot is proposed in the rear of the building with access off of Centre Ave.

Its visibility within the community is significant.

A new building attached to the Highland is proposed. The purpose for this building includes a state of the art kitchen, small culinary school, coffee/expresso bar, a casual cafe, and retail spaces for the vending of food.

The second floor offers a large meeting area with break out rooms that extend into the Highland building itself.
The Liberty Building as a hotel offers 45 rooms and a smaller more intimate atmosphere. The building adjacent to the proposed hotel has been purchased and razed to make room for a glass addition to the hotel to house a restaurant.
Section through the street showing the side elevation of the Liberty Building along the pedestrian pathway connecting the Liberty to the plaza behind the Highland and ultimately to the bus station.
DESIGN PROPOSALS

The Commercial Core
Nancy King

Penn Ave- North

Perspective showing Penn Ave. looking east and the pedestrian walkway as it connects to Penn Ave.
A Hotel Development Assessment Project

by

Akoss Schuppius
H. John Heinz III School of Public Policy & Management
Acknowledgements

We would like to thank the following individuals and groups for their help in supplying information and expert advice:

Advisory Group

Dr. Mulugetta Birru, Executive Director, Urban Redevelopment Authority (URA)
Ms. Maelene Myers, Executive Director, East Liberty Development, Inc. (ELDI)
Mr. Paul Brecht, Executive Director, East Liberty Quarter Chamber of Commerce (ELQ)
Mr. Paul Strebini, Regional Vice President Development, Choice Hotel
Ms. Cecilia Wandiga, Policy Analyst, City of Pittsburgh Department of Planning
Ms. Yoko Tai, Principal, Tai + Lee Architects P.C.

School Advisors

Mr. Mark Wessel, Associate Dean, H.J. Heinz III School of Public Policy & Management
Mr. David Lewis, Prof of Urban Studies, Department of Architecture, Carnegie Mellon
Table of Contents

Introduction
Description of project
  Prnn and Highland Corridor
  Site Descriptions
  Zoning and Urban Design
Planning Issues
  Transportation
  Community issues

Market Study
Hotel Development
  Need for Project
  Competitive Survey

Economic Feasibility
Facts of Case
  Pro-forma
  Cash Flow Projections

End Notes
Introduction

Description of Project

This project builds on our Master Plan proposal from last semester. The key to the revitalization of East Liberty is to provide the community with a raison d’être and to draw to the neighborhood, residents from other areas. Our paper focused on the cultural heritage of East Liberty by promoting a cultural district that would harbor a jazz hall of fame, the Regent Theater and numerous variety shops.

This paper draws on the aforementioned proposal to promote the development of a hotel within the cultural district. East Liberty has produced prominent personalities in music, the performing arts, and other cultural arenas. The establishment of this district will provide a unique attraction in East Liberty. As Michael Porter states in his article

The Competitive Advantage of the Inner City, “economic activity in and around inner cities will take root if it enjoys a competitive advantage and occupies a niche and improves the quality of life of the residents”.

As a significant component of the revitalization planning efforts, this hotel development project is not a stand alone project. It interconnects with other projects to fit into the overall master plan of this year’s architecture studio:

- community college
- community and cultural center
- consulates
- transportation hub
- hotel development

Penn & Highland Corridor

The Penn and Highland corridor is located at the heart of East Liberty’s commercial and cultural centers. It was once considered the most viable area in the neighborhood. The area was name Gene Kelly Square after the renowned actor Gene Kelly who grew up in East Liberty before making it big in Hollywood.

The two major streets that make up the corridor are Liberty Avenue and Penn Avenue. The street are bounded by other commercial buildings such as retail stores, restaurants, performing arts halls and parking garages. The entire area comprises of about 8-10 blocks with buildings generally close to each other.

The dynamic of the two streets are very different in uses. Penn Avenue is a high pedestrian area with a concentration of business offices, small businesses and restaurants that are very appealing to the people who live in the neighborhood. Highland Avenue on the other hand sees less activity. One thing we are faced with is increasing the pedestrian traffic to have more people visible on the street that are patronizing the shops in the commercial core.
Penn Avenue is made up of a concentration of office buildings, restaurants and small businesses. There is a high traffic count and pedestrian traffic during the day. There are many bus stops along the roads and different number of buses stop at the same locations. There is a mix of land use: commercial (Antons, Boland’s, Revco), offices (East Liberty Development, Chamber of Commerce), institutions (Peabody High, Seminary) and accessory uses such as parking lots.

This mix of land use is what is needed to make the hotel project viable. It enhances the economic vitality of the whole neighborhood. The general structure of the buildings have a blend of an old and a modern touch with different architectural styles. Occupancy is only on the first floor. The tallest buildings on the block is the Liberty Building off of Penn Avenue, and the Highland Building is the tallest structure on Highland Avenue.

For the Assessment Project, our team decided to look at developing a Hotel on what is now The Liberty building and The Highland building sites within the boundaries of the cultural and commercial cores of East Liberty. The reason we chose these sites are primarily because of their locations and the beauty of the structures. The boundaries of the commercial and culture districts, extends along both Penn and Highland Avenues. There are a significant considerations that need to take place to make both the districts and the projects viable. For the sake of this paper, we have chosen to set certain conditions in place

- revitalization efforts completed
- new perception of East Liberty
  (less crime, cleaner streets, better parking)
- new and vibrant Regent Theater

On these sites, we hope to develop a hotel to service the need of the Regent Theatre and Jazz Hall of Fame visitors, corporate conferences, long term stay, consulate visitors, and convention goers.

Because the two sites are located in the heart of the proposed commercial and cultural districts, there vitality should be sustained for the years to come. The proximity to the Regent, Oakland, the busway etc... is an added plus.

The area is well serviced by PAT and for those traveling by car, there are parking garages at the rear of the buildings.
Site Descriptions

The Liberty Building is located at 6101 Penn Avenue. Historical named the Liberty National Bank in 1894, the building was built at the beginning of East Liberty’s most successful commercial period. The building is located on a visible corner site on the main axis of the East Liberty commercial district. The 6 story semi-attached flat roofed office building is a large rectangular block of textural ashlar.

The Liberty National Bank Building is a serene and graceful example of the Richardsonian Romanesque style which had become extremely popular in Pittsburgh since H.H. Richardson’s 1888 Allegheny County Courthouse. Solid and rugged, the building’s style was well-suited for Pittsburgh’s tough “steel city” image, and for commercial institutions especially banks. The building currently owned by the City of Pittsburgh, has been vacant for approximately seven years. The interior of the building has an original skylight that lights up the upper five stories, an open metal stairway with matching railings and marble treads. As a result of seven years of vacancy, the condition of the interior has deteriorated. The roof has caved in certain part allowing rains to damage the interior. The interior of the building needs total reconstruction.

The Highland Building, built in 1910 is a 13 story, masonry and steel office building with a full basement. It is located at 121 South Highland Avenue. The site contains 9,277 square feet, according to Allegheny County Records. It has 98.47’ of frontage on South Highland Avenue. The site is level, and at street grade. All public utilities are available and connected to the subject site. South Highland Avenue is a local, two-lane city street which is paved and improved with street lights, storm drains, curbs, sidewalks, and fire hydrants. There is an alley on each side of the building. They are paved, and are one-way in opposite directions. Overall, the Highland building is considered in average condition. The roof appears to be in good condition and the interior conditions are ranged from fair to good.

Unlike the Liberty Building, the Highland does not need total rehabilitation.
Zoning and Urban Design

The purpose of zoning ordinances is to regulate the use of land within the area. Zoning can be used to maintain a consistent pattern of development or exclude others from entering the area. The zoning classification for our particular site is the xxx. The impact on the zoning code to our particular site will allow us to proceed with the type of development that we propose. The development of a Hotel will provide the amenities.

However, we must address several issues such as the 20% required amount of open space on our development site, preserving the historic nature of the existing buildings as described by the Cultural Trust, pedestrian flow and traffic count, height requirements, adequate parking accommodations, architectural relationships with nearby buildings and vitality that the development will bring to the corridor in order for our project to receive approval from the planning commission. The requirements of the zoning commission stipulate that we evaluate the effects of our development on the nearby buildings, and make our site provides open space.

Zoning regulations attempt to create an environment that is appropriate in terms of planning and urban design concerns. The open space requirement effectively works to ensure that the landscape is not completely dominated by skyscrapers and massive parking lots. In fact, the open space requirement promotes an environment that is pedestrian friendly and allows the area to appear more active and vibrant.

The height requirements attempt to ensure that there is a consistent development in the immediate area and permits one development site to overshadow the other. Also, the use of zoning ordinance allows the city of Pittsburgh to promote development that is consistent with the overall plan or vision the East Liberty neighborhood.

There are several factors to the urban design of the Penn and Highland corridors. This will enable are sites to build off the consistent uses of surrounding areas. For the development of a hotel there need to be sufficient attractions for people to enjoy in the surrounding area. Restaurants and shops would be an attraction for hotel visitors as they seek to explore the East Liberty area and the city of Pittsburgh.

A fundamental target of our entire proposal is the economic revitalization of East Liberty. Our proposed urban design is intended to stimulate the economic activity of East Liberty’s commercial core.
Planning Issues

**Transportation**

In terms of transportation, we noted that access to the area was rather good but changes and improvements needed to be made to positively impact the development efforts. Parking spaces are filled from 9:00am to 5:00pm. Commute to downtown Pittsburgh is also very effective because of the busway that connect East Liberty to downtown. The busway and other major arteries will enable visitors to the East Liberty neighborhood to easily commute to areas like the North Side, South Side, Homestead, Monroeville Mall, etc.

**Community issues**

Some of the issues that have plagued the community are the perception of high crime and low safety and vendors on street corners. Others issues are associated with cleanliness and attractiveness such as litter, old trash receptacles; lack of residential properties; big businesses versus small businesses ownerships; nuisance bars; extension of cultural district/historical designations; ongoing infrastructure improvements; renovations versus constructions of properties, relocation and retention of existing businesses.

We solicited feedbacks from residents about our project and the overall revitalization efforts. Some residents welcomed the idea and shared their perspective on how a hotel development would positively impact the neighborhood. Others showed concern about all the attention the neighborhood was getting. It is their belief that like the Hill District, many of them will soon be displaced.
Market Study

Hotel Development

The successful development of hotels and tourist facilities depends on many factors, which can be grouped generally under five headings:

- **Marketing** an increasing and unsatisfied demand for accommodation stemming from the tourism, recreation and business attractions of a locality.

- **Economics** the state of the economy and financial inducements or constraints which may favor or restrict investment.

- **Location** availability of appropriate sites with adequate infrastructural services and opportunities for development.

- **Enterprise** correct interpretation of requirements and entrepreneurial organization of the necessary finance and expertise to successfully implement a project.

- **Planning and design** careful planning and design of facilities to create an attractive hotel which will satisfy the marketing, functional and financial criteria.

A hotel is defined as a public establishment offering travellers and temporary visitors, against payment, two basic services: accommodation and meals. The precise definition of what constitutes a hotel and conditions for hotel registration and grading are set out in more than one hundred classification systems worldwide operated by governmental and representative agencies.

The acquisition of existing hotels may be funded in part by the purchase and simultaneous sale and lease-back of the property or site. The method of leasing capital assets (property, land) is also used to reduce company borrowings and is particularly important in times of low growth in property values. Hotel development involves a high investment intensity with a long-term commitment of the bulk of the capital in fixed assets. Revenues are invariably dictated by external conditions and profit margins affected by operating expenses. Investments in hotels tends to follow cyclical changes in economic growth. Hotel development tends to occur in cycles when investment is favoured and this may lead to overbuilding with the resultant competition lowering occupancies and profitability. Hotel Development is often used as a means of stimulating and supporting other commercial investment in urban development schemes. Thus, this project fits well into the revitalization planning and design of the entire studio.
**Need for Project**

When evaluating a host community or facility for an event, associations, meeting planners, and event promoters consider a number of market resources as a part of the site selection process. The availability of sufficient quality meeting and hotel space are rated as first or near first priority by association and convention planners. Accessibility such as, ease of transportation, transportation costs and distance from event attendees is also important characteristic to event planners when selecting a host community.

The Pittsburgh area is well situated to take advantage of emerging regional shifts in national markets. These national markets are accessible by various transportation modes including a network of interstate highways and major international airport which is the 15th busiest in the nation. It is expected to increase its activity by the year 2000 as the new $800 million Midfield Terminal makes its impact. Projected economic benefits from the project over the next 20 years are estimated to be roughly $9 billion. Estimates of potential job creation range up to 24,000. The Pittsburgh region in addition has a strong corporate presence and is home to major banking and finance organizations.

In evaluating the market potential for East Liberty, there are four types of users that represent the major segments of the market:

- **Regent Theater attraction and Jazz Hall of Fame**
- **Corporate conferences**
- **Conventions and trade shows**
- **Long-term stay**

We based our market segment on other development projects that our occurring in the East Liberty neighborhood. We hope to attract to our hotel, visiting professors and student of the community college in East Liberty and other local area universities; visitors to the three consulates in the area, tourists, performers and corporate visitors.

Of the hotels we surveyed, all reported that half of their clientele were business people attending meetings in Pittsburgh. The other half is made up of visiting professors, tourists and conventions goers.

In average, Jazz Hall of Fames attract hundreds of people both locally and from outside the region of location. The Regent Theater hopes to attract that same amount on a monthly basis by scheduling national events that will bring to East Liberty both performers and visitors from outside the city of Pittsburgh.

As the Convention and trade show event venue continues to be an effective means of promoting products and services, the scope of the convention, trade show and meeting market is anticipated to experience steady growth over the next several years.

Based on information provided in Trade Show Week’s Quarterly Report, the following figures represent growth in trade shows over the past 10 years.\(^7\)
Although the trade show industry growth slowed appreciably in 1991 and 1992, 1993 data, as well as preliminary estimates for 1994 through 1999 indicate continued steady growth of between 3 and 5 percent over the next 5 years.
Design Proposals

A Hotel Development Project
Akoss Schuppius

Competitive Survey

Unlike the 80’s, the late 90’s is seeing tremendous need for new hotel stock. Cities like Seattle, Virginia and Houston are seeing growth in the numbers of businesses and tourist travelers. To remain competitive, both new and renovated hotels of all sizes need to make changes in their design, their amenities and their operation.

Like the trend in Asia, our hotel development links to other uses such as offices, recreation, shopping, dining and transportation.  

Liberty Building:

The three hotels we have chosen to look at in our competitive survey are the The Priori, Shadyside Bed & Breakfast and The Appletree B&B.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name, Address &amp; Phone</th>
<th>Rooms</th>
<th>Suites</th>
<th>Single</th>
<th>Double Rates</th>
<th>Parking</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Priori</td>
<td>21 rms</td>
<td>3 suites</td>
<td>$92-102</td>
<td>Free</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>614 Pressley Street</td>
<td></td>
<td>all dbls</td>
<td>Free</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Side Pittsburgh</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(412) 231-3338</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Shadyside Bed & Breakfast
5516 Fifth Avenue
Shadyside Pittsburgh
(412) 683-6501

The Priori

The Priori formerly a church is a privately owned family business. It is located in Pittsburgh’s North Side in the area of the Civic Arena. There are a total of 21 rooms and 3 suite all doubles. Average rate for the rooms are around $92-12. The hotel has no restaurants because of its small size but there are several restaurants located in the vicinity. Attached to the Hotel is a reception room area operated it by another groups. The receptions area host weddings and other big celebrations. Parking at the hotel is free to clients. There is provided access from the airport (18 miles away) to the hotel via a airport and hotel shuttle service. The hotel is located less than 1 mile from downtown.
Shadyside Bed & Breakfast

The Shadyside Bed & Breakfast is located on one of Pittsburgh’s main thoroughfare (Fifth Avenue). Rates vary with occupancy. Single room rates average around $85 while double rates average at around $135. Like the Priori, this hotel provides free parking for client but does not have a restaurant. Airport Shuttle Service provides access to the Pittsburgh Airport located 22 miles away. The hotel is located 4.5 miles from downtown Pittsburgh.

The Appletree B&B

The Appletree B&B is also located in Shadyside, 4 miles from downtown Pittsburgh and 20 miles from the Pittsburgh International Airport. The hotel only has 4 suites. Single and double rates vary between $95-125. There is no restaurants in the hotel but parking is provided for clients.

Highland Building:

The three hotels we have chosen to look at in our competitive survey for the Highland Building are the Hampton Inn, the Holiday Inn and the Shadyside Inn.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name, Address &amp; Phone</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hampton Inn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3315 Hamlet Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakland Pittsburgh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(412) 681-1000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>133 rms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58 suites $79 sgl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$89 dbl 0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Holiday Inn University Ctr.
100 Lython Avenue
Oakland Pittsburgh
250 rms
3 suites $128 sgl
$141 dbl 16
Shadyside Inn
5405 Fifth Avenue
Shadyside Pittsburgh
(412) 682-230
595 rms
47 suites $89 sgl
$120 dbl 22
Hampton Inn  
There are a total of 133 rooms and 58 suites. Average rate for the rooms for singles are around $79 and $89 for doubles. The hotel has no meeting rooms and no restaurant. Parking at the hotel is free to clients and the hotel is in compliance with ADA. The hotel provides airport shuttle service to downtown located approximately 4 miles away and to the airport (17 miles).

Holiday Inn University Center  
The Holiday Inn University Center is also located in Oakland. Room rates at the Holiday in average at around $128 for singles and $141 for doubles. The hotel charges $12/day for parking but provides Airport Shuttle Service to the Pittsburgh International Airport located 18 miles away. The hotel is located 3 miles from downtown Pittsburgh. Unlike the Hampton Inn, this hotel has 16 meeting rooms and a restaurant.

The Shadyside Inn  
The Shadyside Inn is also located in Shadyside, 4.5 miles from downtown Pittsburgh and 22 miles from the Pittsburgh International Airport. The hotel only has 100 suites. Single and double rates vary between $89-120. There is no restaurants in the hotel but parking is provided for clients free of charge. The hotel has one meeting room but there is no business center.
Fact of Case 11

Hard Cost
Land 9,277 @ $17.50 = $162,000
Building 97,995 @ $22.50 = $2,197,463
Acquisition $1,500,000
Rehab 97,995 @ $44 = $4,297,260

Parking Cost
Above ground garage $12,000

Soft Cost
Architecture & engineering (A&E) 6% of construction cost
Overhead 3% of hard costs + A&E
Construction interest 8% of hard costs
Permits $.25/sf of blg
Legal fees $60,000
Misc. $10,000
Financing fees 3% of total hard and soft costs

Tax rate $41,788
Land $30,000 @ 184.5 mils
Building $295,000 @ 32 mils
School $325,000 @ 46 mils
County $325,000 @ 46 mils

Contingency 8% of Operating costs
Loan Repayment Straight amortization, 15 years @ 5%
Equity 20% of Total cost
Grant 10% of Total cost

Operating Costs (per annum)
Utilities $1.35/gsf
### Design Proposals

**A Hotel Development Project**

Akoss Schuppius

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Service</th>
<th>Cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Janitor</td>
<td>$.70/gsf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintenance</td>
<td>$.50/gsf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mgmt &amp; Adm.</td>
<td>$2.00/gsf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insurance</td>
<td>$.05/gsf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security</td>
<td>$.25/gsf</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Revenue (leasing)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Rate/sf</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Short-term stay</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>$11/sf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commercial</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>$20/sf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long-term stay</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>$15/sf</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

7. *Historical Annual Trade Show Growth Rate, Exhibit 1.*
11. *All assumptions based on Financial Feasibility Template (Prof. Rahaim) and Highland Blg. Appraisal.*
The Urban Context

This project has been completed as the second part of a yearlong study. The first part entailed the analysis and masterplanning of East Liberty, located in eastern Pittsburgh. It is a neighborhood characterized by a ring road surrounding a stagnating commercial core. Immediately beyond the ring road to the east and west are large high-rise blocks of public housing. The primary components of the masterplan solution entailed the elimination of the ring road and the redevelopment of the high-rises as higher-density, low-rise units with a mixture of rental and homeownership properties. Infrastructure improvements are made in order to facilitate access (pedestrian and vehicular) from neighboring communities. Several surrounding residential districts are 'knitted-in' to East Liberty by building up previously abandoned or underutilized lots. An economic analysis of the region was completed as well as extensive physical analysis. A public square is the final piece, providing a focus and transition between the residential, commercial and industrial zones. Buildings such
as a technical school, marketplace, transit station and public library are placed around the square.

The study included (among other drawings) the before-and-after images pictured on the cover page, a series of analysis drawings and this series of design diagrams.

The site chosen for the consulate places it in a location well suited to its function as both a cultural and economic emissary. The site is between the commercial corridor along Penn Avenue to the west and the enlarged and densified industrial zone proposed to the east. The building faces the public square, giving it excellent public access and making it an important public building on the new civic center of the region. The site itself spans across the area's major public transportation link which is in a below-grade cut. The Martin Luther King Jr. express busway is a direct link to Pittsburgh's downtown as well as other neighborhoods.

The consulate is allowed three points of access, pedestrian and public access along Penn Avenue and two vehicular, one in and one out, located behind the building. The vehicular access provides a VIP entrance and formal reception area, a loading dock, a very limited above ground parking area and a ramp to the below-grade parking garage. The construction of the garage is an efficient way of filling up the existing ravine above which the consulate is to be built.

The consular residence is located at the back of the site, with its formal entrance axially aligned with the public and formal entrances to the consulate itself. A 10 foot high wall runs around the remainder of the site. It is however, made of laminated glass as well so that the plantings on-site and off-site create and visual link and further strengthen the public presence of the edifice.
masterplan axonometric
A Swiss Consulate in Pittsburgh

*image*

The design priority is that of security. The protection of the consular employees from the threats of terrorism, visible everywhere in our modern world, is of the utmost importance. However, a consulate need not be a fortress of concrete and steel, giving more the impression of a barrack than that of a cultural liaison. Today’s consulates need not be so imposing. One can strive to create a ‘castle’ not of stone, but of glass: a shimmering symbol of diplomacy in an urban context of hope and renewal.

*parti*

In order to accomplish both openness and security the following diagram was developed: all programmatic spaces are divided into two primary blocks, one containing principal official functions, the other containing support spaces. Between these two blocks is a four story atrium, which opens onto the street. The atrium contains all of the consulate’s public functions: visa processing, exhibition, travel agency offices, etc. At its opposite end is located a large, convex wall at the base of which is the main security checkpoint. All vertical circulation, and therefore all access to secure areas, is beyond the checkpoint, as is the VIP reception area. Thus the public spaces are central to the building, yet the rest of the building remains secure. The building
Diagram also places the primary circulation paths along the east, west and south facades, allowing for an integration of laminated glass.

**culture**

Although it is important that the building be secure, it is equally important that it be Swiss. Upon entering the atrium one is confronted by a number of Swiss themes. The convex security wall is reminiscent of the giant Swiss hydroelectric dams such as the one at Saas Fee, high in the Swiss Alps. The roof of the atrium is a series of folded glass skylights, their crystalline forms crowning the wall with mountain-like undulations. Beneath the skylights a footbridge spans the atrium, crossing the void as so many Swiss bridges do, gliding effortlessly over enormous alpine ravines. This particular bridge is a replica of one of the bridges of Robert Maillart, the Swiss structural engineer who made many innovations in the use of reinforced concrete. This version, however, is made of laminated glass, demonstrating the amazing changes in building technology during this past half-century.

**conception**

The building attempts to express three architectural elements: the simple, rectilinear floor-plates which are given a dimension by their programmatic requirements, the programmatic ‘objects’ such as the auditorium and the conference rooms, which are treated as independent objects and the skin which acts as a literal skin or wrapper, a sort of fabric wrapped tightly around the other two elements. The floor plates are simple rectangles, and are organized in two blocks: office spaces and service spaces, which are separated by the atrium. The objects are
Design Proposals
Swiss Consulate
Adrian LeBuffe

allowed to take their natural form and dimensions, based on a number of factors: solar access, circulation, security, and their relationship to other functions, but never to the floor-plates. The objects and floor-plates are then superimposed in such a way as to create a functional whole which contains appropriate, though often surpris­ing relationships between spaces. The skin is then stretched over the interior structures and allowed to bulge and deform wherever a volume or structural member protrudes. This can be done quite literally as the skin system is cable-mounted and regulated so as to maintain a degree of tension under variable loading situations.

Enclosure
Although most modern curtainwalls are generally considered skins, they are generally restrained by their dependency upon gravity and their attachment at each floor-plate. The consulate’s system can behave more like a skin due to the fact that it is connected to primary structural members at the eave and then directly to the foundation. The structural system is derived from the need to maximize human safety in the event of an attack upon the building. The primary structural members (as seen in the axonom­etric at bottom) are rigid frames of trussed steel, doubled at the front facade for increased stability, connected by beams for lateral stability. There are two sets of these frames, the two behind the security wall being independent of the four in front of it. There are also two corresponding independent foundations so that in the case of a large-scale attack upon the building, the destruction of one half will not cause the collapse of the other. All floor slabs and other programmatic pieces are supported by freestanding steel frame constructions.

Materiality
Although the entire exterior of the building is made of laminated glass, there are elements which require a degree of opacity, such as the convex wall (which contains security offices and restrooms) and the auditorium. All such objects are defined by perforated metal panels which are doubled-up wherever acoustical and light level control are necessary. The primary structural frame is painted red and the secondary is painted white.

Energy
Due to the demands of security, the enclosure system described above is wrapped around the entire exterior of the building, creating a giant glass box. If not properly designed, such a building would require a tremendous amount of energy to
condition the space. In accordance with the Swiss' concern for conservation this building will not only employ a number of passive conditioning techniques, but will become a showcase for the experimentation with and display of a vast array of passive heating, cooling and ventilation mechanisms. The entire southern facade is sloped to receive maximum solar radiation where a double-envelope system is employed. In the winter the air in the cavity between the two layers of glass is heated and rises to the HVAC intake at the top, where it can be recirculated by the building’s forced hot-air system. The sheds and skylights in the atrium also serve to heat the air along the roof plenum which is then drawn through intakes along the edge of the atrium ceiling into the heating system. In the summer vents near the ceiling of each floor are opened as are exterior vents at the top of the double-envelope. As the air in the cavity becomes superheated and rises filtered air is introduced via subterranean tubes, drawing the much cooler air (approx. 60°) through the building and allowing for totally passive cooling and ventilation. Other facades employ other systems such as trombe and water walls which provide evening heating in the winter and constant ventilation in the summer. Other experimental systems could be installed as part of an ongoing research effort.
3rd floor plan

Consular Offices

Conference 3

Office

Formal Dining

Kitchen

3rd floor plan

4th floor plan

Office

Conference 2

Cafeteria

This section describes the so-called Public Realm. This term refers to the spaces that lie in between all of the private lots of the city. This applies to streets and alleys, parks and highways, sidewalks and street facades. It is the spaces and the amenities that bind together our cities and give definition to our parks. It is the street furnishings such as benches and bus stops and bollards, signs and sidewalks and street paving. In order to create a sense of civic pride and community in East Liberty we have proposed this series of amenities, details and layouts. This section contains drawings of these proposals.
Design Proposals

The Public Realm
Adrian LeBuffe

before

and

after

images of east liberty

Design Proposals
The Public Realm
Adrian LeBuffe

Images of East Liberty

Design Proposals

The Public Realm
Adrian LeBuffe

lighting our streets...
& our neighborhoods

a neighborhood
& its street-faces

trash cans ...

& tree grates
East Liberty Transportation Center, Architectural Program

The urban analysis in Volume One of the East Liberty Study demonstrated the need for a transportation center. The large number of bus routes through East Liberty bring many people through the commercial core of the area. Despite the considerable amount of traffic through the area, pedestrians and patrons of public transportation have not been adequately provided for. The bus shelters are too small and too few, and do not provide protection from the weather, and do not provide a safe and well-lit place to wait for the bus.

The transportation center proposed here will include the following: a park and ride facility consisting of a parking garage and access to the bus expressway, a market, cafes and restaurants, small retail and commercial businesses, and other service oriented stores.

The square serves as a near by focal point and an activity center which will strengthen pedestrian activity. The programmed square will include an outdoor skating rink, paved trails, open green space, areas for Community Center exhibitions, stalls for a farmer’s market and local vendors, and many seating areas.

The square will also create a strong link between the transportation center and other locations around the square such as the retirement home, the community center, small businesses, and the consulate.

Park and Ride

The park and ride will consist of the following: 500 car parking garage which will provide parking for commuters, the market, and other adjacent businesses. Immediate access from the garage to the bridge to the platforms is provided for expedient travel from the car to the bus. Handicapped access is provided for both platforms, both inbound and outbound.

Market

The main purpose of the market is to serve the function of the existing supermarket in a location more central to the core of East Liberty, more accessible to those riding the bus, and to provide a convenience to those commuters using the facility. Market stalls will offer produce, baked goods, meats, flowers, plants, dairy products, and dry goods.

Retail and Commercial

The retail stores located outside of the market are directed towards providing convenient services and amenities to consumers. These stores will include: a cafe/ coffee shop, dry cleaners, a convenience store, a video rental shop, and take-out-only food stands. There will also be several kiosks located within the center, to be rented to local vendors.

Outdoor Space

Outdoor space will be provided for the facility directly to the south and east of the building. This landscaped and hardscaped space will be used for the cafe’s outdoor seating, additional space for local vendors to set up stands, and public space for patrons of the transportation center to relax outside.

Direct access from the outdoor space to the bridge connecting with the platforms is provided.
Site Plan

This site plan shows the positioning of East Liberty Station and its parking garage along the busway. The public square, closely related to this project, is located to the north east across Penn Ave. The public square will provide stalls for an outdoor farmer's market in the summer, as well as other vendors located within the market.
First Floor Plan and Courtyard

The first floor can be reached via the pedestrian bridge from the parking garage, through the main entrance off of Center Ave., or through the courtyard.

The courtyard offers semi-private/public space for patrons of East Liberty Station, the market, and the public in general. The area is covered with shade trees and planters, as well as seating. A ‘water wall’ on the south-eastern side of the courtyard to provide white noise to conceal the sound of traffic on the busway. The seating in the courtyard will be used by people relaxing, enjoying lunch, or some coffee from the cafe, located immediately off the courtyard.

Some of the other amenities included in the first floor include large restrooms, lockers and telephones for commuters’ convenience.
Center Avenue Elevation

Penn Avenue Elevation

Elevations and Section

The East Liberty Station is a modern building, sensitive to the historic building types that surround it. Adjacent to the station on the western side of Center Ave. is a block of antique stores and small galleries. The architecture and scale of the station relate to that of these neighboring stores by diminishing in height towards these smaller scale buildings, while relating well to pedestrians through the continuous outdoor arcade.

The building stands strong on the corner of Penn and Center, providing a strong corner presence and an edge for the public square.

The section shows the interior of the station. The main atrium space is a two and a half story space offering seating, shopping, and plenty of natural sunlight. The first floor shops provide services and amenities convenient to commuters, other bus patrons, and East Liberty residents alike.
This section shows the relation of the parking garage to the busway. The entrance to the parking garage is located off of Highland Avenue. The garage is located behind the block to the west of the station down Penn Ave, between the buildings and the busway.
East Liberty
Systems Synthesis

East Liberty Station

Report by Jackson Tam
Background

Transportation has had a tremendous role in the history of East Liberty. In the form of turnpikes and rail lines, it was one of the primary elements contributing to the neighborhood’s development. Early on, East Liberty’s flat topography and centralized location were recognized and built upon as a node, climaxing in the area being referred to as Pittsburgh’s “second downtown”.

But with the proliferation of automobiles and the opening of suburbs, such as Monroeville, East Liberty began to lose its vitality as a commercial center. Unfortunately, efforts to restore East Liberty were shortsighted and ultimately more damaging than helpful. This was seen in the 1950’s and 1960’s attempts of revitalization by transforming the neighborhood into a pedestrian mall. Among these efforts was the conversion of Penn Circle into a one way ring road, the restriction of automobile access on many primary roads, and the enlargement of sidewalks. Instead of helping, the ring road made access into East Liberty difficult, pedestrian streets meant shoppers could no longer pull up alongside shops, and large sidewalks dispersed those remaining shoppers, making them seem even fewer. Rather than reinventing East Liberty and restoring its heartbeat, the two decades of urban design surgery succeeded only in cutting off circulation. Aggravating the condition was similar short-sightedness in housing in which individual houses were replaced with impersonal and poorly designed apartment buildings. Efforts were made in the 1980’s and early 1990’s to correct these errors, such as facade improvements and the reopening of streets to traffic, but these were ultimately cosmetic changes to a dying patient.

One of the goals of the new East Liberty Station will be to re-link the heart of East Liberty, i.e., its commercial core, to a steady supply of life and vitality. Streetcars at one time acted as the neighborhood’s veins and arteries. The over 10,000 current commuters 1 who pass through daily on the express busway or local bus routes as well as those commuting by car into Downtown can be tapped with a park-and-ride facility for the purpose of revitalization. This facility would not be a simple parking lot or bus stop, but rather a gateway structure, with its shops and commuting amenities, that frames East Liberty in a new light. It would be one of the much needed initial components to neighborhood revitalization and would show to the commuter that the heart of East Liberty is not only still beating but one day can beat as it once did.

Program

East Liberty Station, the current primary bus station of the neighborhood, is simply a municipal shelter. It is an uninviting, outdoor structure with a connection to the express busway. Its design is very much in the style of the ring road and other urban design failures in East Liberty. In terms of its program, the station functions solely as a bus stop that exists in-between where people are coming from and where people are going to. It speaks nothing of the history nor the potential of the neighborhood.

Our proposed East Liberty Station will be much more than a bus stop. Located at the same location, our project will take advantage of the high visibility of the site and the existing transit corridor. For all the commuters who just pass through East Liberty and for the people who drive in search of a Downtown parking space, our facility will be a threshold for them into the neighborhood’s commercial core. Beyond that, our facility will be a threshold past the misconceptions of crime and decay packaged by the news media and into East Liberty’s past glory and future potential.

The station will include the following:

- Parking Garage: total of 500 spaces for park-and-ride users, local business patrons, and local employees.
- Farmer’s Market: 23,000 SF of produce, meat, fish, and baked goods that replaces the currently existing one that is only open weekly. It will be operated by individual vendors from the neighborhood.
- Shops: There will be numerous shops, ranging from 200 SF to 2,000 SF. They will be targeted towards the commuter, emphasizing convenience.
- Dry Cleaners: actual cleaning will be done off-site. Just for pickup and drop-off. This can be a satellite of an existing neighborhood dry cleaner.
- Video Store
- Photocopy / Fax Center
- Espresso Bar / Cafe which can spill into outdoor areas in good weather
- Takeout Food with seating available in the waiting areas
- Convenience store / Newsstand
- Small Offices will provide quick access for commuters and a large potential clientele for local entrepreneurs. Offices are small, but have privileges to the Photocopy / Fax Center.
- Stalls: such as for shoe shine or repair can be located in the open areas outside the

1 PATransit Monthly Ridership Report (Dec. 96) indicates a potential 34,216 people pass through East Liberty daily on the express or local bus routes. 45.8% of these have stops in East Liberty.
shops. Control will be needed to regulate the number, type, and quality of these stalls.

- **Common Areas**: such as a locker area, indoor/outdoor waiting areas, and community business advertisement/display area.
- **Drive-in Theatre**: will be located on the top level of the garage which is uncovered.

**Linkages**

The East Liberty Station will not exist as an isolated entity, but rather a component of a larger neighborhood revitalization strategy. It is linked to several of the other proposed projects as well as several existing businesses.

By channeling some of the commuters into the neighborhood’s commercial core, the station will heighten awareness of local businesses and boost economic activity. Besides the design of the building and the presence it would provide, the station would offer space for advertisement of neighborhood businesses as well as set aside some of the parking spaces for patrons of those businesses. It will benefit as well as benefit from commuters that use the nearby services such as the day care (which is located in the proposed community center), banks, and post office. Possibly, an incentive program could be developed that would encourage commuters to try out participating neighborhood businesses. In addition, the proposed square across the street from the station will host fairs, markets, and live performances during good weather and thus the station will provide a convenient arrival place for nonresidents who commute or drive.

The station will offer services and amenities of its own that could also benefit local businesses. There is the parking garage, as mentioned before, that could provide secure parking spaces to shoppers. Furthermore, the top level of the garage will feature a drive-in theatre during the evenings. This would benefit local restaurants as well as the proposed branch of the CCAC.

The station benefits the local community in several ways as well. Many jobs will be created during construction as well as during occupancy. It will provide opportunities for small East Liberty start-up companies with the small offices it houses and also a more permanent location and shelter for qualified street vendors. The farmer’s market will also provide additional jobs and opportunities for residents.

**Market Study**

What needs to be described in this section is whether there is a market for the components of the East Liberty Station. The components to be examined are the parking garage, the farmer’s market, and the transit center (which is composed of service spaces as well as the commuter oriented retail stores).

**The Parking Garage**

This structure will be 4 stories tall (with one below ground) and house 500 cars or 550 cars if the parking garage practice of stacking is used. This garage will allow drivers heading Downtown to leave their cars in East Liberty and take an express bus which will get them there in under 10 minutes. The target group will be the people who drive Downtown from surrounding neighborhoods (Shadyside, Squirrel Hill North, Highland Park, Morningside, Friendship, and East Liberty). These people do not have a quick access to the parkway and would thus benefit from the time and cost savings the parking garage and express busway has to offer.

On the following page, Figure 1, shows parking deficit, i.e. where demand for parking space surpasses what is available. The parking deficit is highest in the central area of the CBD. It is important to note that the route of the express bus (indicated by the dotted line) in Downtown will serve those areas adequately.

The range of prices of Downtown parking is indicated in Figure 2. The Pittsburgh Parking Authority has differentiated three parking zones: the North Side, the South Side, and the Golden Triangle (which includes the peripheral Strip District parking). The latter two zones do not offer the convenience of most Golden Triangle parking but makes up for it in its lower price. There are two main drawbacks to
parking on the North or South Sides. First is the extra walking distance between the lot and the workplace; though it is only a few minutes of walking, the walk could be uncomfortable in bad weather because pedestrians must use bridges to cross the river. Second, cars will be parked there uncovered in contrast to the parking garage of the East Liberty Station. In addition, the marginal price differences between the Golden Triangle and the North and South Sides will decrease in the future since various projects on the shores are in development such as the new Alcoa headquarters, North Side housing, and the expansion of Station Square. These projects will cut into the available parking around them as well as add demand and thus increase parking rates.

Using Pittsburgh Parking Authority 1995 data and weighing monthly rates by the number of spaces available at that rate, we arrive at the following:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Monthly Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Golden Triangle:</td>
<td>$196.27/month</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Side    :</td>
<td>$128.37/month</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Side    :</td>
<td>$129.43/month</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Liberty  :</td>
<td>$95/month (proposed; includes year round bus pass)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Net Parking Deficit Pittsburgh Parking Authority 1995 Study

- 0-149 spaces
- 149-299
- 299-450
- 450-600
- over 600

East Liberty is a viable alternative to driving Downtown because of the lower parking rates (its derivation is explained in the feasibility section) as well as the express busway which has buses leaving every 4 minutes in rush hour and getting there in under 10 minutes. As noted before, walking distance is minimal because of the good coverage of the bus route.

A look at the demographics of East Liberty and the surrounding neighborhoods will indicate if there is a market for the 300 (of 550) parking spaces designated for park-and-ride. The Pittsburgh Downtown Partnership estimates that there are 134,000 people working downtown. If we temporarily ignore suburbs outside Allegheny County such as Monroeville and Wexford, and assume these workers came from within Allegheny County then the percentage of people who work downtown would be 20.8% (or 134,000 of the 645,399 people labor force of Allegheny County as recorded in the 1990 census). If we make one more assumption, and assume that each neighborhood has 20.8% of its own labor force working downtown, then we get the data found in Table 2 on the following page. On the table, after determining an estimate of downtown workers per neighborhood, 1990 census data of percentage of automobile or
Table 2: Approximate Downtown Commuters by Neighborhood

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Neighborhood</th>
<th>Approximate Number of Downtown Employees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>East Liberty</strong></td>
<td>= 134,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Shady Side</strong></td>
<td>= 20.8% of the labor force</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor Force Working Downtown = 20.8% (8,386)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (52.9% Drive to work)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (24% use Public Transit)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Squirrel Hill North</strong></td>
<td>= 1,744 people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor Force Working Downtown = 20.8% (6,092)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (49.9% Drive to work)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (9.8% use Public Transit)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Highland Park</strong></td>
<td>= 1,267 people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor Force Working Downtown = 20.8% (3,684)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (66.9% Drive to work)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (22.1% use Public Transit)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>East Liberty</strong></td>
<td>= 1,208 people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor Force Working Downtown = 20.8% (3,307)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (40.6% Drive to work)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (44.1% use Public Transit)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Morningside</strong></td>
<td>= 3,888 people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor Force Working Downtown = 20.8% (1,866)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (75.3% Drive to work)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (16.7% use Public Transit)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Friendship</strong></td>
<td>= 2,373 people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor Force Working Downtown = 20.8% (1,139)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (38.2% Drive to work)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (43.6% use Public Transit)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Approximate Number of Downtown Employees</th>
<th>= 134,000</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>20.8% of the labor force</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Shady Side</strong></td>
<td>= 1,744 people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor Force Working Downtown = 20.8% (8,386)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (52.9% Drive to work)</td>
<td>= 922 People Driving Downtown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (24% use Public Transit)</td>
<td>= 419 Busing Downtown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Squirrel Hill North</strong></td>
<td>= 1,267 people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor Force Working Downtown = 20.8% (6,092)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (49.9% Drive to work)</td>
<td>= 632 People Driving Downtown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (9.8% use Public Transit)</td>
<td>= 124 Busing Downtown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Highland Park</strong></td>
<td>= 766 people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor Force Working Downtown = 20.8% (3,684)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (66.9% Drive to work)</td>
<td>= 512 People Driving Downtown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (22.1% use Public Transit)</td>
<td>= 170 Busing Downtown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>East Liberty</strong></td>
<td>= 688 people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor Force Working Downtown = 20.8% (3,307)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (40.6% Drive to work)</td>
<td>= 279 People Driving Downtown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (44.1% use Public Transit)</td>
<td>= 303 Busing Downtown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Morningside</strong></td>
<td>= 388 people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor Force Working Downtown = 20.8% (1,866)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (75.3% Drive to work)</td>
<td>= 292 People Driving Downtown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (16.7% use Public Transit)</td>
<td>= 65 Busing Downtown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Friendship</strong></td>
<td>= 237 people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor Force Working Downtown = 20.8% (1,139)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (38.2% Drive to work)</td>
<td>= 91 People Driving Downtown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People (43.6% use Public Transit)</td>
<td>= 103 Busing Downtown</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total People Driving Downtown from Area
= 3,031 people

Busing Downtown from Area
= 1,184 people

Space provided for Park and Ride
= 300 spaces
or 9.9% of the people driving into Downtown from nearby East Liberty

Public transit users then tells us an approximate number of people per neighborhood driving downtown. Summing that number from each neighborhood gives 3,031 people, which represents the potential number of park-and-ride users for the East Liberty Station. If 300 of those people, or 9.9%, decide to save an average of $35.43 to $102.27 by not parking on the North/South Sides or the Golden Triangle, by leasing a monthly space on our facility, then the number of spaces set aside for park-and-ride would be filled. As noted earlier, an assumption was made that all 134,000 people lived in Allegheny County. If we assume instead that there is a sizeable Downtown work force (e.g. 50%) that comes from outside the Allegheny County, then the park-and-ride facility must capture 19.8% of those taking automobiles into Downtown from around East Liberty. This capture percentage is still likely.

The Farmer's Market
Currently, there is a farmer’s market in East Liberty that is open only on Saturdays. This market, which houses seven different vendors, sells baked goods, produce, and meat. It has three main problems. First, it has extremely limited operating times, being open only on Saturdays until noon which makes the Strip District or a supermarket the alternatives at all other times. The second limitation is space, sometimes customers must call-in orders ahead of time for pick up. Thirdly, the farmer’s market is currently located on a side street; its visibility to nonresidents is limited.

Besides these problems, residents have other problems shopping for food locally. The nearest Giant Eagle supermarket (at Shady Hill) is flanked by high traffic volume roads, which make it difficult for pedestrians to access. According to the Giant Eagle manager, some customers without automobiles resort to taking “jitney cabs” (unlicensed cabs) to reach the supermarket. Another problem with this supermarket is its community involvement; it is limited to standardized community support programs.

The proposed farmer’s market at the East Liberty Station would correct these problems. It would be open at regular business hours, feature 23,000 square feet of space, and have high visibility for the commuters that enter and exit at the station as well as for people passing by outside on Penn Avenue. Space and visibility may be provided for Park and Ride.
improved even more when large scale, outdoor markets are held during certain times of the year in the proposed square across Penn Avenue. For the residents, our farmer's market means easy access by foot or car (spaces have been set aside in the parking garage for these shoppers specifically) as well as the creation of a certain number of jobs. The existing food distribution lines would be expanded upon with the farmers/food producers being suppliers only and local residents being the day-to-day vendors. This would enable the farmer's market to operate daily instead of weekly as well as provide local residents with jobs. Finally, the farmer's market would meet the demand for specialty foods. In a survey done on consumer shopping patterns in the area, 51% said they purchased specialty food items such as baked goods, meat, and fish at stores other than supermarkets.¹

**The Transit Center**

East Liberty Station's transit center component is composed of the service areas, the public areas, as well as the commuter oriented retail stores. Without this component, a very vital interface for bringing nonresident commuters into East Liberty as well as an element for helping small local businesses develop would be missing.

The retail shops, as outlined earlier in the program, are geared towards the commuter. They include an espresso bar, convenience store, a newsstand, a dry cleaner, takeout food, and a video store. Rent for these spaces would be competitively priced with those on Penn and Highland Avenues. Compared with the competition, these spaces are new and offers the advantage of high volume foot traffic passing by it. Some of these stores could be satellite branches of a larger business. For example, since many dry cleaners do their work off-site already and function mainly as a receive and return point, the one located in the station could be part of a larger dry cleaning network. Other retail space as well as the offices would be an ideal place for small, local start-up businesses because of the new facilities, the high visibility, shared resources, and the relatively small rental spaces (and thus low to moderate rent).

**Financial Feasibility**

The financing of the new East Liberty Station will take a split approach. The reason behind this is the need for different grants in order for the project to be economically feasible. The parking garage will be funded under one approach and the farmer's market and transit center under another.

The parking garage will operate as a nonprofit facility. This is to avoid the City of Pittsburgh's steep parking taxes (26% of revenues) as well as to keep it competitive with the parking lots or garages in the Golden Triangle and the North/South Sides. The goal of this whole project is to bring people into the commercial core of East Liberty and thus it is essential to minimize costs here for commuters. This section will be funded by the Intermodal Surface Transportation Efficiency Act.

The farmer's market and the transit centers is capable of running as a for-profit facility. In addition, because it will create local jobs during operation, it is eligible for funding from the Community Development Block Grant.

**Funding the Parking Garage**

The goal of the Intermodal Surface Transportation Efficiency Act (ISTEA) is to a national system that is "economically efficient, environmentally sound, provides the foundation for the nation to compete in the global economy and will move people and goods in an energy efficient manner." Within this is a block grant type program, the Surface Transportation Program (STP), that can provide funds for the parking garage. Our station is eligible for the project since it provides parking on the fringe of a commercial business district. In addition, space will be set aside in the garage for bicycles which is considered a Transportation Enhancement Activity under the program. The funding from this program is required to be used on the capital portion of projects (i.e. construction costs and not operating costs).

Further helping the funding of the parking garage will be the low interest rates available for nonprofit projects as well as revenues from the top level drive-in theatre which will cover a large portion of the operating expenses. As mentioned earlier, 300 spaces will be set aside for park-and-ride use. The remaining spaces will be

¹ East Liberty Revitalization Strategy (Pg 10, December 1996)
allocated as follows: 100 spaces leased to the megastore proposed for Ellsworth Ave, 75 spaces leased to the proposed manufacturing facility on Penn Avenue (which would then be used by the new retail stores around the factory after 5pm and on weekends), 50 spaces for the new farmer’s market, and 25 non-leased spaces for general use. The point of the leased spaces is to develop links to and help facilitate the growth of new businesses as well as a way to help guarantee minimal vacancy. Further programs with local businesses and institutions could be implemented during the weekends when park-and-ride users are low.

Table 3 is a breakdown of the financing and also indicates the amount a park-and-ride user pays per month.

Financing the Farmer’s Market and the Transit Center

The Community Development Block Grant provides money to projects that create jobs for low and moderate income people in a depressed area. The farmer’s market and the transit center will create 17 jobs for local residents. (10 in office or retail, 4 in security, and 3 in maintenance). To make the project feasible, we need the grant to handle 10% of the development costs. As seen at the bottom of Table 4, on the next page, there will be a net revenue of $79,067 annually. This figure assumes a very conservative 25% vacancy for the retail/office areas of the transit center with the low rent of $8/sf. The figures used for the farmer’s market are likewise conservative, using a 40% occupancy and a low rent of $5/sf. The numbers thus show the farmer’s market and transit center sections of the project to be economically feasible as well.

Conclusion

This report indicates that not only does the proposed East Liberty Station have a market, it is also financially feasible as well. The key approach that we have taken in the conceptualizing and design of this project is to first build on what exists (the express busway and local bus route infrastructure, the high visibility corner location, a large supply of local entrepreneurs looking for opportunity, and a formerly vibrant commercial core). Then we have suggested an armature for change (image, economic activity) to take place.
A survey of East Liberty shoppers of changes they would like to see in the commercial core resulted in the following ranking of changes: better security, more public spaces, more specialty stores, more entertainment and restaurants, more parking, free parking, shuttle buses, and evening business hours. Our project has either met many of these demands or facilitated those demands to be met: the new East Liberty Station will provide an active and secure entry into the neighborhood, there will be public space added in the form of a square across from the station, specialty stores such as a farmer's market has been added, for entertainment and restaurants, the station has included an espresso cafe and a drive-in theatre, and more parking space (which is also secure) has been provided.

In concept, the new East Liberty Station connects the heart of the neighborhood's commercial core with new blood and strives to help that heart beat as it did in its golden era.

---

Table 4: Farmer’s Market and Transit Center Financing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Development Costs</td>
<td>$6,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(includes construction, equipment, contingencies, architectural &amp; engineering fees, and surveys)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10% CDBG Funding</td>
<td>$60,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Development Costs after Funding</td>
<td>$5,400,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Debt Service</td>
<td>$645,933 per year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(20 years at the comm. rate of 10.28%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operations &amp; Management</td>
<td>$190,000 per year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(based on the 9th and Penn Garages)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security</td>
<td>$210,000 per year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(based on the 9th and Penn Garages)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Expenses</td>
<td>$1,045,933 per year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office / Retail Rent Revenue</td>
<td>$504,000 per year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(assuming 75% occupancy of rentable space and $8/sf rent)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farmer’s Market Rent Revenue</td>
<td>$621,000 per year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(assuming 60% occupancy of rentable space and $5/sf rent)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Revenue</td>
<td>$1,125,000 per year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Net Revenue</td>
<td>$79,067 per year</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

1East Liberty Revitalization Strategy
(Pg 10, December 1996)
Pittsburgh's total homeware store

by Marc Aragon, architect & Joshua Wisch, policy analyst.

at the urban lab, Carnegie Mellon University, May 1997.
Introduction

East Liberty's role in the economics and social makeup of Pittsburgh and the tri-state area comprising southwestern Pennsylvania, Ohio, and West Virginia has changed drastically over the past 40 years.

East Liberty was once a vibrant community and an economic and political force to be reckoned with. Its streets were lined with shops, cinemas, and retail stores that catered to Pittsburgh's most wealthy. Cable cars rumbled along Penn Avenue, past cobblestone streets lined with dark-colored Fords and Chryslers. Steel was an industry in its heyday.

Indeed, many of Pittsburgh's steel industry magnates held property in the suburb, far enough away from the thick, malignant, smoke their industry pumped into the air. Their homes were grand and exquisitely detailed. They were built of brick, with fine rugs over hardwood floors on the inside and with wrought-iron fences around generous plots on the outside.

It is primarily this tax base and disposable income that made East Liberty an economic center for Pittsburgh and the tri-state region.

With the times, East Liberty changed.

The steel industry died, the population grew, the wealthy moved further into the suburbs; East Liberty's economic power and vitality declined steadily from the 60s to where it is today.

Today, East Liberty is in a state of economic depression. Since the 1970s, two-thirds of its businesses have gone out of business or moved to other parts of Pittsburgh.

Based on an extensive analysis of East Liberty covered in Volume 1 of this report, it was determined that East Liberty suffered from its disconnection with its neighbors.

The disconnection is due mostly to the East Busway, a strip of sunken rail lines and bus road that forms the border between East Liberty and Shadyside.

Our project, e.e. homestuff's, will attempt to reconnect Shadyside and East Liberty, physically, psychologically, and economically while providing a regional attraction with its one-of-a-kind homeware complex.

Basement Floor Plan

The above drawing illustrates the plan of e.e. homestuff's basement. It provides for 82 parking spaces and a loading dock which serves the western end of the complex.
The first floor includes floor space for demo areas, an atrium and food court, seminar rooms, food vendors, apparel and homewares.

It is connected by a bridge to Motor Square Garden. A second bridge connects it to a park and to Lehigh Street in Shadyside.
The second floor includes floor space for homewares as well as space for a realtor's office and a clinic, two types of businesses identified as lacking in East Liberty.
The site plan at right shows how e.e. homestuff's building geometries and mass are derived from its placement in the urban context. Its placement reinforces setback depths, cornice lines, contextual architectural languages, and building masses.
Design Proposals

Elevations

spahr elevation

highland elevation

greenbriar elevation

penn circle south elevation

section a-a
1"=6'
The sketch at left shows the form of the building and its orientation on the site. It also provides information about the exterior spaces and how they relate to their environment.
The sketch at right illustrates the parts of the building that the previous sketch missed. It shows the public sculpture and fountain that would be located at the corner of the site and it illustrates the second floor truss bridge that connects the building to the Houston Street Parking garage.
Introduction
For many years, East Liberty was seen as a place of vast opportunity. It had an energetic and bustling community, and a great deal of local culture. To hear great jazz or shop in fashionable stores, East Liberty was the place to go. In recent years, however, this image has unfortunately faded. Too many people feel that East Liberty is unsafe, lacks strong commercial ability, and has no culture. This is due to many events, including unsuccessful urban redevelopment attempts dating back to the 1950's. The Wessel-Lewis studio, a joint venture between the HJ Heinz III School of Public Policy at Carnegie Mellon University, and Carnegie Mellon's Architecture Department, has spent the last year devising a new and exciting urban design for East Liberty.

Overall Business Opportunity
We have researched business opportunities in East Liberty through interviews, library research, and research aided by Pittsburgh development associations.

We conducted interviews in East Liberty in the Fall to survey what people in the area thought would be good commercial ideas. We interviewed merchants, customers, pedestrians, and local business, spiritual, and political leaders. The ideas you see next are the results of these informal interviews in combination with other research.

This other research ranged from examinations of consumer real estate forecasts published by Grubb and Ellis, to research into the 1990 Census concerning population, finances, housing, and more.

Project Space
EE Homestuff's is a newly constructed building near Motor Square Garden. The building will sit where the Yellow Cab Company and a small nearby car wash currently reside. The overall building size will be 186,062 square feet. The first floor will house 65,600 square feet of retail space. The second floor will have 26,700 square feet of retail space, and an additional 10,000 square feet devoted to office space. The first floor includes a double height atrium with a 22,038 square foot food court.

The project is located at the corner of Highland Avenue and Penn Circle South in East Liberty. It encompasses land area that extends across the busway and into Shadyside. It is bordered on the north by Penn Circle South (Center Avenue), on the East by Highland Avenue, on the West by a new extension of Spahr Street and on the south by a new street connecting the corner of Ellsworth and Spahr perpendicularly to Highland Avenue. Ravenna Street has been demolished from Ellsworth to Highland and parklands planted in its place.

The suggestion we have for the retail stores and offices will be covered later in the report. The remaining 60,800 square feet of the building will be used for stock rooms, parking (82 spaces in the basement in addition to 150 spaces for this building in an adjacent garage), bathrooms, and circulation space.

In the future, there could be a possible extension of EE Homestuff's to the old Pittsburgh Auto Radiator Supply Company, which would supply approximately an extra 30,000 square feet of space, but for now, this is not an option which we are pursuing.

This part of the design focuses on the Ellsworth East portion of East Liberty. The point of this project area is to provide renewed opportunity for East Liberty and one of its close neighbors, Shadyside. The link between these two communities has gone unused for too long. There is a chance to create a vital bridge between these two areas, and our work is going to help build that bridge.

We propose a physical and psychological reunion of East Liberty and Shadyside. We will start with the physical reunion, because creating a physical link will help speed up the renewal of a psychological link between the two. Our project area is a natural connector and can rejuvenate the entire area, with the assistance of the other pieces of the Wessel-Lewis studio.

We propose a network which will include new retail businesses, new office space, and new roads to help renew East Liberty, reinvigorate Shadyside, and empower the local region. We propose EE Homestuff's.
According to interviews and library research which cross-referenced East Liberty demographics with similar situations across the United States, the types of businesses that could work well in East Liberty include: food, housing, transportation, apparel, and health care.

The food markets that could work best, according to interviews, are fast food near business areas, and soul food and ethnic food. Transportation businesses dealing with road travel were the most popular. Finally, the most desired apparel stores were African American fashion stores.

In addition to this work, we researched materials from local business directories to see what types of businesses are currently the most prominent in East Liberty. The most popular businesses that we found were: Individual and Family Services, Motor Vehicle Supplies and Part, Medical Doctors Offices, Real Estate Offices, Residential Care, Specialty Outpatient Clinics, and Repair Services. These could be grouped into the larger categories: Health Care, Transportation, Housing, and Repair Services. This shows a good match up between what is currently happening in East Liberty and what people would like to see.

Justification for Construction of this Site

There are many residential areas within walking distance of the proposed site for EE Homestuff’s. Currently these people have to get in their cars and travel to one of the local malls to meet their shopping needs. If they want to go to a Brookstone or a Border’s Book Shop or some other specialty shop, they still have to travel, for that is not what we are providing. With EE Homestuff’s, we are making people’s lives easier. We are putting in their backyard, all the resources they would need to live a normal week. We are providing them with everything from kitchenwares to electronics, from reality advice to medical attention. The wonderful thing is that it is in their own neighborhood, or within a five minute walk or a three mile drive for surrounding neighborhoods. No longer will people have to go far away to receive the services they deserve at home.

If we build it, they will come. People do not have much time, and the more of it they can save, the better. We have researched the needs of the community, found out what they are, and placed them directly in front of them. EE Homestuff’s can be easily reached by foot, car, or bus.

It will bring in local dollars and provide them as well. People shopping at Shadyside have only a five minute walk to the end of Ellsworth Avenue.

The justification for EE Homestuff’s is the need for services such as these in East Liberty and nearby areas. Placing EE Homestuff’s at Ellsworth East will make it easier for people to obtain these services. People will save time by having convenience and quality in their area. EE Homestuff’s is the connector that the local area needs between Shadyside and East Liberty.

During our initial project discussions, we arrived at eleven main points that we wanted our revitalization plans to address. EE Homestuff’s addresses several of these:

-Heart in the Core: Our project is focused in the very core of East Liberty, and we help to provide a renewed economic heartbeat for the region. We will be revitalizing a fundamental part of the area through commercial and economic development, once again providing the necessary flow of cash and capital to sustain the heart in the core.

-Ring Road as a Barrier: Most of our development is located in the immediate vicinity of the Ring Road. Part of our work is bridging that gap and connecting the community through the Ring Road.

-Busway as a Barrier / Connector: As with the Ring Road, our project is located directly adjacent to the Busway, and therefore incorporates it into our designs. EE Homestuff’s will be a major attraction for people coming in on the busway.
-Residential Ownership: Our work will not result in any residential ownership in the sense of people in the area actually holding the mortgages to the new buildings. There is, however, the chance for people to take a real feeling of ownership in the area and make it their own. This is especially true because of the help we will need in building EE Homestuff's and then keeping it running.

-Education: We do not have schools or community colleges in our plans. However, EE Homestuff's would provide kids with a place to go after school. It would be a wonderful location for parents to meet and pick up their children after work. Additionally, for tired students attending the community college in our revitalization plans, EE Homestuff’s is a great place to go and unwind after a hard day of studying.

-Job Training: We integrate the job training other people are planning on doing by providing those people with jobs in rebuilding this section of East Liberty. EE Homestuff’s will be a major source of employment for the local region.

-Economic Opportunity: Our plans are replete with economic opportunity. Once the building is erected and the businesses start up, there will be many job opportunities in the area. This could also attract people from outside the immediate area and bring more funds into East Liberty.

-Regional Attraction: We plan to focus this on the local community, not the region. However, we are expecting that word will spread about the revitalization and about EE Homestuff’s and that our focus will expand. This is especially true since our project is on the busway.

-Secure Public Spaces: Our work should provide many secure public spaces. From the shopping areas inside our building to the small, enclosed public parks in front of EE Homestuff’s, there will be many places for people to safely congregate and enjoy the community.

We have also designed the area in such a way as to eliminate as many as possible physical conditions which attract vagrancy and dangerous situations as possible.

-Pride: This development of buildings and businesses could do a great deal of good for the self image and pride of East Liberty. We have created realistic, exciting, practical commercial opportunities for the people of the region.

These new plans, with community support and approval, could do wonders for the image of East Liberty.

While East Liberty is a very large part of our primary market, it is by no means the only part of our market. We do expect a large number of people within walking distance to come to EE Homestuff’s, but if that were all we are expecting, then our project would quickly become untenable. Therefore, we are focusing our efforts on a larger overall primary market. The Urban Redevelopment Authority (URA) and East Liberty Development Incorporated (ELDI) usually focus on a three mile radius when constructing any new development. Therefore, we are looking at an area around East Liberty stretching from Middle Hill in the West to the East Hills in the East, and from Greenfield in the South to Stanton Heights in the North.

The complete listing of neighborhoods we are including in this primary market can be found in the appendix. For this section, however, we will give some information on income and population of this region.

The average per capita income throughout this region is a little under $13,000 per year. The total population in this primary market area is well over 200,000 persons. By multiplying this raw income figure by population, we have generated a local primary market worth over $2.5 billion. In order to account for population between neighborhoods, we also took a weighted income and multiplied this by population to generate an income base that will be the primary support for EE Homestuff’s. This income base is worth over $1.1 billion per year. We are confident that with this kind of support in just the primary market (between $1 billion and $2.5 billion), EE Homestuff’s will be a viable piece of the local market.

The complete listing of neighborhoods we are including in this primary market can be found in the appendix. For this section, however, we will give some information on income and population of this region.

The average per capita income throughout this region is a little under $13,000 per year. The total population in this primary market area is well over 200,000 persons. By multiplying this raw income figure by population, we have generated a local primary market worth over $2.5 billion. In order to account for population between neighborhoods, we also took a weighted income and multiplied this by population to generate an income base that will be the primary support for EE Homestuff’s. This income base is worth over $1.1 billion per year. We are confident that with this kind of support in just the primary market (between $1 billion and $2.5 billion), EE Homestuff’s will be a viable piece of the local market.
In addition to this, we do expect that over time EE Homestuff’s will begin to attract people throughout the Pittsburgh region, and that is our secondary market. Bringing people in from the South Hills, North Hills, and other areas will substantially increase our viability and our expansion options in the coming years.

**Competition and Cooperation**

Two of the major current “competitors” in our area are Shadyside (specifically Walnut Street) and the Waterworks in Aspinwall. We put competitors in quotes, because they do not have to be competitors. We feel that EE Homestuff’s can help bring people to the region and be mutually beneficial for all parties. Creating EE Homestuff’s in the spirit of competition will only hurt everyone involved.

However, we do realize that to initially generate an interest in our building, we need to address some of the draws of Walnut Street and Waterworks currently over East Liberty.

In Shadyside, the streets are all straight. It is easy to walk around and shop without getting confused. Currently in East Liberty, the streets are not straight. Shopping there is not as simple as it is on Walnut Street. With EE Homestuff’s, however, we are creating an easily accessible, user friendly shopping atmosphere.

At Waterworks, people can shop inside and in comfort no matter what the season. In EE Homestuff’s this will also be true. We will be able to meet peoples’ needs for all types of items and services without ever forcing them to go out into the cold.

Finally, Waterworks and Shadyside both have merchant cooperation in common. These areas both appear to have a strong amount of coordination going on between the merchants. Part of our plan with this overall revitalization project is to help create an overall plan for East Liberty. For EE Homestuff’s, this means cooperation among new and existing merchants. From the beginning, we plan on making this an atmosphere of mutual help, not threatening and competitive moves. Through this atmosphere, we hope to be able to help generate interest in the whole East End of Pittsburgh.
What Went Wrong in the Past and Why it Will Not Again

We understand that there might be some debate about the wisdom of placing a new commercial development in East Liberty after some past failures. It is true that the Sears building is now empty and that Motor Square Garden shifted from retail to AAA. We have reasons to believe, however, that we have addressed and counteracted some of the factors that contributed to the failures of past projects.

One big problem is Penn Avenue. According to the URA, one of the main problems with Motor Square Garden was that Penn Avenue only goes one way. In the design for EE Homestuff's, we have modified Penn Avenue so that it now allows for two way traffic. This will make it much easier to access and will not be such a deterrent for people considering shopping in the area.

Overall customer traffic was another reason for the failure of Motor Square Garden. The widening of Penn to allow for two way vehicular traffic will help this, but it will not do everything. It was also difficult to get across the railroad tracks from Shadyside to East Liberty. EE Homestuff’s, however, bridges this gap by physically linking Shadyside to East Liberty. We have bridged the busway, including the rail lines, in two places. Spahr Street has been extended across the busway to hook up with Penn Circle South (Center Avenue). A pedestrian bridge is parallel to the Spahr extension and equidistant from it and Highland Avenue. This will significantly increase pedestrian traffic as well as vehicular traffic. This increased accessibility to cars and pedestrians is not even accounting for our position directly next to the busway, which should also bring people in from around the area. Due to our design, customer traffic will not be a problem with EE Homestuff’s, and that was one of the major problems in the past.
Another problem, as it was with Sears (according to the URA) is that people are going to places like Waterworks and not shopping in East Liberty. As we mentioned before, one of the main advantages of Waterworks is that it is like a mall. It is clean, safe, comfortable year round, and offers a variety of goods. At EE Homestuff’s we have all these qualities and more. It will have the essentials such as being clean and safe. Additionally, it will offer many different retail stores and a convenient and attractive food court. It will also offer seminar rooms to learn how to use new purchases, which is a new and innovative idea not to be seen in the other regional shopping areas. Finally, in addition to offering goods, we offer services that people in the region need. Instead of having to split up their day between shopping in one area and office visits somewhere else, people can have all of their needs served in one convenient location.

Indeed, there is already new housing construction occurring that will help create a sturdier base for our commercial enterprise. As part of the comprehensive East Liberty revitalization effort, one of our team members is building 700 new housing units at the Friendship border, and another 300 units on the Shadyside border. This is a $105.6 million project, and will help us keep the horse before the cart.

EE Homestuff’s addresses all of the failures of the past, confronts them, solves them, and then goes further. Neighborhoods are not self-contained economic systems. Therefore, in order to keep some people shopping in one neighborhood while still attracting new people to come there, we have to make sure that there is a reason people will want to come there. We have done this. Problems with housing, customer traffic, safety and accessibility, and many others of the past have all been examined and solved with innovative, common sense ideas to help make EE Homestuff’s a centerpiece of East Liberty revitalization. This will help to revitalize East Liberty and the East End of Pittsburgh.

Office Space
EE Homestuff’s will bring new office space to East Liberty. Specifically, we are gearing our offices towards doctors and realtors. The concept is to have a general clinic in the building, and a realtor that can deal with houses and housing units that are both for sale, and for rent. The general clinic will house both medial offices and counseling offices.

The counseling offices will be for both psychological counseling and marriage/family counseling.

The entire office space market in Pittsburgh is divided into three separate categories by Grubb and Ellis: suburban, fringe, and Central Business District. Overall, this amounts to about 38,232,873 square feet of rentable office space and approximately 5,996,364 square feet of available office space. Of this, 13,567,836 square feet of the rentable space is in the suburban market and 2,047,536 square feet of the available space is in the suburban market. The East End of Pittsburgh is included among the suburban market, along with four other submarkets: Oakland, North, Parkway West, and the South Hills.
During 1996, according to Grubb and Ellis, the suburban markets finished stronger than expected. There was competition between “build to suit” market activity with existing market space, and both proved resilient. According to Grubb and Ellis, office space in the suburban markets has been filling up much faster than expected, and available supply has now decreased to such a point so as to make finding space difficult for tenants. This is the perfect atmosphere in which to construct a small pocket of office space in EE Homestuff’s.

Rents for office space in the suburban market vary from about $13 per square foot to almost $17 per square foot. The weighted average asking rates for office space in the East End of Pittsburgh is currently $13.89 per square foot. Due to the fact that vacancy rates are declining, and lease rates are climbing, we expect that leasing out 10,000 square feet of office space in EE Homestuff’s will not be much of a problem.

EE Homestuff’s has 10,000 square feet of office space. We suggest that this be divided amongst one general clinic and one realty agency. Using the rent estimate of $13.89 per square foot per year, we calculate revenues of $138,900 per year from this space. Figuring in the vacancy rate of 24% for this section of Pittsburgh, this takes our figure down to revenues of $105,200 per year or $8,797 per month. The relevance of these figures will be covered later when we detail the funding process for the building.

**Retail Space**

I could not find as much information about current retail space in East Liberty as I could find about office space, but there is enough to estimate some of the more important figures. According to the Commercial Real Estate Guide in a recent edition of the Pittsburgh Business Times, there are approximately 24 buildings in the East End for sale or lease.
Their rents range from $3 per square foot to $25 per square foot. The building closest in scope to ours is the East Liberty Station on Penn Avenue at roughly 90,000 square feet. The realtor for this is asking for $10 per square foot. Using this and an average of the other lease prices as a benchmark, I have decided on a figure of $11 per square foot per year for the leasing rates for retail space in EE Homestuff's. With a total of 114,338 square feet of retail space, this would provide revenues of $1,257,718 per year or $104,809 per month from our retailers.

Figuring in the vacancy rate of 4% for retail space in Pittsburgh, this takes our figure down to revenues of $1,207,409 per year or $100,616 per month. The relevance of these figures will be covered later when we detail the funding process for the building. Based on interviews with merchants and local shoppers, and on a report from the Urban Redevelopment Authority (URA) describing desired uses of the old Sears building, we have arrived at several suggestions for the types of retail stores to place in the new building.

The URA survey found that 22% to 28% of people in the area would like to see a store with products like Kmart or Wal Mart, 22% would like a clothing store, and 15% would like a hardware store. Other recommendations listed are a product of our own surveys and ideas. Our plan would be to put on the first floor: one electronics store, one appliance store, one hardware store, and one African American apparel fashion store.

The seminar rooms listed in the floor plans for the building would be for the education of the consumers. Here they can learn how to use their new electronics and hardware purchases.

The auditorium can also be used for this purpose as well as many others. On the second floor of EE Homestuff's, we suggest: one linen and towel store (would also have bedsheets, rugs, etc.), one kitchenware store, and one furniture store. The food court would be two stories tall.

According to the 1996 Grubb and Ellis Real Estate Forecast, the suburban retail market is on the move.

Spring, 1997.
Indeed, the Central Business District and the Fringe markets are currently each taking a back seat to the development occurring in the suburban markets. In particular, there is a great deal of growth occurring in the East. Currently, a fair bit of this is centered around Monroeville, but the growth is good for the entire East region. With current average asking rates of close to $14 in that area according to Grubb and Ellis, the lease rates we are asking for of $11 at EE Homestuff’s will be competitive with other local markets.

FUNDING

Development Costs

When calculating these costs, we are keeping in mind that this project will not take up a sufficiently large part of the market to alter overall prices or rents.

The total square footage of EE Homestuff’s is 186,062 square feet. For the type of structure we are building, for its size and type of uses, and for the materials we will need, we have estimated the cost of construction at $125 per square foot. This means that actual construction will cost $23,257,750. Other development costs are soft costs.

The soft costs involved are: architects’ fees, legal fees, overhead costs, permits, miscellaneous fees, financing fees and insurance.

Architect fees generally range from 6% to 11% of the cost of construction. They are rarely more than 11%. Due to the high tech facade of this atrium, we have estimated the architect fees to be 9% of the cost of construction. This would put them at $2,093,198.

The legal fees will be approximately $10,000.

The overhead costs are 3% of the hard costs plus the architects fees. This brings them to $2,790,930.

The permits will cost $.25 per square foot of the building. At 186,062 square feet, this comes to $46,515.

The miscellaneous fees will be another $10,000.

Site preparation and landscaping will each cost $3 per square foot. This is $1,116,372.

Financing fees equal 3% of the combined hard and soft costs. This combination is $29,557,340 so the financing fees will be about $886,720.

Operating Costs

The operating costs for EE Homestuffs include: utilities, janitor, maintenance, security, professional fees, management fees, leasing fees, and insurance. All the calculations are done per annum, and will be broken down into monthly figures at the end.

Utilities will be paid for by the tenants of the building, as is standard procedure.

The professional fees are $48 per gross square foot or $89,309.

The management fees are 2% of the effective gross revenues. These are the revenues from leasing the office space and retail space, minus vacancy rates for each. With effective gross revenues of $1,283,817, this comes to management fees of $25,676.

The leasing fees are structured in the same manner as the management fees, so they too are $25,676.

Insurance costs $.05 per gross square foot, so it is $9,303.

Leasing spots in the nearby parking garage will cost $125 per spot per month. At 150 spots, this will cost $225,000 per year.

The per annum operating costs for this building then come to $644,753 per year or $53,729 per month.

Construction Loan and Permanent Loans

According to a local bank, the prime interest rate on a project such as this is 9.50% (+/- 1.8%).
**Financing**

We have a principal of $30,444,060. Our revenues from leasing are $109,413 per month and operating expenses are $53,729. This leaves income of $55,684 to be used for debt service.

Considering a 9.5% interest on the construction and permanent loan, with a 20 year loan, we can calculate the amounts of loans and grants that we will require to complete EE Homestuff’s. We will need loans in the amount of $30,330,414 for the entire 20 year period, which will be equal to $1,516,520 per year. In addition, we will need some more money in grants. This will add up to $17,079,900 in grants for the entire 20 year period. We plan to apply for these grants through Housing and Urban Development (HUD), the Heinz Foundation, and other similar agencies interested in urban development and revitalization. Other possible sources of funding include the Urban Redevelopment Authority and the City of Pittsburgh.

We realize that this funding scheme is difficult. Under this plan, we will be making no more than zero dollars, and it will still be difficult to get financing for a loan of this magnitude and a grant worth $17 million. We are confident, however, that with a project of this importance and with so many possible future benefits, that we will be able to get the backing and support which we need. With some more time and effort, we are confident that we could work out the financing so as to turn a profit. The most important thing now is that we have created a viable, attractive, exciting opportunity for the region. We have done this in conjunction with many other projects to create a real chance for revitalization. The rest will follow.
Conclusion

East Liberty needs this type of space. Currently in the area, retailers are struggling to compete with nearby malls, and even with nearby shopping areas such as Oakland, Shadyside, and Squirrel Hill. There is a difficulty in bringing local residents to shop in East Liberty, much less trying to bring in people from the rest of the region. To solve this type of problem what is needed is a good hard shot in the arm, not a slow and tedious renewal. This type of exciting and ambitious project is just that shot in the arm. It provides, within two years a brand new building, with completely new stores, convenient and necessary medical care and a place to go to work out housing loans and apartment rents. It provides thousands of new jobs within a very brief span of time. To complete EE Homestuff’s and keep it running, we will need: hundreds of construction workers, office assistance, clerks for every retail store, service people for the offices, security guards, maintenance workers, cleaning staff, lawyers, doctors, nurses, realtors, and the list continues. This will provide incredible economic opportunity for the people of East Liberty and the surrounding areas.

In conjunction with the other pieces of our East Liberty revitalization, we are creating a broad based network to breathe renewed life into the area. People being trained at the community college can work at our “urban mall”. The community center can be a place for people to go and meet before and after they spend time at our building. The parking lot providing hundreds of spaces gives commuters a convenient place to put their cars and spend time at all of the new local opportunities. The new hotel in the area will provide a place to stay for dignitaries visiting the consulate, and they can then spend some of their free time shopping close by in comfort and safety. All of these projects will work to make East Liberty a new and renewed hub of activity in the Pittsburgh area.

In coordination with Shadyside, we can create cooperation instead of competition. EE Homestuff’s would at first sight seem to be a direct competitor with Shadyside and the Walnut Street culture. However, since our building will actually physically link East Liberty to Shadyside, as it should be, we instead provide opportunity and cooperation.

Spring, 1997.
People can shop at East Liberty and then move to Shadyside to continue a fun day of discovery and surprises as they see the revitalization in action.

East Liberty at one time was perceived as one of the most vital areas of Pittsburgh. We believe that this never changed but that peoples perceptions became clouded. Our revitalization will lift the dust from the eyes of the people of Pittsburgh and show them that East Liberty has a true heart in the core. It has a rich tradition of culture, fashion, music, and community, and it is time that these were brought back to the forefront.

Together with our other revitalization plans, EE Homestuff’s will do this.
Design Proposals
EE Homestuff’s
Marc Aragon: Architecture
Joshua Wisch: Heinz School

References and Acknowledgments

1. Urban Redevelopment Authority (URA)
2. East Liberty Development Inc. (ELDI)
3. Joseph Preston, State Representative
4. Pastor Heidi at the East Liberty Presbyterian Church
5. Steven Sitrin, Manager of the Carnegie Mellon University Center
6. Graham Ivory
7. East Liberty Chamber of Commerce (ELCOC)
8. Grubb and Ellis Real Estate Forecast
9. Pittsburgh Business Times
10. Mark Wessel and David Lewis
11. Chriss Swaney, Graduate School of Industrial Administration
12. David White, Penn’s Southwest Association
13. Reference Librarians at Hunt Library and Hillman Library
14. Dunn’s Regional Business Directory

Appendix 1

Neighborhoods
Bloomfield
Friendship
Garfield
Highland Park
Homewood North
Homewood South
Homewood West
Larimer
Shadyside
Stanton Heights
Squirrel Hill North
Squirrel Hill South
Morningside
Upper Lawrenceville
Lower Lawrenceville
Central Lawrenceville
East Liberty
North Oakland
South Oakland
Central Oakland
West Oakland
Aspinwall
Wilkinsburg
Point Breeze North
Point Breeze
Lincoln L-B
Regent Square
Upper Hill
Polish Hill
Greenfield
Swisshelm Park
Middle Hill
Bedford Dwellings
Strip District
Terrace Village
East Hills
Israeli Consulate and Housing

General Overview

Objectives

The driving force behind this proposal is to incorporate the Hornbostel synagogue on Negley Avenue with the rest of the landmarks in the core of East Liberty.

Outline of Proposal

• The synagogue is renovated to accommodate an Israeli consulate.
• The existing housing projects inscribed within Penn Circle West, Rural Street and Penn and Negley Avenues is demolished and the preexisting grid of streets restored.
• Housing as outlined in the Michael Arnold Pattern Book of Housing for East Liberty is implemented
• A pedestrian corridor of parks and shopping areas connects the western extremity of Penn Avenue shopping with the Negley Avenue synagogue.
1. Penn Avenue Corridor

Penn Avenue Parklet

A small park located on the corner of Penn Avenue and Penn Circle West establishes a pedestrian corridor connecting the plaza to the commercial core of East Liberty. Sight lines to the synagogue on Negley Avenue are maintained.

Street Vendors

Space is allocated for street vendors along the narrow pedestrian alleys at the northwest and southeast entrances to the plaza. Again, sight lines to the synagogue are maintained while maintaining a healthy level of congestion.
2. Retail

Retail on the ground floor of the buildings surrounding the plaza extends the commerce along Penn Avenue into this residential area. This commercial area is primarily targeted for businesses such as clubs and restaurants that offer activity beyond Penn Avenue’s typically 9 to 5 schedule.

Pedestrian walkways along the commercial streets are protected by awnings in front of the retail spaces. These sidewalks are framed by “flying staircases” that connect the upper residential floors to the underground parking level. Sightlines to the synagogue are kept unobstructed.

Traffic on the commercial streets is two-way. Surface street parking is offered between “flying staircases” provided enough room for two parallel-parked cars.

The retail on the plaza primarily functions to provide evening commercial support to the Penn Avenue shops. The intent is to avoid direct competition with the renewed commerce in East Liberty’s core while provide area with a vitality that currently does not exist after 5 PM.
3. Residential

The three floors above the ground floor are apartments ranging from 1 to 3 bedroom units. The massing of these apartments is based on a network of rooms and terraces common in Israeli architecture. Parking for the residents, as well as users of the retail spaces is located underground. A stairwell, modelled after Israeli flying staircases, runs from the underground parking to the first floor apartments. The second and third floor of apartments are then accessed via a recessed stair tower.

In section, the apartment units step back to increase exposure to natural daylight. The varying placement of the outdoor terrace permits privacy upper levels.
4. Plaza

The plaza functions primarily to bring the public functions of the consulate from the confines of the protected structure to the people. The plaza is designed to accommodate large exhibitions, receptions, and other public gatherings. The sparing use of water and greenery is reminiscent of oases scattered throughout Israel's arid terrain. These oases, likely to be gathering places on hot days, are placed before two major buildings on the plaza: a music hall and a Jewish historical and cultural museum.
In keeping with the theme of cultural revival and landmark preservation in East Liberty, the old synagogue on Negley Avenue is renovated to support an Israeli consulate. Of utmost concern in the design of such a structure is security, with the ever-present danger of terrorism. With this in mind, primary focuses were lighting (to maintain visual control over the complex) and enclosure (to withstand impact from bomb explosion). Care was taken to alter the exterior appearance of this landmark as little as possible.